Association for the Development of Education in Africa
(ADEA)

Prospective, Stocktaking Review of Education in Africa

Draft Synthesis Document

for the

1999 Biennial Meeting

Contents

Tables

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AAU	Association of African Universities
ADEA	Association for the Development of Education in Africa
APNET	African Publishers Network
CWG	Country Working Group
DAE	Donors to African Education
ECE	Early Childhood Education
EFA	Education for All
EMIS	Education Management Information System
ERNWACA	Education Research Network for West and Central Africa
FAWE	Forum of African Women Educationalists
FSFHTT	Free State Further and Higher and Training Trust
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GER	Gross Enrollment Rate
GIS	Geographical Information System
GNP	Gross National Product
GTPE/SF	Groupe de Travail sur la Profession enseignante, section francophone
ISTARN	Informal Sector Training And Resources Network
MoE	Ministry of Education
NESIS	National Education Statistical Information Systems
NFE	Non-formal Education
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NIED	National Institute Educational Development
para	paragraph
PUCHE	Potchefstroom University for Christian Higher Education
SPESSA	Statistical Package for Education in Sub-Saharan Africa
SSA	Sub-Saharan Africa
TLS	Telematics Learning System
TMS	Teaching Management and Support
UCT	University of Cape Town
UND	University of Natal
UNIFY	University Foundation Year
UNIN	University of the North
UPE	Universal Primary Education
USHEPiA	University Science, Humanities and Engineering Partnerships in Africa
VTT	Vocational/technical Training
WEAC	West African Examinations Council
WFP	World Food Program
WG	Working Group
WGBLM	World Bank on Books and Learning Materials
WGES	Working Group on Education Statistics
WGNFE	Working Group on Non-formal Education
WGTP	Working Group on the Teaching Profession
WGTP/A	Working Group on the Teaching Profession, Anglophone section
WGTP/F	Working Group on the Teaching Profession, Francophone section

Acknowledgments

Executive Summary

This draft synthesis is a document in progress. It represents a *process* in progress. It is the product of the work of twenty-five country teams and seven ADEA Working Groups. It is the synthesis of case studies produced by twenty-five countries and by seven ADEA Working Groups. Most importantly, it needs to be seen as a phase and the current representation of the process that has led up to this document and to this Biennial meeting.

The overall objective of the exercise is to identify solutions, policies, approaches and practices that can be applied to the well-known and well-documented problems and constraints facing education in Africa. Our long-term goal is to develop amongst the ADEA partners — ministers, agencies, professionals and researchers — "a culture" of finding solutions and policy responses from within the African context to address the all-too-familiar issues, problems and constraints. We are convinced that within this context there exists a wealth of knowledge and experience capable of guiding innovative solutions and cost-effective policies.

Our task is double: (i) to make these solutions known and, in doing so, to deepen our effectiveness and strengthen our partnerships; and (ii) to set into motion a process (begun by the exercise detailed in this document) whereby educators and education policy-makers learn from, and make practical use of, "real" experience. Achievement of these goals requires close and rigorous analytical and critical examination of such experiences, with special attention paid to factors and elements that can be shared between countries and across different settings. It will also require diffusion and communication of these understandings between all concerned actors.

The exercise reported here is the current result of a process that began in early 1998 with the idea to update the World Bank's milestone 1988 document, *Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revitalization, and Expansion*. This idea was discussed in depth by the ADEA Steering Committee. The result is twofold:

- , a new milestone *document* that is focused on an assessment of achievements and accomplishments, as identified by African Ministries of Education and by the ADEA Working Groups; and,
- , a broad, inclusive *process* that mandated a consistently high degree of interaction and cooperation between 25 Ministries of Education, seven ADEA Working Groups, the ADEA Steering Committee, and a small technical team organized by the ADEA Secretariat.[1]

It will be useful to keep in mind that the outcomes of this exercise are both this document and the process underlying its production. It will also be useful to ask the following question: once the document is completed, should the process continue and, if so, how?

This exercise is not a diagnosis of deficits, constraints and problems. Rather, it uses existing, successful practices to provide clues, hints, and potential policy responses to the three major challenges — access, quality and capacity building — facing education in Africa.

---

[1]This was facilitated by the fact that 14 of the 25 countries communicated with the ADEA Secretariat by e-mail, including for the transmission of their proposals and draft documents.

This strategy is based on three premises: (i) that the solutions and policy responses to these challenges can and should come from within the African context; (ii) that education in Africa is alive with innovations and experimentation and should be viewed as a source of potential solutions and viable policies, and (iii) that within the African context there is a wealth of experience and analysis (including that generated by the ADEA Working Groups) capable of guiding innovative and cost-effective policies. This approach has grown out of ADEA's mandate which states that ADEA "identifies, develops and promotes creative responses to the problems of education in sub-Saharan Africa".

The process by which this exercise was conducted is an integral part of its methodology, and vice versa. The process can be characterized by the case study authors' engagement, involvement and participation — in all cases, mandated directly by their respective ministers — upon which this synthesis is based. It can also be characterized by the actors and the events that composed it.

The process that led up to this synthesis report is best understood in terms of the actors and events that gave it substance.

(a) *The actors* involved include (in chronological order of their appearance in the process):

, the ADEA Steering Committee (composed of ten education ministers and representatives of 19 agencies) which played an active role in the formulation of the Terms of Reference for this exercise and which delegated a sub-committee composed of three ministers and three agency members to monitor and participate more closely in the exercise;

, the country and Working Group teams which responded to the call for case studies and produced the reports that are the basis for this synthesis document; and,

, a small Technical Team working through the ADEA Secretariat that was closely involved with the country teams, meeting with most of them and providing feedback to them throughout the exercise.

(b) *The events* began with the Steering Committee's decision to embark on this exercise, followed by discussions and approval of the Terms of Reference. The exercise was launched in early July 1998 with an initial invitation letter sent to all Ministers of Education and followed by a reminder letter three months later. The country teams and the ADEA Working Groups went to work on their own with direct inputs and feedback from members of the technical team and from the ADEA Secretariat. As the country teams and Working Groups completed their drafts, two defining events occurred:

, national workshops. Each country team held a national workshop where its work was submitted to colleagues and concerned parties (often including their resident external financing and technical partners) for presentation and feedback; and,

, two regional seminars. Ten countries and three ADEA Working Groups participated in the Gaborone seminar for East and Southern Africa; 15 countries and seven Working Groups participated in the Cotonou seminar for Central and West Africa. These seminars included presentations of country and Working Group reports, feedback from all participants, and rich interaction between all participants. One outcome of these seminars was revised (in terms of information and analytical content) country reports which incorporated the feedback received. Several country reports were also enriched by the comparative perspective gained through their involvement in these seminars.

The next step was the drafting of this synthesis document — a perilous task at best. This was done by the technical team. The ensuing draft was circulated to the country and Working Group teams which were given the first opportunity to provide comments, corrections, modifications and feedback. The second draft went to the Steering Committee for comments. This document — still a draft — incorporates those comments. It is presented to the 1999 Biennale which, of course, is *the* defining event of the entire process.

Section 4 presents an overview and synthesis of the case studies. The 25 country case studies are as varied as they are rich. Some are more descriptive and analytical than others; and the information relating to the results of the interventions is varied in nature. The overview is, indeed, highly synthesized and attempts to bring out the essence of the contents of the case studies. It should be viewed as the bare bones of a rich corpus of material received from the countries and from the Working Groups. Such reductionism was necessary (the case studies when stacked in a pile measure about 50 cm.) in order to produce a readable, manageable, and digestible background document for the Biennial. Annexes 1 and 2 provide an overview and a bibliography of the case studies.

The following trends and lessons emerge from the case studies:

Trend	Lesson
The transition to democracy and concern for equality is common to the cases that made significant success in expanding access, improving quality and/or developing systemic capacities.	The development of education in Sub-Saharan Africa cannot be effectively pursued without paying attention to macro-political contexts. Political contexts that are most conducive to the improvement of the quality of education for all are those that endorse the "norm of equality" The importance of this norm is highlighted because even within the so-called democratic countries, certain groups — women and girls, disabled, ethnic and linguistic minorities — are denied education opportunities on account of assumed inequalities.
Political will and committed leadership have been identified as critical factors that facilitated observed achievements.	Success in education development requires just as much passion as it does substance. Innovations need highly placed champions who can garner the support of and commitment of change agents. The successful development of education requires the "buy in" of the highest political leadership. Innovations that are placed high on the national political agenda are most likely to register success.
The readiness to "develop as you go" permeates most of the cases that are managing to expand access and improve quality.	The success of innovations depends on an astute balancing of planning with implementation. A key feature of this balance is the ability not to allow planning to arrest implementation. As aptly put by one of the presenters of the Zimbabwe science report, "not everything has to be in place before you can start".
Inclusive consultation and consensus building are basic to effective education policy development and management.	Much can be attained through sharpening means of communicating with stakeholders who support education development. Communication technologies should be effectively used to carry messages to people on the ground whose support makes things happen in education.

Trend	**Lesson**
Perceived relevance and sensitivity to real and felt needs characterize most of the cases. This is demonstrated by the case studies that focus on community partnerships.	No matter how brilliant and progressive proposed policies and innovations may be, their chances of success are limited if the beneficiaries do not understand and appreciate their value added. Policy makers, therefore, need to invest time and energy in making apparent the value of proposed policies to potential beneficiaries. It does not suffice that the benefactors know that "its good for beneficiaries".
The readiness of governments to create space for alternative providers of the education service pervades all cases that focus on access.	Allowed and encouraged to exist, collective entrepreneurship for education can is a vibrant source of ideas and resources.
Community involvement is playing an increasingly prominent role in ensuring access to relevant education services. There appears to be a partial shift of the locus of action and control from the central ministries to the communities.	• Communities put their resources where their needs are. To this effect, sustainable and effective development of education will rely on the means of livelihood available to individuals and their communities. Whereas prior assistance to education went directly to governments, there may be need to explore strategies that will more directly target poor communities and even individuals. Such methods should endeavor to enable communities to provide for themselves rather than to be provided for by national governments. Otherwise the sustainability of community support for education may be threatened. • The history of community participation in education development points to the need for education development policies to be tethered to positive experiences from the ground.
The slow (but sure) progress toward decentralization of the provision, decision making powers and control of education services.	Efforts to decentralize the provision, management and control of education systems in SSA need to build on processes that are familiar, well known and, therefore, acceptable. Most likely, success will better come from decentralization processes that are allowed to evolve out of practice, needs, and of the contexts rather than out of experiences far removed from the context.
A good number of the case studies present interventions that have clearly used some form of research in their design and/or implementation.	It is tempting to suggest that the success of these interventions is, at least partially, attributable to their analytical foundations. If this is the case, additional efforts need to go towards the promotion of research and towards more intensive use of existing research.
A holistic or multi-faceted approach to addressing challenges pervades the case studies.	Developing education systems is a complex matter. No one measure can deliver the desired impact. Successful interventions are those that adopt a multi-pronged strategy.

Trend	**Lesson**
The average diploma level of teachers has tended to increase, as teachers salaries, relative to changes in national average wages, have tended to decline.	Innovative teacher recruitment strategies, coupled with extensive consultation and communication can go a long way in meeting the challenge of access. This requires recognition that government budgets cannot finance civil service teachers in a context where unemployed secondary and university graduates are looking for work.
Little information is provided on the costs of the successful cases. The case studies did not provide analyses of the cost of the interventions relative to the usual alternatives.	Financial analysis is still very weak and not integrated into the culture of education ministries. Along with the culture of critical reflection, there has to be a balanced reflection costs as well as on educational substance. It is quite difficult to recommend or to even adopt innovations if one does not know what they cost. Capacity development efforts need to pay attention to financial analysis and management
Networking is increasingly practiced among professionals working on similar issues.	Investments in the development of networks and communities of professionals working on similar issues can have high returns. These include cost-effective sharing of knowledge across the continent.
External financing and technical partners play a central role in almost all of the cases studies.	External partners have a clear role to play in the improvement of education delivery.
Analyses tend to ignore the holistic and complex aspects of education systems — e.g., designating inputs for quality that could also be seen as facilitating access.	Even as the analytical capacities of education ministries are improving, there is still room for development.
Few cases present evidence of improvement of processes as indicative of improving quality,	Inadequate attention is given to the systematic linking of education inputs to processes, and to the linking of inputs and processes to outcomes. Because of this weakness, we are not gaining the cumulative wisdom of what resources and processes are best at leveraging education developments.

The final section of the report is a reflection on the process of this exercise: from its inception, to the carrying out of the case studies, including the national and regional consultations, to this Biennial meeting. The process is summarized in ten points.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1   This is a document in-progress. Also, it represents a *process* in-progress. It is the partially ripe fruit of an exercise that recognizes that actions speak louder than words. That is why this exercise has sought out actions — work in the field, on the ground that have the potential to point the way toward solutions to the problems we know all too well. These problems, the gaps, are well documented. The data are there; many diagnoses and analyses too. As necessary as they are (and, indeed, they are), they rarely dwell on what works.

1.2   The ambition of the exercise reported here is to look for what works, with supporting evidence. This is only a starting point, the beginning of a process where all parts of the ADEA partnership intensify their focus on learning from actual experience. This means learning together, and doing so in full knowledge of the well documented diagnoses and analyses of the constraints, problems, challenges and of all that does not work. Our approach here, however, is the next logical step where we identify "treatments" for the problems that have grown out of these problems and their context.

1.3   In order to find these "treatments", ADEA went on something of a fishing expedition. For several months after the exercise was launched (in July 1998) there was not much response. Then it came, and it grew and accelerated to the current, and very rich, harvest of reports from twenty-five country teams and seven ADEA Working Groups. This Biennial meeting will determine the future of this process.

1.4   **The overall objective of the exercise**, then, is to identify solutions, policies, approaches and practices that can be applied to the well-known and well-documented problems and constraints facing education in Africa. Our long-term goal is to develop amongst the ADEA partners — ministers, agencies, professionals and researchers — a "culture" of finding solutions and policy responses from within the African context to address the all-too-familiar issues, problems and constraints. We are convinced that within this context there exists a wealth of knowledge and experience capable of guiding innovative solutions and cost-effective policies. We think that the case studies here demonstrate that.

1.5   Our task is double: (i) to make these solutions known and, in doing so, to deepen our effectiveness and strengthen our partnerships; and (ii) to set into motion a process (begun by the exercise detailed in this document) whereby educators and education policy-makers learn from, and make practical use of, "real" experience. Achievement of these goals requires close and rigorous analytical and critical examination of such experiences, with special attention paid to factors and elements that can be shared between countries and across different settings. It will also require diffusion and communication of these understandings between all concerned actors.

2. BACKGROUND and HISTORY

2.1 The exercise reported here is the current result of a process that began in early 1998 with the idea to update the World Bank's milestone 1988 document, *Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revitalization, and Expansion.* This idea was discussed in depth by the ADEA Steering Committee. The result is twofold:

•   a new milestone *document* that is focused on an assessment of achievements and accomplishments, as identified by African Ministries of Education and by the ADEA Working Groups; and,

•   a broad, inclusive *process* that mandated a consistently high degree of interaction and cooperation between 25 Ministries of Education, seven ADEA Working Groups, the ADEA Steering Committee, and a small technical team organized by the ADEA Secretariat.[2]

It will be useful to keep in mind that the outcomes of this exercise are both this document and the process underlying its production. It will also be useful to ask the following question: once the document is completed, should the process continue and, if so, how?

2.2 This exercise needs to be seen as the fruit of an eleven-year maturation process, which dates back to the publication of the 1988 World Bank Report. Based on an extensive review of education in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), the Report advised on three broad policy directions: selective expansion, with an emphasis on basic education; revitalization, with an emphasis on quality improvement; and adjustment, with an emphasis on flexibility and responsiveness. One of the specific concerns raised by the Report was the inadequate coordination of international development agencies providing technical and financial assistance to education in SSA. It was pointed out that poor coordination tended to encourage the establishment of competitive agency practices which placed high demands on MoE's management and coordination capacities. The World Bank Report recommended the establishment of a forum for information exchange between development agencies and for enhanced coordination of their efforts. In 1989, Donors to African Education (DAE) was created to serve that purpose. As the DAE evolved, it became apparent that effective coordination of agency efforts to facilitate the development of education in SSA required active participation on the part of leaders of African education systems. Thus, DAE was transformed into the Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA), an association of international development agencies and African Ministers of Education. ADEA is focusing more and more on fostering partnerships for the development of education in Africa. Indeed, the theme of ADEA's previous Biennale — held in 1997 in Dakar — was *Partnerships for capacity building and quality improvements in education in Africa.*[3]

_____

[2]This was facilitated by the fact that 14 of the 25 countries communicated with the ADEA Secretariat by e-mail, including for the transmission of their proposals and draft documents.

[3]See the two publications from that meeting:
• ADEA, *Proceedings of the ADEA Biennial Meeting, Dakar, Senegal (14-18 October 1997)*.

(continued...)

2.3   The 1988 World Bank Report identified a number of central issues that needed to be addressed if sub-Saharan Africa was to attain the universally desired goal of cost-effective, quality education for all. In order to achieve this goal, the Report recognized the need for a number of viable policies and practices, such as:

- renewed efforts to promote access, especially that of girls;
- viable and cost-effective policies for the provision of textbooks and learning materials;
- development of comprehensive and reliable statistical capacities;
- viable policies and mechanisms to support teachers;
- implementation of strategies to bring research closer to the policy processes and to promote national capabilities for education sector analysis;
- development of viable financing mechanisms for education; and
- revitalization of higher education.

These concerns gave rise to the ADEA Working Groups, each of which focuses on advocacy, capacity building and research/analysis for one such issue.

2.4   This exercise uses existing, successful practices to provide clues, hints, and potential policy responses to the three major challenges — access, quality and capacity building — facing education in Africa. This strategy is based on three premises: (i) that the solutions and policy responses to these challenges can and should come from within the African context; (ii) that education in Africa is alive with innovations and experimentation and should be viewed as a source of potential solutions and viable policies, and (iii) that within the African context there is a wealth of experience and analysis (including that generated by the ADEA Working Groups) capable of guiding innovative and cost-effective policies. This approach has grown out of ADEA's mandate which states that ADEA "identifies, develops and promotes creative responses to the problems of education in sub-Saharan Africa".

---

[3](...continued)
• ADEA, *Partnerships for Capacity Building and Quality Improvements in Education: Papers from the ADEA Biennial Meeting.* 1999.

3. PROCESS and METHODOLOGY

3.1   The process by which this exercise was conducted is an integral part of its methodology, and vice versa. The process can be characterized by the case study authors' engagement, involvement and participation — in all cases, mandated directly by their respective ministers — upon which this synthesis is based. It can also be characterized by the actors and the events that composed it (see para. 3.9 for details).

3.2   The methodology of this exercise has significant points of departure from previous reviews of education in Africa. First and foremost, it focuses on "what works", as defined and identified by concerned parties. Previous reviews of education in Africa have tended to highlight weaknesses in and challenges to education systems, while overlooking strengths and successes. Though understandable, the tendency to focus on weaknesses has made it difficult to develop knowledge of what works in education in Africa. Consequently, Africa has missed out on opportunities to learn from successful experiences and to improve upon them. The focus of this exercise is to illuminate the achievements of African education systems, unravel the dynamic processes behind them, highlight emerging lessons, and facilitate the sharing of those lessons.

3.3   The concerted effort to search *within* Africa for viable policies and innovative responses addressing the obstacles to education development is the second point of departure from previous norms. Because of the prior focus on failures, a tendency has evolved to look for external responses to challenges facing education in Africa. This has undermined the development of indigenous capacities to effectively redress weaknesses in education systems and propel development. It has likewise fostered dependency on externally generated knowledge. Indeed, these have been some of the key criticisms of the technical assistance to African education systems. In addition to documenting successes, therefore, this exercise furthers one of the main objectives of the ADEA, which is to relocate responsibility for the analysis of Africa's education systems and for the development of policy responses back to Africans. The exercise highlights the need for African governments and their international development partners to recognize (i) the richness of data generated from the ground, from the field, and from practice, and (ii) how that data can inform innovative policy responses to the challenges facing education in the region. Of course, this should not imply a lack of openness or receptiveness to applicable lessons learned elsewhere.

3.4   The third point of departure is the emphasis on process as a means, as well as a result. More than just to chronicle achievements, this exercise emphasized the need to reflect on the processes that led to those achievements. Documentation of such reflection and its findings is necessary in order to learn from experience and incorporate lessons into policy. A central result of this exercise is the very process that it initiated by engaging Ministries of Education in sustained critical introspection of their successes and the reasons why they occur. The means by which individual countries produced their respective case studies are, therefore, as important as the reports that ensued. It is hoped this process will lead to the development of an enduring culture, one that will encourage periodical assessment of and reflection upon the progress that has been made and the nature of the road ahead.

3.5   This document synthesizes case studies produced by 25 countries and 7 ADEA
Working Groups (see Annex 1 for an extensive overview, in three tables, of the case
studies).   The project began with an invitation which was sent to all education
ministers in sub-Saharan Africa, asking them to participate in this exercise. The letter
included extensive guidelines on our approach and expectations, and a request,
"to provide information on one or more policies, innovations and/or
experiences — identified by you — that have yielded dividends for one or more
of the three issues at-hand: access, quality and capacity building. Also, it
would be useful to include information on how and why they provided such
dividends."
Some countries' case studies included up to 13 experiences, others focused on only one or
two.

3.6   From the point of view of survey and sampling methodologies, the case studies
presented here have been self-selected. For whatever reason, a number of countries
did not respond to the invitation to participate in this exercise. For those that did, *their
selection* of "successful experiences" and *their identification* of policies and
innovations that have paid dividends are based on *their own knowledge* of a given
situation. In some respects, this selection process could be considered subjective in
that the cases reported were chosen by actors who are both concerned and official
(i.e., representing central government). However, it is these very actors who, by
proximity and involvement, are most familiar with the actual situations in question;
they possess valuable and valid knowledge that is, all too often, ignored or, at best,
deemed "too intuitive to be of use."

3.7   These very factors are integral to the strength of this approach, which allows people
— mostly from Ministries of Education — "closest to the action" to present their
understandings and interpretations of what has worked in the situations they know
best. The "subjectivity" of this approach has two advantages: (i) it brings qualitative
enrichment to the observations and the analyses, since the information's source has
unique knowledge of both the activities being addressed *and* the context in which they
exist; (ii) it favors the creation of a continuing process, in which actors in the field,
close to the implementation, are integrated into a more reflective process and
encouraged to engage in critical analysis of the activities being observed.

3.8   An essential aspect of this exercise's process was the emphasis on providing
concrete evidence for claimed successes. In most cases, obtaining the evidence —
getting the country teams to produce evidence for what they "knew" to be the case —
required several iterations. Nonetheless, it is likely that a number of the case studies
reported here will raise questions in terms of results and how they came about. The
Biennial meeting should be one occasion to obtain more information.

3.9   The process that led up to this synthesis report is best understood in terms of the
actors and events that gave it substance.

(a)   *The actors* involved include (in chronological order of their appearance in the
process):

•   the ADEA Steering Committee (composed of ten education ministers and
representatives of 19 agencies) which played an active role in the formulation of the
Terms of Reference for this exercise and which delegated a sub-committee

composed of three ministers and three agency members to monitor and participate more closely in the exercise;

- the country and Working Group teams which responded to the call for case studies and produced the reports that are the basis for this synthesis document; and,
- a small Technical Team working through the ADEA Secretariat that was closely involved with the country teams, meeting with most of them and providing feedback to them throughout the exercise.

(b) *The events* began with the Steering Committee's decision to embark on this exercise, followed by discussions and approval of the Terms of Reference. The exercise was launched in early July 1998 with an initial invitation letter sent to all Ministers of Education and followed by a reminder letter three months later. The country teams and the ADEA Working Groups went to work on their own with direct inputs and feedback from members of the technical team and from the ADEA Secretariat. As the country teams and Working Groups completed their drafts, two defining events occurred:

- national workshops. Each country team held a national workshop where its work was submitted to colleagues and concerned parties (often including their resident external financing and technical partners) for presentation and feedback; and,
- two regional seminars. Ten countries and three ADEA Working Groups participated in the Gaborone seminar for East and Southern Africa; 15 countries and seven Working Groups participated in the Cotonou seminar for Central and West Africa. These seminars included presentations of country and Working Group reports, feedback from all participants, and rich interaction between all participants. One outcome of these seminars was revised (in terms of information and analytical content) country reports which incorporated the feedback received. Several country reports were also enriched by the comparative perspective gained through their involvement in these seminars.

3.10 The next step was the drafting of this synthesis document — a perilous task at best. This was done by the technical team and included an intensive two week retreat.[4] The ensuing draft was circulated to the country and Working Group teams which were given the first opportunity to provide comments, corrections, modifications and feedback. The second draft went to the Steering Committee for comments. This document — still a draft — incorporates those comments. It is presented to the 1999 Biennale which, of course, is *the* defining event of the entire process.

3.11 A final methodological point provides a transition into discussion of the substance of the exercise and its findings. This point relates to the categorization of the major challenges, or issues, addressed. Theoretically, and intuitively, there is broad agreement on the importance and meaning of access, quality and capacity building, and on the fact that they pose *the* major challenges currently facing education in Africa. This is why it was decided to focus on the three specifically.

3.12 Distinctions between access and quality appeared blurred once country teams selected and examined more closely their "interventions" (shorthand for "policies, programs, projects, innovations, and experiences"). The interventions presented in a

---

[4]At the Rockefeller Foundation's Bellagio Center. ADEA acknowledges the support received from the Foundation and its Bellagio facilities.

number of case studies simultaneously tackle both access *and* quality. Examples include: early childhood education in Zanzibar and Equatorial Guinea; community schools in Burkina Faso and Mali; and vocational education in Zimbabwe. In operational terms, it appears difficult to isolate "pure" access and "pure" quality from one another. Nonetheless, for the sake of expository and conceptual convenience, this synthesis will continue to use these three categories.

4. OVERVIEW and SYNTHESIS of the CASE STUDIES

4.1   This section — the major part of this document — provides an overview and synthesis of the case studies.[5] The 25 country case studies are as varied as they are rich. Some are more descriptive and analytical than others; and the information relating to the results of the interventions is varied in nature. This overview is, indeed, highly synthesized and attempts to bring out the essence of the contents of the case studies. It should be viewed as the bare bones of a rich corpus of material received from the countries and from the Working Groups. Such reductionism was necessary (the case studies when stacked in a pile measure about 50 cm.) in order to produce a readable, manageable, and digestible background document for the Biennial.

4.2   This synthesis document is somewhat selective, with a "bias" in favor of case studies for which there exists sufficient information in terms of results *and* analysis of how and why they came to be. Indeed, a number of countries reported interventions that have not found their way into this document. This selectivity is the result, mainly, of a desire to go beyond the facts, into an analysis of the intervention. This exercise is more concerned with focusing on particularly productive and innovative interventions, than on presenting an inventory of everything that has provided some results.

4.3   The organization of this section is based on the three challenges — access, quality, and capacity building — addressed by the case studies. They are not watertight categories, and some elements of one may very well overlap with those of another. The section on community partnerships best illustrates this. In addition to cutting across all three categories, this section also addresses issues of governance and locus of decision-making (i.e., centralized vs. decentralized). Still, we think it more productive to organize the presentation of the case studies along the lines of these three somewhat analytical categories, rather than by country.

ACCESS

Strategies and interventions to provide basic education for all

4.4   Specific policies and programs for attaining basic education for all were addressed by case studies from seventeen countries.[6] These policies and programs are varied, often combining a number of policy elements (such as community participation, action research, working with external partners, double shifting, and targeting) in any given country. The following table characterizes the countries reporting on access to basic education by key enrollment and financing indicators, comparing them to averages for all of sub-Saharan Africa.

---

[5]Text in this section is, at times, taken directly from the case studies without attribution. All case studies were commissioned by ADEA. See Annex 2 for a bibliography of the case studies.

[6]Benin, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Guinea, Liberia, Madagascar, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Seychelles, Tanzania, Tchad, and Uganda.

Table 1: Selected indicators for countries reporting on access to primary education and for all sub-Saharan countries

Indicators (for 1995)	Averages for 17 countries	Averages for all sub-Saharan countries
Primary Gross Enrollment Rate (GER)	58.2%	78.3%
Girls' GER	48.9%	70.1%
Boys' GER	67.1%	84.3%
Girls as percent of total primary enrollments	42.0%	44.5%
Percent government budget to education	21.4%	18.5%
Percent GNP to education	4.0%	4.8%
Percent education budget to primary education	45.5%	48.0%

Source: UNESCO statistics, as reported in ADEA's *SPESSA* database.

When compared to the average of all sub-Saharan countries, the 17 countries that chose to report on their interventions for increasing the provision of basic education have below average primary school enrollments rates and are spending more of their government budgets, but a lower proportion of their GNPs, on education. Also, on the average, they are devoting a slightly lower share of their education budgets to primary education. It appears, therefore, that the 17 countries reporting on new and innovative interventions (i.e., policies, experiments, programs, etc) aimed at solving their persistent low-enrollment problems are countries in which education garners a respectable share of government budget (i.e., an average of 21.4%, compared to 18.5% for all countries). However, there may well be larger fiscal constraints in these countries (i.e., where the percentage of GNP going to education is 16.7% less than the overall average) that impede greater government financing of education.

4.5   The interventions reported in the country case studies suggest two trends:
- a move away from total centralized control over all aspects of education and towards the search for a more nuanced sharing of roles and functions between national and local jurisdictions; and
- a more "non-formal" approach to basic education. Differences with the formal system relate to the age range of pupils (they are older) and the content and organization of curriculum.

4.6   To a large extent, the case studies focus on (i) the development and strengthening of community involvement and of partnerships for increased and improved delivery of primary education, (ii) national teacher policies aimed at overcoming teacher shortages that have resulted due to governments' limited fiscal and budgetary capacities, and (iii) policies aimed at bringing specific groups, such as girls and nomads, into schools. In a number of these countries, the functions of teacher recruitment and management have traditionally been the sole responsibility of the

central government. All but one of the interventions were developed and implemented in conjunction with the countries' external financing and technical partners.

Community partnerships

4.7   A number of the country case studies highlight the roles played by communities in promoting access to basic education.[7] These include seven case studies focusing on the development of community partnerships (in selected communities; these are not nationwide programs) for the promotion of education.[8] By and large, the goal is improved access opportunities for basic education; concern for quality is also present. Issues relating to management, school buildings, curriculum, and teachers are addressed in all of these case studies. It is in these areas that the communities were most active, but in varying degrees and various ways. In six of these seven countries, the interventions were based on prior diagnostic studies and the mechanics and modalities of the communities' contributions were adapted to the nature of the context.

4.8   The *initial conception and construction* of these partnerships was, in all cases, based on particular features of socio-cultural, institutional and economic contexts. One consistently relevant factor in all cases is the new political-institutional context whereby central government — the State — has redefined its role by creating and promoting more space for local initiatives and more community control over education.   For example:

(a)   In Burkina Faso, the central government identified communities where several basic conditions for greater local involvement were present: (i) absence of a school, but not more than 3 km. from one; (ii) sufficient population density; (iii) existence of a school management committee; (iv) a formal request made by the village; and (v) existence of a local water supply.

(b)   In Burundi, central government promoted school construction by the communities.

(c)   Côte d'Ivoire's "experimental schools" are built in poor, culturally heterogenous communities. In order to mobilize community resources (in cash and in kind), this partnership worked with (i) existing parents' associations, (ii) local structures of the MoE, and (iii) voluntary committees created specifically to implement pedagogical programs and manage overall school affairs.

(d)   Madagascar's "contract-program" approach, which linked contractually government, school and community (plus NGOs and external partners), was built on the basis of already existing (often tacit) forms of cooperation, cultural norms (*Dina*, or a social contact that constitutes a firm commitment between two parties) and reciprocal obligations between community members. The goal is to improve access through greater community involvement in the running and management of the school,

---

[7]In addition to this, the importance and role of community participation is highlighted in country case studies that focus on access to: early childhood education (Zanzibar); education for nomads (Nigeria); access for girls (Benin, Tchad); and secondary education (Burundi, Tanzania, Tchad).

[8] Burkina Faso, Burundi, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Madagascar, Mali and Tchad. In addition, Gambia and Tanzania report on pilot projects aimed at developing community partnerships.

thereby increasing the community's sense of ownership of and responsibility for the school.

(e)   In Mali, international NGOs have worked directly with communities to help create a fabric of local associations created to promote and manage their schools.

(f)   In Tchad, a higher level of community involvement in education was necessitated by a period of civil strife and an absence of government. Educational activity during this period only occurred if taken in-hand by the communities.

4.9   One point that is common to all but one (Tchad) of these case studies is the difficult quest to determine and define the boundaries between what is best done by the communities and what is best done by government. This ever-persistent question of *role definition* is an issue which every partnership must settle in order to make sustainable progress.[9] Furthermore, in all cases, central government and/or political authorities initiated the process, provided the initial conceptual framework, and continued to provide material resources to the schools.

(a)   In Burkina Faso and Côte d'Ivoire, government provides periodic supervisory and monitoring services using trained teachers and school inspectors. Teachers are recruited by the communities with technical assistance and advice from the MoE. Teachers' salaries are paid by the communities, along with contributions from international NGOs. Difficulties arose in both countries when it came to developing harmony in "ways of doing business". In Burkina Faso, friction exists concerning the frequency and timing of supervisory visits. This problem has been attributed to supervisors who have not sufficiently integrated the new standards of conduct into their work programs. In Côte d'Ivoire, the communities find that the MoE tends to limit their autonomy in matters related to fundraising.

(b)   In Burundi, the burden was shared between communities, NGOs, and local and national governments. The local government contributed 40% of the construction costs, parents and NGOs each contributed 20%, and the remaining 20% came from the central government. The central government also instituted a double-shift policy and increased teacher remunerations accordingly.

(c)   In Madagascar, the government continued to provide resources for teacher salaries, equipment, construction, renovation, maintenance, pedagogical and didactic materials, and supervision and management services. The communities participated in construction and renovation by providing local material and labor. They also committed themselves to maintaining the buildings, improving the school environment, enrolling their children and, at times, recruiting the teachers. When it came to the question of "legal remedies" for breach of contractual obligations, it appeared much easier for government to apply penalties to the communities than vice versa.

(d)   In Mali, rural and urban community associations create and manage schools. They are responsible for (i) recruiting and paying teachers, (ii) recruiting students, and (iii) constructing, equipping and maintaining the schools. Once they are officially recognized, the schools receive subsidies from local government administrations; the MoE provides supervisory and monitoring services. The recruitment of poorly

---

[9]This point came out clearly from the Dakar Biennale that focused on partnerships. See ADEA, *Partnerships for Capacity Building and Quality Improvements in Education: Papers from the ADEA Biennial Meeting.* 1999. In particular, see the introductory article in that book by R. Sack.

qualified teachers is the major problem in these community schools. Other problems include: a lack of textbooks; inadequate funds for the payment of teacher salaries; insufficient supervision; poorly defined tasks and roles; and the difficulty of attaining equivalency with public schools. The issue of the sustainability of the community schools has been raised, as some communities experience management problems and request that their schools become regular public schools.

(e)   In Tchad, the communities assumed their role by default during a period when the central State was basically absent.

4.10   *Results* reported by the country case studies are positive, but varied.

(a)   In Burkina Faso, with the support of external partners, Government created 194 community schools between 1995 and 1999. 10,056 pupils are enrolled in these schools, amounting to 1% of all enrollments; 42% of those enrolled are girls (in 1995, girls represented 39% of primary school enrollments).

(b)   In Burundi, the number of classrooms doubled over the ten year period of 1981 - 1991 (after which ensued a period of civil disturbances); during this period, the GER went from 29% to 72%.

(c)   Côte d'Ivoire established ten experimental schools, one in each region of the country, in a context of declining enrollment rates and an increase in rates of repetition. Retention was a major objective. Significant improvements (between 1994 and 1998) in the primary school leaving exam in 7 of the 10 schools (no change in one school, declines in two others) evidence the impact being made by these schools.

(d)   In Madagascar, enrollment growth in the "dina or contract-program schools" was consistently and significantly higher than in non-dina schools. Overall enrollments increased by 32% nationwide from 1994 to 1997; the increase was 44% in the "dina" schools, as compared to 21% for the non-dina schools (total enrollments in dina schools being 37% of total national enrollments in 1997/98). Primary school achievements rates in the "dina" schools were also significantly higher.

(e)   In Mali, in 1997/98, 83,360 pupils were enrolled in the community schools. This represents about 10% of all primary school enrollments. However, whereas the proportion of girls in all primary schools is 40.6%, it is 38.3% in the community schools.

(f)   During the three to five years of civil strife and government absence in Tchad, schooling would have ceased to exist had it not been for community support. Communities totally maintained the schools and recruited and paid the teachers. Since then, this system has endured and has led to sustained community contributions to, and control over, their schools.

4.11   The *lessons* that come out of the country case studies are, of course, largely related to the specifics of each situation. Nonetheless several lessons appear:

(a)   There is a demand for communities to participate in partnerships that entail costs for them. These costs include the material and organizational capacities of the communities to undertake such projects. In Madagascar, for example, the contract-program approach worked best in communities that were already well structured and organized.

(b)   There needs to be mutual trust between actors. This will be the case only if all involved parties make good on their commitments. One manifestation of this issue is in Madagascar, where there is a need for congruency between downwards (government to communities) and upwards (the inverse) articulations and responsibilities. This is based on a "bottom-up/top-down" principle that originates

with knowledge of the communities and takes into account the specific context and constraints.

(c)   The experience in Burkina Faso demonstrated both the capacity of communities to mobilize on behalf of education and the constraints imposed by available resources. It also demonstrated the importance of dynamic poverty-fighting partnerships between government, communities and NGOs. It appears that, in this circumstance, the communities are more receptive to innovations than the "intellectuals" are.

(d)   Promoting exchange between teachers on practical matters was useful in Côte d'Ivoire. This helped identify inadequacies in teacher training. These interactions also seemed to indicate that school improvements were related more to teacher autonomy than to supervision.

(e)   In Côte d'Ivoire, school cooperatives served the double function of promoting social integration of the youth as well as developing revenues for the school.

(f)   The Tchad case stresses the need to strengthen the implementation skills of community leaders who have no prior experience in school management. These individuals should be trained in simple management techniques, as was revealed by communities' analysis of resource management.

4.12   Gambia undertook a novel study that compared three communities with high involvement in both school management and school mapping with two other communities in each of which the location of the school was contentious. When comparing enrollments in these two sets of communities, it is clear that communities with a great deal of local involvement in the setting up of the school have higher enrollment growth than communities with very little or no involvement. In the three communities with a high degree of involvement, 70% of school age children were enrolled in school, as opposed to about 40% in the other two communities.

4.13   In the past, school mapping and site location were done almost exclusively by the Ministry of Education, with little or no community involvement in the decision-making process. Because of this phenomenon, many schools were located in areas considered by the communities to have no relevant value, or perceived by them as a threat to their norms and values. Low enrollments have resulted under circumstances like these. Meanwhile, the enrollment in schools with active community involvement and a sense of communal ownership has improved. In these cases, the communities made significant contributions in the form of labor and materials; there was also a tendency for community members living abroad to urge parents to send children to school.

4.14   Tanzania reports on a Community Education Fund that is being put into place, on a pilot basis, through joint efforts with an external partner. Participating schools are located in poor, educationally disadvantaged districts. The objectives of this intervention are to increase enrollments and retention, to improve standards, to increase resource flow into the schools, and to empower parents, districts and local authorities in the management of their schools and resources. Eligible schools must be registered and have a school committee. Participating communities are required to sign a memorandum of understanding with the district authorities. Participation entails a level of community contribution that is determined democratically by the communities themselves and includes a plan based on the needs of the specific school. Once the plan is approved and the village amply informed of the document's

contents, the Ministry of Education makes a matching (on a one-to-one basis) grant to that of the community.

4.15   Initial results from the 261 participating schools in the five pilot districts are encouraging:
•   Quality, as measured by academic performance in the primary school leaving examination, shows improvement since introduction of the program.
•   The program has created and strengthened a sense of school ownership through increased community participation in the affairs of the school.
The program's major problem is related to the fact that it started in very poor districts where attitudes about education are traditionally and relatively unfavorable. As a result, parental contributions were low and, thus attracted lower-than-expected matching grants.

Integrated policies for universal primary education
4.16   <u>Uganda</u> has embarked on an ambitious, all-encompassing policy to achieve UPE by 2003. This policy, implemented on all fronts, is aimed at tackling issues of access, equity, relevance, equality and capacity development (also, see paras. 4.104 & 4.111). The will to promote such a policy is rooted in Uganda's emergence from years of conflict and coupled by political changes introduced by the new government in 1986. This new government commissioned an in-depth sector analysis under the auspices of a national education commission that consulted widely with all stakeholders and published its White Paper in 1992. This publication and the process leading up to it fostered a broad-based sense of ownership in the ensuing national education policy and paved the way for the declaration of the UPE program. In December of 1996, President Museveni announced that the implementation of UPE would start in January of 1997 and, indeed, it did. The time frame for completion of the UPE program is 2003.

4.17   A key feature of the UPE policy is its holistic nature. As of 1993, Uganda was already working with external partners and had begun to implement reforms that included the following:
•   a teacher development and management system to carry out reform in primary teacher education curriculum;
•   a reform of the primary school curriculum;
•   an assessment reform to reform examinations and to introduce other forms of assessment;
•   an instructional materials unit to provide textbooks and other teaching and learning materials;
•   continuous assessment aimed at introducing formative assessment in schools; and
•   a national assessment of progress in education, as a means to monitor the performance of the education system.

4.18   In order to achieve the UPE objectives, Government committed itself to providing the following:
•   tuition fees for four children per family;
•   instructional materials in the form of text books;
•   basic physical facilities in the form of classrooms, laboratories, libraries and teachers' houses. This was done through the provision of iron sheets, cement, timber and nails. Local authorities and communities were expected to supply additional inputs, especially in the form of labor for construction;

- the payment of teachers' salaries; and
- the training of teachers.

4.19   Evidence of success is clear: from 1996 to 1997, enrollments increased by 73%, the number of pupils entering into first grade almost tripled, and the GER increased from 77% to 137%! The impact on access for girls, however, has been less dramatic; the percentage of female enrollment increased from 45% in 1995 to 47% in 1999.

4.20   These results are attributed to a number of factors:
- increased government expenditures for education. Overall expenditures for education increased by about 22% per year between 1996 and 1999 and expenditures for primary education increased by 40% for the first year of UPE and then another 28% the subsequent year. The proportion of the education budget allocated to primary education increased from 49% in 1995/96 to 56% in 1996/97 and then to 64% in 1998/99.
- improved teacher/pupil ratios. The pupil/teacher ratio increased substantially, from 38 in 1996 to 52 in 1997 and to 62 in 1998;
- training and certification of teachers. The percentage of trained teachers has improved, going from 68.5% in 1995 to 71.5% in 1999. Since 1995, almost all head teachers have undergone a certificate training course in school management. Teacher salaries have also improved in recent years.
- a strong demand for education, as evidenced by the huge increase in enrollments. This observation is further supported by the results of a survey in which 98% of the respondents agreed that "in order to be successful in any kind of work, it is necessary to be educated," with 80% mentioning cost as the major obstacle to enrolling their children in schools;
- political will, in the form of strong presidential and ministerial leadership and backing for UPE, which helped overcome the resistence of some policy-makers;
- the primary education reform that began in 1993, four years before the launching of UPE, and paved the way for future progress (see para. 4.17);
- political stability and economic growth, with real GDP growing at an average of 6.5% since 1987. Also, some of the proceeds of canceled foreign debt was allocated to primary education;
- decentralization trends. Decentralization brought schools closer to the administrative units above them, thereby making the system more responsive and efficient;
- the coordinated efforts of Uganda's external partners, along with several NGOs; and, finally,
- improved data collection. This made it possible to ascertain that in the first year of UPE, about 4% of the teachers on the payroll were "ghosts" and that another 38% were teaching but had not been paid. Consequently, government was able to eliminate the "ghosts" and pay most salary arrears. Improved reliability of data also enabled the Ministry of Education to come up with an Education Strategic Investment Plan for the period of 1998-2003.

4.21   The major lessons drawn from this experience are the following:
- a realistic vision and plan, as well as widespread consultation and participation of all stakeholders, is vital at all stages of decision-making;
- it is not necessary for everything to be in place in order to start implementing UPE;
- it is more efficient to have the administration and the management of education system located as near as possible to the schools;

- although some innovations are best introduced in phases, it is necessary to move forward continuously (even if very slowly) in order to maintain morale;
- a resource mix of political will (policy makers working with other stakeholders), technical inputs (competent personnel in education) and economic factors (stability and growth) is essential; and
- factors related to values, ethics and moral codes must be kept in mind. This implies that (i) governments should provide a genuine response to needs of people and be willing to act on that response, (ii) transparency and democracy, are necessary at all levels of the system. Transparency at the top level is especially important.

4.22 Seychelles also reported on its march toward education for all. In 1960, 70% of twelve year-old children and 25% of fifteen year-old children attended schools. By 1991, the enrollment rates were 111% for pre-school (crèche), 97% for primary education and 71% for secondary education. A combination of factors account for these results:
- a clear policy that made nine years of free, compulsory education for all a top priority;
- fusion of the two, previously parallel education systems and the subsequent abolition of private schools;
- a "zoning" policy which states that all children must attend school in their residential districts. This was aimed at removing injustices in the education system;
- free provision of education materials, including uniforms and free meals, by the schools. Although uniforms, meals, transport, and stationary are free from creche to Secondary 5, parents are asked to contribute a portion of the cost if possible;
- a program for the renovation and/or construction of schools;
- introduction of a national youth service (which lasted for 18 years and has now been disbanded) to ease students into the world of work and service; and
- financial support from external partners.

4.23 There were some difficulties, one of which was related to the introduction of Creole as the medium of instruction. Creole became the scapegoat for most of the academic failure of the new policies. French and English have since been reintroduced in the early grades. Now the most difficult challenge is to complete the transition from a free education system to a system in which parents contribute the transition from a free education system to a system in which parents contribute. Establishment of a monitoring mechanism has also been problematic.

4.24 Three lessons emerge from this case study:
- Government commitment to education is essential;
- Although the policy of compulsory education results in a high enrollment rate, this does not, necessarily, translate into high attendance rates. Proper monitoring is needed.
- Students who come to believe that education is the responsibility of government may not behave in an accountable manner, as they do not feel bound by a financial commitment to do so. There has been a lot of irresponsibility on the part of students who do not fully engage themselves in the learning process. This system has brought about much wastage.

Innovative teacher policies
4.25 It is increasingly understood that a major impediment to increased access to primary education is the inability of national government to mobilize, motivate and pay the

salaries — at civil service rates — of the increased number of teachers needed to staff schools. This situation is especially acute in the countries of the Sahel.[10] The case studies demonstrate the on-going search for alternative policies and practices to address this problem. Community partnerships (see paras. 4.7 - 4.11) in which the communities, with varying inputs and support from central government, recruit and pay teachers is one approach adopted by several countries.

4.26   In the 1990s in Cameroon, the teacher/pupil ratio increased from around 1/50 (which was the ratio throughout the 1980s) to 1/55 in 1991 and was projected to rise to 1/75 in 1995. These increases translated to a projected teacher deficit of about 10,800 in primary education. This predicament was further aggravated by the closing of the teacher training school and the halting of civil service recruitment due to economic crisis and the constraints of structural adjustment. The resulting situation was in contradiction with the Jomtien goal of quality basic education for all by 2000.

4.27   In addition to the volunteer teachers recruited by the communities for large classes (see para. 4.42), government reopened the teacher training schools in 1995 and organized competitive exams to recruit students as teachers. Those selected received pre-service training, lasting from one to three years, depending on their level of education. They were expected to pay for the cost of their training. Upon finishing the courses, graduates are qualified to serve as non-civil service teachers in primary schools. These graduates must then submit applications to local commissions which proceed with the recruitment process. Those selected receive two year, renewable contracts for two, ten months periods (two school years). Their salaries are about 67.5% of those paid to civil service teachers with the same qualifications. Furthermore, these teachers are paid out of local governments' budgets. Given the unified fiscal and treasury structures, however, local financial services often lack cash; payments are, therefore, frequently delayed.

4.28   This policy has demonstrated several advantages: (i) it has provided employment to otherwise unemployed secondary school and university leavers; (ii) pedagogically, these teachers have contributed to overall teaching quality; and (iii) this has prevented some schools from having to close due to an absence of teachers and has thereby contributed to improved access in some areas. Gross enrollment rates progressed from 62.7% in 1994 to 69.2% in 1999; in some educationally disfavored zones, these new, non-civil service teachers enabled the creation of new schools. These teachers represent 18% of overall teachers; in some provinces, however, this proportion reaches 30-60%.

4.29   In Guinea, in 1990, enrollments were low (GER = 28%) and there were clear signs of a strong demand for primary education. Meanwhile, many teachers were unemployed or underemployed; there were teachers without classes and a plethora of administrative personnel who had been trained as teachers. These circumstances led to the diagnosis of dysfunctional teacher placement practices. As a result, the

---

[10]See A. Mingat & B. Suchaut, *Une analyse économique comparative des systèmes éducatifs africains*. Paris : Ministère français des Affaires Etrangères, Coopération et Francophonie. Décembre 1998.

government elaborated a policy of teacher redeployment aimed at putting teachers without classes into classes without teachers.[11]

4.30   It was a difficult policy to implement, given the resistence of teachers for whom redeployment was a major inconvenience. MoE's strategy to meet this challenge and to implement the policy included several dimensions:

(a)   Strong and clear expressions of political will from both the head-of-state and the minister of education both of whom played an active role in implementing the policy.

(b)   An active communication and information policy that included: (i) meetings held throughout the country (often conducted by the MoE) with teacher and parents' groups and organizations, as well as with the ministry technical and administrative personnel (inspectors, etc.); (ii) the dissemination of official decrees; and (ii) a media campaign using both modern media (radio, television and press) and more traditional channels of communication (inter-personnel communication).

(c)   Accompanying measures that included: (i) reorganization and revitalization of teacher career and reward structures that took into account the specific aspects of the teaching profession (i.e., different from that of other civil service professions) and included an in-service training program and a revised career ladder, and (ii) guarantees against losing benefits such as housing.

4.31   Implementation of this policy was not easy and was met with a number of obstacles. The implementation process coincided with democratization of political life and, therefore, the creation of a multitude of political parties, many of which were opposed to the sitting government. Some parties made political capital of discontentments with this policy. Other problems were linked to a perceived loss of prestige by secondary school teachers who were trained as primary school teachers, managed to obtain posts in secondary schools without additional training, and were then redeployed back to primary schools. They could no longer be called 'professeur" and had to re-learn how to work with younger children. Of course, there were also a number of problems related to the quality of the information about individuals, resistence from individuals, and imperfect knowledge of the school map and associated information.

4.32   Nonetheless, this policy was implemented (as part of a cluster of measures) in 1991-92. Results were, and still are, dramatic.

(a)   The GER increased from 28% in 1990 to 40% in 1994 at little-to-no additional cost to the government budget.

(b)   Girls, in particular, benefitted from this policy. One result of the redeployment was to assign women teachers to rural schools (as directors and teachers). This had the effect of convincing local populations about the importance of sending their girls to school. Between 1990 and 1998 the GER for girls increased from 25.7% to 31.9%.

(c)   The percentage of non-salary budget increased.

(d)   With the assistance of the EFTP, an improved personnel management and information system was established.

4.33   Lessons drawn from this experience include:

---

[11]See A. Condé, *Teacher Redeployment in Guinea*. ADEA. 1999.

(a)   The participatory approach, involving all segments of the population and all concerned actors, was essential.

(b)   Political will, active leadership and the commitment of the Ministry's senior staff were crucial to success of the operation.

(c)   This was a cost-effective, purely national operation with hardly any inputs from the EFTPs.

(d)   Hesitations and delays resulted from the absence of a detailed management information system and the lack of management training among staff responsible for the implementation.

4.34   In <u>Senegal</u>, where the GER declined from 58% in 1990 to 54% in 1994, the government, in collaboration with its external partners, developed a controversial policy to recruit "voluntary" teachers outside of the norms and salary scales of the civil service. This policy proceeded from several observations:

•   A strong demand for education was countered by an insufficient supply of teachers.

•   Thousands of classrooms were being built by communities, NGOs, and parents; this was being done in the context of a government incentive program.

•   Government's budget was far from being able to support the cost of large increases in the numbers of civil service teachers.

•   There were a large number of unemployed university and secondary school graduates.

4.35   Gaining acceptance for this policy required intensive explanatory efforts which included meetings with teacher unions, parent groups, and community associations, as well as use of the mass media to inform and interact with the public at-large. As a result, acceptance was sufficiently broad to allow for implementation; in 1998, 19% of all teachers were volunteers.

4.36   The volunteer teachers in Senegal are seen as an essential link in a chain of solidarity that includes examples of international volunteerism (UN Volunteers, Volontaires du progrès, Peace Corps, etc.). The volunteer teachers agree to work for two years, renewable one time only. During that period they receive in-service training and a reduced salary. Housing is provided by the communities in which they teach and they benefit from health insurance. The work status of the volunteer teachers is flexible: they are recruited and managed by the local authorities; they can resign whenever they see fit; they can sit for university and/or civil service entrance examinations. Once they have finished their voluntary teaching, they can become "contractual" teachers (i.e., not civil service) with salary and career structures that attain their maximum status after 22 years of service. "Contractual" teachers holding the appropriate teaching certificates may, depending on established procedures, be recruited as civil service teachers.

4.37   Results have been impressive. Between 1995 (when this policy went into effect) and 1998, the GER increased from 54.6% to 61.2%. Girls, in particular, have benefitted from this policy, as their enrollment rates went from 46.6% to 55.5%. Surveys of inspectors and school directors indicate that the quality of the volunteers' work is satisfactory. Furthermore, when taking the professional teacher exams, volunteers tend to score better than other teachers.

4.38   <u>Tchad</u> was faced with increasing demand for education coupled with a shortage of teachers, a result of Government's limited fiscal capacity to create civil service positions for teachers. The mobilization of non-civil service teachers (for both primary and secondary education; see para. 4.934.7) began in 1974 and became particularly important during the years of civil crisis (1979 - 1982). These teachers now represent 54.7% of all primary teachers and 71.0% of secondary school teachers. Most of them have not undergone pre-service teacher training. As a result, there are now three categories of non-civil service teachers:

- "Community teachers" — These are entirely financed by the communities. They number 1,827 (15.7% of all teachers and 28.7% of the non-civil service teachers).
- "Auxiliary teachers" — These are employed by private schools. They number 895 (7.7% of all teachers and 14.1% of non-civil service teachers).
- "Supplementary teachers" — These are employed in public schools and are recruited and paid either by government or local parents' associations. They number 3,643 (31.3% of all teachers and 57.2% of the non-civil service teachers).

4.39   These non-civil service teachers are recruited at a minimal education level of 4 years of secondary school; only 6.3% of them have pre-service teacher training. Once employed, they benefit from 120 days of in-service training organized during the school vacations. Communities, parents' associations and private schools are free to negotiate the terms of service with the teachers — there are no general criteria or regulations. Since 1997, however, government provides 80% of the salary costs for 1,300 (about 20%) of these teachers, with the remaining 20% of the costs paid by the communities.

4.40   Although it is generally agreed that these teachers have improved access and have reduced class sizes, a majority (53.4%) of the 178 school directors interviewed felt that these teachers had a negative effect on quality. This negative opinion, however, was held by only 40.4% of the parents' association heads interviewed. The situation that led to the use of non-civil service teachers has contributed to higher levels of community responsibility. Communities presently manage 29.4% of all primary schools. Community and parents' associations have become major actors in the search for sustainable approaches and solutions.

4.41   Sustainability remains the major issue. Part of the problem lies in the discrepancy between civil service and non-civil service teachers, with the latter feeling devalued and ready to leave his/her job at any moment.

Double-shift and multi-grade classes

4.42   <u>Cameroon</u> reports on its primary school "large class pedagogy" program which was launched throughout the country by a series of seminars. This is a pedagogically reinforced form of double-shift teaching, designed to alleviate the effects of very large classes (100-200 pupils), especially in urban areas. This approach aims at counteracting the monotony found in big classes by using teaching methods based on increased pupil autonomy and active (i.e., non frontal) pedagogy. The very large classes are broken up into smaller sections on the basis of the lesson and pupils' age and ability. This is done by the teachers, who best know their pupils. Pupils are actively involved in all aspects of classroom management, including the development of lesson plans. The teacher's role is that of guide, advisor and animator for the class. Specific teacher training for this approach began in 1992. "Volunteer", auxiliary

teachers (paid by parents) are recruited locally to assist the trained teacher. Educational levels of and remuneration amounts for these teachers vary. In some school districts, auxiliary teachers account for 30% to 60% of all teachers.

4.43   The major pedagogical innovation involved in this program is the teachers' avoidance of frontal teaching. Pupils are encouraged to form small groups, work together, and participate actively in the learning process. Pedagogically, the process is organized in four steps: (i) the teacher asks the pupils to form small groups that may be based on criteria determined by the teacher; (ii) the teacher presents the assignment, establishes the rules, the time for tasks, and selects (this is sometimes done by the students themselves) a class member responsible for keeping time and reporting back on the assignment; (iii) together within their groups, the pupils carry out the assignment and the teacher visits each group to provide advice and guidance; and (iv) the groups report back to the entire class on their task, soliciting discussion and feedback. The teacher makes sure that, within the groups, the children's roles vary and that what can be done individually is not done collectively.

4.44   It appears that the pupils are more productive when they work in small groups and assume greater responsibility for their own learning. One reason for this may be the impression gained by a number of teachers that pupils in this situation think they are playing. Their "play" is, however, sufficiently structured; they are actually learning. An evaluation of large classes in lower secondary schools suggests that it is particularly important that these teachers be well trained to teach French and written expression. In-service training for these teachers is most important, especially in the evaluation of their students.

4.45   Côte d'Ivoire reported on an experience in one urban school that demonstrates the efficacity of double-shift classes. This measure was necessitated by the very large numbers of pupils at that school. Without increasing the number of classrooms, nor the number of teachers, the number of pupils was increased by 41% from one year to the next (from 1993/94 to 1994/95), remaining relatively stable thereafter. The school day was reduced to four hours for the pupils. Teachers received special training and the community worked with the school in providing material inputs. Results were excellent: the promotion rate progressed from 57% in 1993/94 to an average of 71% over the subsequent four years; and the success rate on the school leaving exam went from 27% in 1994 to 77% in 1998.

4.46   Gambia reports that double-shift teaching was introduced in the urban and semi-urban centres as a response to limited numbers of teachers and classrooms. Double shift teaching was introduced in selected schools as a pilot in 1990. In these schools, some teachers were chosen to teach two different cohorts of students (one in the morning and one in the afternoon). A single classroom was servicing 90 students instead of 45 (i.e., 45 in the morning and 45 in the afternoon). The introduction of the double shift has contributed to the significant increase in enrolment in these schools. After the success of the pilot phase, double-shift teaching was introduced in all urban schools nation wide. This change resulted in average annual enrollment growth of 8%, with 32% of pupils in double-shift classes in 1997/98.

4.47   Despite the significant contribution double shift has made towards increasing access to education, concerns regarding its effectiveness have been raised by both teachers

and parents. While the majority of parents and teachers surveyed agree, in principle, on the necessity of double shift, it is the view of most of these parents and teachers that both students and teachers find it difficult to cope under its present form. Teachers pointed out that double shift teaching requires sacrifice and that it is hectic. Others feel that the afternoon students are disadvantaged by the fact that the teacher is already exhausted by the end of the morning session. Despite the achievements — increased enrollments and student success — brought about by the introduction of double shift teaching, access to schooling was constrained in some cases by the lack of Junior secondary schools and the high cost of schooling in general.

4.48   Guinea reported on the introduction of multi-grade classes in rural zones, a more rational use of teachers, to increase enrollments. This approach was appropriate for 1990-95, when there was a strong demand for education, coupled by limited teacher recruitment. Implementation of this program was made possible by: the construction of new schools and the improvements made to existing ones; sufficient equipment and didactic materials (textbooks, radios, reference books); and specific training for teachers and school directors on multi-grade teaching and supplementary use of radio programs. Although a systematic evaluation of this program has yet been done, the periodic reports from local education offices seem to indicate that the impact has been positive; enrollments in the concerned areas have increased.

4.49   The viability and feasibility of multi-grade policies is a major lesson to come out of this experience. Obstacles, such as the reticence of teachers and other school officials, and the need for sufficient teaching materials, still exist and must be overcome. Because of the added demand placed upon them, these teachers often try to be posted to other schools where the multi-grade approach is not used. It is therefore important to keep multi-grade teachers motivated, as they may view the situation as requiring additional effort of their part. Given the distance of the rural areas in which these teachers teach, provision of adequate supervision is difficult to ensure. Also, families have to accept the viability of the multi-grade approach and not send their children elsewhere.

Bringing basic education to nomadic children

4.50   Nigeria has a population of about 9.3 million nomads, about a third of whom are children of school-going age. The nomads are of two types: pastoralists and migrant fishermen. The literacy rates of the nomadic population range from 0.2% to 2%, and their participation in both formal and non-formal education is very low. Their lifestyle makes it extremely difficult for them to participate in schooling. An action research program with four university-based Nomadic Centers was established to provide academic support services. The centers did the study which provided the basis for the program, which was designed and implemented between 1990 and 1998. An evaluation was conducted in 1999 to verify the utilization of the curriculum and instructional materials.

4.51   This was done in an institutional context that included:
•   a National Commission for Nomadic Education that was mandated to oversee the program. This structure had a clear focus on the provision of primary education to children of nomadic communities, the provision of extension programs for the adults, and the establishment of partnership links — state, local government, national and international NGOs, agencies — for the effective implementation of the program.

- an enabling environment for the innovation. This included: 17 cooperative societies linked to a loan scheme for families; assistance to nomadic communities to promote financial stability; establishment in 12 northern states of 54 adult literacy classes (with more females than males enrolled); radio programs about the activities of the Nomadic Education Commission aimed at mobilization and public enlightenment; establishment of nomadic community schools built and maintained by communities and, apparently, better resourced than those government aided schools; and establishment of a school construction selection committee.

4.52 Working with national and external partners, educational inputs were developed. They included: curriculum and didactic materials based on the mainstream curriculum, but adapted to suit the needs and lifestyle of the nomads; teachers were re-tooled to handle the new curriculum and the new client; a program that trains 12-18 year old nomads as teachers was established (this was extremely important, since many teachers are not willing to move around with the nomadic communities); suitable delivery systems with flexible schedules and shifts to allow room for children to work; radio was used for the delivery of instruction; collapsible classrooms made of aluminum for the pastoralists, as well as canvas, motorized boat schools for the fishermen; and standardized performance indicators and monitoring instruments, out of which a system for assessing the validity of schools was developed.

4.53 As a result of these interventions, enrollment of nomadic children rose from 18,831 in 1990 to 155,786 in 1998. During the same period, the enrollment of girls rose from 5,068 to 65,855. The gap between male and female enrollment has been reduced by 85%. Transition rates from primary to junior secondary school rose from 45% in 1992 to 53% in 1998, higher than the national average of 47%. The number of primary school completers rose from 2,077 in 1994 to 7,632 in 1998. In 1990 there were 329 schools and 886 teachers; by 1997 there were 1,098 schools and 3,355 teachers. Parents, communities and even the local government are now more aware of their obligations and have acquired the skills to use the new monitoring tools to influence the improvement of their schools. Remaining problems include: inadequately trained teachers (53% lack minimal qualifications); inadequate funding and insufficient instructional materials; and attendance disruptions caused by conflicts between nomads and farmers.

4.54 Several lessons are drawn from this experience:

(a) The first step toward the success of this innovation was conviction of the need to change, along with recognition of the fact that the formal education system would not reach the nomads. It was acknowledged that the education system needed to adapt to the needs of the nomads, not vice versa.

(b) The holistic nature of the intervention and its process, along with a strategy for the continuous mobilization of stakeholders, were at the center of its success. This was particularly important given the initial skepticism of the nomadic communities. In order to overcome this, a combination of approaches were used, including: face-to-face meetings, often working with veterinary extension agents; meetings with community leaders; use of radio and posters; and the decentralization of the decision making processes to units and stakeholders involved in the program.

Provision of school meals

4.55   Between 1980 and 1999 (years of, or following, drought and civil strife), <u>Tchad</u> operated a school feeding program in primary schools with the cooperation of external partners. Overall coverage now includes 120,700 pupils in 809 schools (or about 16% of enrolled pupils). Food supplies are delivered to each school and managed by joint school/community committees. This program has been a factor in stimulating access in regions that are drought-stricken or suffer from chronic food shortages. And, it has contributed to the development of closer relations between communities and their school. In addition to supplying meals to pupils, the food supplies were used to supplement the salaries of 1,100 community (non civil service) teachers (see para. 4.38). Although there is general agreement on the importance of this input for access, it is not clear that it has improved the more qualitative, pedagogical aspects of the schools.

4.56   One drawback of this approach is its sustainability and the dependency it engenders. In communities where school feeding programs had been terminated, it was observed that enrollments declined substantially. In some cases this has led to school closures. Government has not managed to constitute alternative approaches and food stocks.

4.57   Three lessons are drawn from this experience: (i) the need to train members of local management communities; (ii) the need for establishment of clear regulations concerning the roles and responsibilities of educational and community authorities in the management of these programs; and (iii) the need to make communities aware that sustainability depends on the constitution of food stocks for school feeding programs.

Strategies and interventions for improving access for girls

4.58   Four countries and one Working Group[12] addressed interventions specifically aimed at bringing more educational opportunities to girls, especially those interventions that prevents them prematurely leaving school. In addition, the case studies, presented above in the sections on community partnerships and teacher policies demonstrate that interventions aimed at increasing access in general, tend to be disproportionately effective in bringing more girls into school. This is not surprising given that a disproportionate number of out-of-school children are girls. This is particularly the case for the 16 countries reporting on access to primary education (as shown in Table 1). Without specifically targeting girls, the interventions reported by Burkina Faso, Senegal and Guinea all had disproportionately positive effects on bringing girls to school (however, the opposite appears to be the case for the community schools in Mali). Also, the Zanzibar policies for early childhood education succeeded in attracting more girls than boys, which helped in improving girls' enrollments in primary education (para. 4.82).

4.59   Three of the countries' case studies focused on bringing girls into primary schools (Benin, Côte d'Ivoire and Tchad), one focused on secondary education (Tanzania),

_____

[12]Benin (with two case studies), Côte d'Ivoire, Tanzania, and Tchad; plus the Female Participation Working Group, working through FAWE.

and one used a more non-formal approach that deals with over-age, out-of-school girls (Benin).

4.60   Benin reported two interventions aimed at improving basic educational opportunities for girls: one intervention for girls in the formal school system and a community development project aimed at providing basic education for "over-age", out-of-school girls. Both interventions were developed and implemented in collaboration with Benin's external partners. Both are also based on diagnostic analyses (the non-formal one used an action research approach) which indicate that girls' absences from school are related to cultural factors and aggravated by early pregnancies and curricular content that, according to parents, does not correspond to their expectations for their daughters. In addition, given the costs of schooling, parents with limited means favored their sons' educations over those of their daughters.

4.61   Political authorities had long been concerned with this situation. Working with external partners, a program was established in 1992 that aimed at increasing girls' enrollments and keeping them in school. This program included:

(a)   affirmative actions aimed at exempting girls in rural areas from paying the school fees; no school fees were applied to girls.

(b)   setting up a girls' schooling network composed of community authorities, NGOs, parents, teachers and students active in promoting education for girls. The objective is to sensitize parents to the importance of educating their girls.

(c)   establishment of boarding facilities for girls in each region (*département*) of the country. The five best primary school girl pupils from each district (*sous-préfecture*) are housed there while they continue their studies in secondary school.

(d)   creation of a section in the Ministry (within the planning department) dedicated to girls' schooling matters. This section was charged with:

•   implementing government policy for improved education opportunities for girls;

•   developing programs and action plans that target the issue of girls' schooling and that will help to keep them in school and to promote them to higher levels; and

•   monitoring results.

(e)   development of school feeding programs in rural areas.

4.62   A number of problems and obstacles occurred over the course of program implementation that were, largely, related to: (i) resistance from some school directors who feared shortfalls in their school budgets; (ii) hostile reactions from boys who felt that the measures were discriminatory, and (iii) the girls' boarding hostels which were supposed to be managed and financed by local communities. They, however, often found it difficult to assume these responsibilities and were not always fully convinced of their utility.

4.63   Nonetheless, the results were very encouraging. From 1992/93 to 1997/98, the primary school GER for girls increased from 44% to 59% and their numbers went from 34% to 38% of total primary school enrollments. In three provinces the girls' GER increased by over 60%. For secondary education, there was a significant increase in girls attendance between 1995/96 and 1997/98. During this period, girls' enrollments increased by 35%, compared to 30% for boys; in three provinces girls' enrollments increased by over 50%. The major lesson drawn from this experience is the effectiveness of the school fee exemption policy and the need for its extension into urban areas.

4.64 The second intervention in Benin demonstrates how non-formal interventions can lead to increased enrollments in formal schools. This program (Educom) was based on action research conducted by an inter-disciplinary team that included educators, agriculturalists, sociologists and community development specialists. The research focused on 200 eight to fifteen year old out-of-school girls in four villages. It elaborated a participatory approach to developing the girls' capacities for autonomy and productive roles in their communities. Training needs and methods (including schedules, trainers, etc.) were defined by the girls and the communities.

4.65 Results were sufficiently convincing to extend this approach to 103 villages throughout the country in 1994. Villages were selected that: had low levels of female participation in formal schooling; were linguistically homogeneous; had a minimal level of administrative and peasant structures; and had a school with at least three grades. The training of facilitators included visits to similar projects in other countries (Mali, Togo, Tunisia). A chain of community, provincial and national committees was established to implement, supervise and monitor the program.

4.66 After four years, enrollments in the 30 schools increased by 35% for boys and doubled for girls. The key to this program is the "partnership contract" that is drawn up and negotiated with the communities during their village assemblies. Since a major objective was to promote a tighter level of school-community integration, school officials (i.e. inspectors, teachers) were involved and received some training. Key factors in the success of this program were: use of local languages in some schools; support for income generating, women's activities; a big sister program; greater community participation in school affairs; a monitoring structure; and use of facilitators and trainers who were from appropriate, local backgrounds. The major lessons drawn from this experience are: (i) the utility of action research to test hypotheses and create the instruments needed for effective social and educational innovations; (ii) the importance of close and sustained work with the community; (iii) the utility of using successful experiences such as this one to strengthen the educational system as a whole; and (iv) the necessity of taking into account their mothers' economic concerns.

4.67 Côte d'Ivoire focused on the provision of textbooks in order to incite girls to attend school in underprivileged and very rural areas (in the North and Northeast) of the country, where the primary GER fell from 39% in 1985 to 32% in 1991. Analyses of the situation in this region indicate that the causes of low female enrollments are both socio-cultural and economic. With input from external partners, a strategy was developed that focused on sensitization of families, training of pedagogical advisors ("conseillers pédagogiques") and the establishment of a textbook lending program for girls in 1783 primary schools in five northern regions of the country.

4.68 The sensitization program used methods of mass communication and more direct communication within local communities. Radio, television, color posters and a video tapes — all in both French and in local languages — were used to diffuse messages about the textbook lending scheme. More direct communication methods included meetings with the communities, individual discussions, family visits and presentations (in local languages) to local structures and traditional councils. The procurement and distribution was handled by the central office which managed the

project. School directors and local authorities played a role in stocking and managing the books at the local levels.

4.69   The result of these efforts, from 1993/94 to 1995/96, was a 24% increase in girls' enrollments in the five districts, varying from 16% in one district to 35% in another. There were a number of difficulties with the logistics of the operation (late deliveries, warehouse problems) and the poor physical quality of some books, as well as difficulties due to curricular reforms' necessitation of new books. On the whole, there was about a 12% loss due to wastage. Two major lessons emerged: (i) the target population accepted the project once they had been well informed of its objectives; and (ii) flexibility and adaptability in such an undertaking is essential.

4.70   In <u>Guinea</u>, in 1989, there were serious problems with access (GER of 27%) and equity (GER for girls of only 19%). About 25% of the pupils — most of them were girls — entering school dropped-out before completing primary school and about half of the pupils repeated at least one grade. It was in this context that the government initiated the "Nafa" program, with support from local communities and an external partner. This was part of a series of initiatives aimed at (i) improving access and reducing disparities between the sexes and between rural and urban areas, and (ii) encouraging the integration of girls into the socio-economic activities of the communities.

4.71   The "Nafa" centers were designed to include a set of measures and activities aimed at out-of-school, village girls. Village communities and parents are involved in the process of setting up and managing these centers. The curriculum is accelerated so that the girls can acquire a basic level of education and catch up to students already enrolled in formal schools. Pedagogical organization is flexible, which means that the girls have time to help their mothers with house work and other family duties, and vocational training is part of the curriculum. It is expected that the best pupils will be able to continue in formal schools; about 7% of these girls continue onto formal schools afterwards. These characteristics, along with strong political support, contributed to the success of this program which has provided a second chance for over 5,000 rural, out-of-schools girls to acquire education. Given the political support the program has received, as well as communities' sense of ownership, there is every reason to believe that this program will be sustained.

4.72   Two evaluations in 1997 and 1999 confirmed the results of this program. Also, six areas that need more attention if the program is to continue were identified. They are: (i) since skill learning may be the principal motivation of many participants, care must be taken to ensure that learning literacy and numeracy maintains its primary importance; (ii) the training of teachers/facilitators should be periodically renewed so that they will learn new pedagogical approaches; (iii) since girls tend to marry young, the preferred age of entry into the program should be 9-14 years rather than 10-16; (iv) lack of training makes it difficult for the local management committees to involve themselves in the pedagogical monitoring and equipment maintenance; (v) the declining economic conditions in some communities makes it more difficult for them to ensure the salaries of the teachers; and (vi) better knowledge of the costs and financing is needed.

4.73   <u>Tanzania</u> reports on a program which was initiated, with the support of external partners, to assist academically able girls from poor households in nine districts to attend and complete secondary schools. Girls are selected on the basis of their academic performance and their need their applications are then forwarded to village governments for discussion and final selection. This is a bursary, or scholarship, scheme that covers the costs of school fees, uniforms, books and supplies, and accommodation. This program supports 1,325 girls enrolled in 58 secondary schools; the drop-out rate for these girls is 4.1% as compared to the national figure of 32.6%. An evaluation also indicates that their performance "is improving"; it is higher than girls who have not benefitted from this program. Heightened awareness of the importance of secondary education for girls has been another outcome of this program.

4.74   In situation <u>Tchad</u> is similar to that of Benin: both socio-cultural and educational factors, both, constitute impediments to girls' enrollments. In the rural areas, girls tend to drop-out earlier than the boys. After a diagnosis of the situation done through a joint effort with an external partner, an incentive program designed to encourage girls' enrollments in four communities was implemented. This included the following aspects:
- a large scale sensitization campaign that used the public and private media, fora, meetings, and workshops;
- training of concerned teachers and facilitators;
- provision of school supplies, textbooks and a school uniform to each girl;
- subsidies to communities to enable income generating activities and to alleviate typical feminine work (provision of grain mills, domestic labor saving devices, etc.);
- provision of food rations through the World Food Program (WFP);
- elimination of school fees for girls;
- elimination of age restrictions for girls who enrol in school;
- creation of early childhood care so that girls who were traditionally responsible for this kind of work were able to attend school;
- inclusion of household matters (home economics) in the curriculum; and
- establishment of quotas for the recruitment of female teachers.

4.75   Four years after the program was established the results were encouraging in that the number of girls in school increased by 23% and their percentage of the overall school population went from 34.9% to 37.6%. This progress was not without problems, most of which were related to the socio-cultural and economic issues. Furthermore, technical and logistical problems may make this experience difficult to generalize.

4.76   Several lessons have been drawn from this experience:
- patience is required as results are slow;
- the decisive factor was the mobilization of human, material, logistical and financial resources;
- increasing girls' enrollments stimulated the enrollments of boys whose numbers increased at a rate similar to that of the girls; and
- legislative measures in favor of improved educational opportunities for girls need to be envisaged.

4.77   The <u>Female Participation Working Group</u>, through FAWE, reports on initiatives taken by FAWE's national chapters in Ghana, Kenya and Uganda that have established bursary schemes to promote the participation and success of girls in school. In addition to the bursary activities themselves, it is particularly interesting to note that these initiatives are independent of government and are made possible by the fund-raising activities of the national FAWE chapters.

(a)   In <u>Ghana</u>, this scheme has enabled 15 girls to receive scholarships since 1996. Without this financial support, they would not have been able to continue their post-primary studies. Emulation of this program has been an important outcome: some District Assemblies have instituted scholarship schemes which benefit girls more than boys.

(b)   In <u>Kenya</u>, the scheme was started in 1996. It has been financed through fund-raising efforts, including two golf tournaments and other events advertised through radio, television and letters of invitation sent to companies. Key people such as prominent politicians and businessmen are invited as guest speakers for fund raising events. The bursaries are for secondary school and are awarded on the basis of a set of criteria that includes both need and academic excellence.

(c)   In <u>Uganda</u>, the FAWE chapter (collaborating with "Action for Development") has set up a bursary scheme that currently caters to 90 girls in primary schools and four in secondary schools. Funds from the bursary scheme are used for gender awareness seminars, training of female teachers, guidance and counseling services for girls and awards for school fees, materials and uniforms.

4.78   FAWE also reports on the impact of separate units on girls education in the ministries of Burkina Faso and Guinea. In Burkina Faso a specialized unit was established in 1989. Advocacy is a major part of its activities, in addition to coordination and supervision of female education at the national level. After the establishment of this unit, girls enrollment rates went from 24% in 1991 to 34% in 1998. In Guinea, the unit was known as "Equity"; this may have contributed to the fact that girls' enrollments have increased 1.6 times faster than that of boys.

4.79   In <u>Tanzania</u>, the FAWE chapter developed a program called "Tuseme" (which means "let us speak out") which aims at empowering girls to speak out, express their concerns, identify solutions, and take action to solve the problems that hinder their social and academic development. The project was started by the University of Dar es Salaam with support from an external partner and was implemented in seven secondary schools. It goal was to address problems such as: school drop-outs, poor academic achievement, pregnancy, sexual harassment, and any other gender-related problems identified by the girls themselves. The project used theater, small group discussions, and workshops — all leading up to a festival that was opened by the First Lady and attended by over 3000 people, including government officials, teachers, students, parents and representatives from international and local NGOs. According to most of the teachers at the participating schools, "Tuseme" has improved the assertiveness, the confidence, and the academic and social performance of the girls who took part in the festival.

Promoting access to early childhood education

4.80   Zanzibar increased its gross enrollment ratio for early childhood education (ECE) from 2.8% in 1988 to 86.2% in 1998 through the development of partnerships between Government, religious authorities that controlled Koranic education, and an external partner. This achievement is mainly attributable to the policy to utilize private schools, which contributed to over 80% of the ECE enrollment increase, and to the recognition of the role of Koranic schools, which developed a program to integrate religious and secular education at this level. Such partnership would not have been possible if strong advocacy and dialogue had not taken place between the authorities and the Moslem community leaders who were suspicious of government's motives.

4.81   This rapid growth in early childhood education was facilitated by a number of factors:
*   The revision of pre-school education policy in 1991 which sensitized the community to the importance of early childhood education;
*   The use of pre-school education for screening admission into Standard 1 because of shortage of school places and the awareness of parents that pre-school education increases their children's chances of success in primary school;
*   The changing socio-economic environment, which resulted in many mothers working full time outside their homes.
*   The decision to include Koranic schools as providers of ECE by encouraging them to combine secular education with religious education; and
*   The community's participation in building and running pre-schools which helped improve local knowledge and understanding of the benefits of ECE.

4.82   A significant aspect of this experience is that more girls than boys are enrolled in ECE; the GER for girls is 93% compared to 79% for boys. Two factors may account for this: (i) the deployment of female teachers to serve as role models in areas where parents refuse to send their daughters to school; and (ii) the modification of the criterion for selection of pupils into Standard 1 (first grade of primary school) from age-based standards to policy mandating that 50% of these students should be girls.

4.83   Equatorial Guinea also reports on its non-formal pre-school program. Working with an external partner, and beginning in 1989, this program necessitated strong support from government and participation by the communities who were involved in the construction of 268 pre-school centers. Particular efforts went into the training of community teachers, especially women, school construction, curriculum development, and the provision of school meals. Over 5,000 children benefitted from this experience which had positive consequences on primary education. This included an increase in first grade enrollments and reduced repetition rates in the first two grades of primary school.

Education provision under conflict situation

4.84   Liberia's civil war lasted from December 1989 to 1998; throughout that period primary and secondary school enrollments varied between about 365,000 and 320,000. Then in 1999 enrollments increased by 77%. The existence, and persistence, of institutional structures was a major factor in the survival of education and

demonstrates the importance — under extreme circumstances — of a well-knit institutional fabric. Several examples stand out:

- The Catholic Archdiocese of Monrovia remained active, especially during periods of peace under the West African Peace Keeping Force. During the period of conflict, 30% of the Catholic schools were either rebuilt or renovated and the Catholic authorities facilitated the reception and distribution of textbooks sent by overseas humanitarian sources;
- The National Teachers Association made significant contributions to the teaching profession during the conflict situation. As schools closed and teachers went into exile, the leadership of the Association remained active. When the peace-keeping force arrived, the Association was ready to resume its activities and mobilize teachers from within the country and outside. This was important since (i) it helped reduce the emigration of teachers, (ii) succeeded in bringing public schools together to solicit assistance from national and international NGOs, (iii) brought back most teachers as volunteers, a group which constituted 40% of the teaching force, and (iv) helped to organize trauma healing workshops for teachers who remained in the education system and taught throughout the war.
- The West African Examinations Council (WEAC)/Liberia resumed its activities as soon relative peace was restored to Monrovia. By not concentrating its efforts on a particular warring factional area, WEAC was able to continue to conduct the National Certificate Examinations throughout the country, as well as in refugee schools housed by neighboring countries.

4.85   Another factor that enabled the survival of schooling was community management of schools. This had not existed before the war and was one of the major weaknesses of the country's education system. Related to this are the refugee schools which were initially conceived with the intent to keep refugee children busy and off the streets. These developments involved active Parent-Teacher Associations and crash-course teacher training.

4.86   The lessons drawn from this experience include:
- Factional boundaries can be transcended when established institutions offer exceptional services during a period of crisis.
- Success was predicated on the taking of initiatives.
- Community mobilization is essential.

Provision of physical facilities

4.87   <u>Lesotho</u> reports on its Education Facilities Unit whose task was to alleviate overcrowding due to the fact that 32% of schools were located in church halls. Site selection based on six criteria related to overcrowding, the quality of existing facilities and expected demographic trends. A number of instruments were used in the selection process: school profiles, a geographical information system; inspection reports, recommendations from community leaders, and site survey reports. Ample use was made of statistical indicators. External partners played a central role in financing this program and the procurement processes included international competitive bidding.

Improving access to secondary school

4.88   Burundi reported on the establishment of community secondary schools, designed as a response to the increasing pressures for secondary school entrance that resulted from expanded primary school enrollments in the 1980s. By the early 1990s, secondary schools had become overcrowded and quality had declined. To counter this problem, government established five experimental community secondary schools in 1991 followed by 13 the next year. These schools were built and are equipped by the communities who also make cash contributions (somewhat like a graduated school tax) that vary from a minimum of US$1 upward to $200 per person. Their curricula are the same as for government schools. Government assumes the costs of the teachers, administrative personnel, books and other didactic materials, and provides pedagogical supervision. In addition to increasing secondary school enrollments, objectives included: gradual elimination of secondary school boarding facilities; reduction of regional disparities; and increased enrollment of girls.

4.89   Because of this policy, the number of secondary schools went from 92 in 1990 to 329 in 1998; 237 of these are community schools. The introduction of these new schools is associated with the following results (from 1990/91 to 1998/99):
*   there was an 800% increase in non-boarding, secondary school students;
*   the number of classrooms increased by 143%;
*   admission rates into government secondary schools declined from 8.4% in 1991 to 4.7% in 1997 and in 1996; however, many students who do not succeed the admission exam go to private or community schools; on the whole, about 25% of all primary school leavers enter secondary school;
*   the proportion of girls in secondary schools increased from 35.5% to 46.7%; one study showed that girls were a majority of 52% in the community schools, whereas they remained a minority of 36% in the government secondary schools (entrance into which requires passing the entrance exam).

4.90   A major lesson drawn from this experience is that the social demand for post-primary education remains high, to the point where communities are ready and willing to contribute on a collective basis. Village leaders see the construction of a community school as proof of their own success vis-à-vis that of the community and that of government.

4.91   Tanzania reports on a community secondary school program that was engendered as a response to the public sector's inability to address (i) pressures of increased primary school graduates seeking entrance to secondary school, and (ii) the need to maintain existing rates of transition from primary to secondary levels. In this case, schools are built by the communities. Government provides teachers, other staff, instructional materials and equipment; it also manages the schools. This program has increased enrollments in secondary education by nearly 46,000 between 1986 and 1997. These new schools have an admissions policy whereby boys and girls are admitted in equal numbers. This policy has contributed to an increase in the proportion of girls in secondary schools from 33% in 1988 to 45% in 1997.

4.92   Tanzania also reports on a program intended to expand access to secondary education through evening classes held by the Institute of Adult Education. This program uses 145 schools in 20 Regional Centers, each of which is responsible for a

cluster of schools. In 1997 there were 13,000 enrolled in the evening classes from Forms 1-6. This program is estimated to be 50% less expensive than private secondary schools.

4.93   <u>Tchad</u> encouraged the recruitment of non-civil service teachers into secondary education as a means to meet demand within the context of government's freeze on civil service recruitment. Since 1997, 1,000 higher education graduates have been recruited as Civic Service Teacher Volunteers; they represent 50% of all secondary school teachers. They serve in addition to the 558 teachers recruited and paid by parents' and community associations. 90% of the costs of running public secondary schools (excluding the salaries of civil service teachers) comes from parents' associations. This program is supported by an external partner.

Improving access to higher education

4.94   The <u>South Africa</u> case study focuses on policies concerned with equity and redress in student access, particularly in reference to African students' participation and success in higher education studies. This focus embodies the educational debates and student political struggles of the late 1980s and early 1990s, many of which dealt with issues of access, seen then as central to the transformation of higher education practices. The policies reported in this case study are closely related to the South Africa's emergence from the era of apartheid. In this context, the major challenges have been to:

*   bring into a single coherent national framework all higher education institutions (technikons, universities and colleges);
*   broaden access to meet society's development needs and to ensure access for those previously excluded;
*   regulate quality and ensure greater efficiency in terms of student throughput rates; and
*   increase institutional capacity in responding to the demands of massification and of a diversifying student constituency.

4.95   A series of milestone policy documents were elaborated in the mid-1990s that developed a program for the transformation of higher education. The resulting recommendations, along with the deliberate actions of higher education institutions — in anticipation and in response to national policy and planning frameworks — have contributed to the marked change in the student composition of higher education institutions in South Africa. The proportion of black African (i.e. in terms of race group classification) students in all higher education institutions (universities and technikons, combined) increased from 29% in 1988 to 41% in 1993 and then to 57% in 1998 (from 1988 to 1993 total enrollments increased by 45%). There was another 11% increase in black African enrollments from 1993 to 1998. During the apartheid era, most institutions of higher education were segregated, with the "historically advantaged" (i.e., mostly white) institutions being of generally better quality. It is therefore particularly significant to note that the proportion of African students in these institutions rose from 4% in 1988 to 14% in 1993 and to 40% in 1998.

4.96   Since the late 1980s and early 1990s, institutions of higher education have used a variety of strategies and approaches to meet the national access goals. The South

Africa case study singles out six dimensions or elements to illustrate improved access: systems management; regional partnerships; access to key fields of study; new modes of delivery; curriculum change; and testing. Taken together, the six dimensions constitute examples of management and achievement of increased access across the higher education sector. Specific instances are chosen — not as the only examples of achievement — but to present at programme, institutional and regional levels the diversity of ideas that inform and shape current understanding of access and the complexities associated with its achievement.

4.97 *Systems Management.* Technikon Pretoria, with over 23,000 students, demonstrates how a systems management approach is used in responding to a rapidly changing student profile. This approach brought about a 67% increase in enrollments between 1994 and 1999 and increased the proportion of African students from 25% to 64%. This was made possible by: (i) a willingness to change evidenced by the establishment of appropriate management and governance structures aimed at fostering a climate of institutional trust, transparency and accountability; (ii) the integration of academic and support services, making possible a "matrix team approach" for restructuring and planning; (iii) the creation of a sophisticated database providing the information "backbone" for all the strategic planning; and (iv) the availability of this information to all managers and academic staff. Although the major challenge — to improve success and throughput rates for all student groups — remains, this example illustrates the importance of building institutional capacity in order to respond to the demands for increased access and the needs of a rapidly diversifying student constituency.

4.98 *Regional Partnerships*. The structural location of the Career Preparation Program (CPP) within the Free State Further and Higher and Training Trust (FSFHTT) illustrates the importance of regional partnerships in ensuring equity and redress in regions that are rural and are characterized by slow socio-economic growth. This approach is working towards the creation of a new regional dispensation of higher and further education in the Free State, with a view to co-ordinated strategic projects that allow for both bilateral and multilateral interaction — the CPP being one such project. Processes and projects are inclusive of education institutions and of major external stakeholders in business, industry and the broader community. The CPP targets marginalized youth in the Free State region. Although the major challenge remains to improve enrollments and student success rates, the programme has helped: (i) contribute to the transformation of partner institutions by increasing the growth in African student numbers; (ii) elevate the status of colleges in the community; (iii) hasten the official acceptance of English as a second medium of instruction; and (iv) effect curriculum change. Furthermore, the structural location of the CPP highlights both the problems and the advantages of regional partnerships. Important constraints are: (i) institutional implementation capacity; and (ii) the need for state incentives and support from external partners (domestic and foreign) in order to make possible the programme's long-term viability.

4.99 *Key Fields of Study*. In order to improve access to key fields of study at a "historically disadvantaged" institution, the UNIFY (University Foundation Year) project was set up at the University of the North (UNIN). The target group of the UNIFY project is African secondary school graduates who do not qualify for admission to the faculties of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Health Sciences and Agriculture on the basis of

their school-leaving results. The main goals of the project are: (i) to provide students with the opportunity to prepare for entry into science degree programmes; (ii) to increase the numbers of students in the UNIN science faculties; and (iii) to increase the quality of first year students. Although a number of challenges remain, this project has demonstrated increasingly high completion rates, going from 59% in 1993 to 87% in 1998, with over 95% continuing on to register in UNIN. This has been achieved largely through academic partnerships for curriculum design and assessment, a pedagogical approach that includes learner-centered and small group interaction, as well as financial support and residential accommodation for selected students. It is the intensive and small-scale intervention, however, that now presents the project's major challenge — to mainstream its practices, thereby reaching larger numbers of students and, in doing so, ensuring the programme's sustainability.

4.100 *New modes of delivery.* The Telematics Learning System (TLS) of the Potchefstroom University for Christian Higher Education (PUCHE) uses new modes of delivery to access a diverse range of students through a learning system. Entitled "without frontiers", this system's notable characteristics include: (i) affordability; (ii) high quality; (iii) an efficient student support system consisting of subject specialists at study centres across the country; and (iv) international accreditation and support. A total of 4,760 students are enrolled in 1999, 81% of whom are Africans, mostly between the ages of 26-40 years. Four factors stand out as pivotal to the efficiency, economic viability and quality of the programs: (i) a matrix management model to ensure economic viability; (ii) collaborative partnerships, agreements and support; (iii) staff capacity and development; and (iv) quality assurance. Although the TLS has achieved its aim of broadening the social base of learners who will ultimately gain access to higher education study, the very nature of distance delivery modes places new demands on a range of practices at institutions traditionally adapted to contact teaching. Pivotal is the importance of on-going quality assurance and an information technology management system that monitors learners, programmes and systems, and is appropriate to both distance and residential contexts.

4.101 Curriculum change. Core courses and resource-based teaching at first level degree study at the University of Natal (UND) both illustrate the important link between increasing access and ensuring learners' success through curriculum change. Core courses in the faculty of Human Sciences are used to illustrate the need for "foundation" courses to prepare learners for degree programmes, or direct them to the exit points for certificate or diploma levels. An intensive materials-based teaching programme in the Faculty of Community and Development Disciplines, on the other hand, illustrates curriculum adaptation in response to large classes and to the needs of a diverse learner constituency. Reasons for academic restructuring and curriculum change at this institution relate to: (i) a particular history of access to innovation, research and development; (ii) an institutional vision and set of strategic initiatives related to "Quality with Equity"; and (iii) a receptiveness to the dual national demands of equity and development. The major implication for achieving improved access is that increasing access and, therefore, learner diversity, impacts a range of institutional practices. Central to this is the need to adapt and change curricula in order to ensure quality and success.

4.102 *Testing.* The University of Cape Town (UCT) — South Africa's oldest and historically elite university — uses testing for admissions and placement through an alternative

admissions research programme. This programme has implemented a system of testing applicants who do not meet the entry requirements of particular faculties. In recent years, the programme has extended its services to a range of higher education institutions in South Africa. At present its tests are used at 22 of the 36 institutions. Since 1990, this program has admitted 1,806 students who have a completion rate of about 75%. Several reasons are given for the achievement and sustainability of this testing system: (i) institutional support based on both the perceived need for testing and the performance of the students admitted; (ii) the structural location of the programme within the institution's Centre for Higher Education Development, which makes interaction with educational and curriculum development activities possible; (iii) participation in research and national policy initiatives (for example, policy research into the effectiveness of the school-leaving exam); and (iv) strong management capacity in the implementation of the testing system. Using such testing as an approach to increasing access presents a particular challenge: achieving fairness and accuracy, rather than allowing testing to serve as a "gatekeeping" device that runs counter to the principles of equity.

QUALITY and RELEVANCE

Improving teacher quality

4.103   Lesotho instituted a Primary In-service Education Program (PIEP) in 1988 in order to upgrade the quality of its teachers. The program received technical and financial support from external partners. A key feature of this program is that it brings services for teacher development and support close to the schools and to the classrooms. A group of District Resource Teachers (DRT) was developed to serve as the main agent for delivering school-based professional support to teachers in multi-grade schools. The program, based at the Ministry of Education, works largely through five Senior Resource Teachers (SRT), each of whom manages two districts. Each of the 10 districts then has a DRT. The SRT facilitate, coordinate, supervise and monitor the work of the DRTs. The DRT main role is to visit schools, to deliver advisory support to the school administrator and to conduct clinical instructional supervision. The content of the PIEP includes teaching methodology, classroom management, child development, assessment and evaluation skills, school administration, materials development, and community and parent involvement in the school.   The major achievements of the PIEP are reported to be remarkable in terms of classroom instruction and management.

4.104   Uganda has made a concerted effort to reduce the proportion of unqualified teachers since the launching of UPE. The proportion of qualified teachers rose from 52% in 1989 to 69% in 1995 and to 72% in 1999. From 1995 to 1999, 7,800 teachers received in-service training. A teacher incentive upgrading process was also put in place to attract and help retain qualified teachers. Though still underpaid, teachers have seen their salaries increase substantially, going from U.Shs. 2,700 per month in 1989 to 75,000 (or about US$50) in 1999.

4.105   Uganda also established a Teacher Development and Management System that functions in a similar manner to the Lesotho and the Botswana systems. The schools are organized into clusters of about 18 each. Within every cluster, one school is

designated as a coordinator and, within that school, one tutor is assigned. The tutor's role is to assist the community, parents, teachers, and head-teachers in improving behaviors and practices that enhance pupil learning. The tutor delivers this support during visits to the school. The tutor is supervised by the outreach administrator of a Core Primary Teacher Colleges, 18 of which supervise about 550 schools. The organizational structure for the delivery of teacher support includes: the central Ministry of Education; the Coordinating Centers, each with a Coordinating Center Tutor or Outreach Tutor; a Core Primary Teacher Training College; individual schools and communities. Each of these units provides a variety of inputs. For instance, in an effort to ensure that families and communities support learners, the unit provides a model school in each area to serve as an example for other schools, community leaders and parents.

4.106   Since 1995 the results are as follows: 554 Coordinating Centers, each with a Tutor, and 54 Primary Teacher College Administrative Units have been established to support the Coordinating Centers; about 13,000 untrained teachers have been or are being upgraded; about 8,500 head teachers have undergone school management training at a certificate level (there are about 97,000 teachers in 1999); and 22,229 volunteers have been trained through the community mobilization process so as to harness community support for fund raising, for provision of building materials and labor, and for involvement in school management.

Language of instruction policies

4.107   <u>Mali</u>'s introduction of experimental "convergent pedagogy" in 1987 was prompted by a steady decline in the quality of primary schools where the repetition rates were 29% and the drop-put rates 16%. This is an active pedagogy that is more child-centered than traditional approaches and uses mother tongue instruction (eight languages are presently used) in the first three years of primary school. French, which is the language of instruction for the subsequent grades, is introduced in second grade; it is taught along with the mother tongue in third grade, after which the pupil moves towards functional bilingualism. Pupils are expected to take an active role in their learning which is organized as team work, with the teacher serving as a facilitator. Presently, there are about 39,000 pupils in these classes (about 4% of primary school enrollments). One objective of this new pedagogy is to facilitate a more natural transition into the use of French. Four strategies are used in its implementation: community sensitization; teacher training; production and use of appropriate teaching materials; and employment of active, learner-centered teaching methods. It is expected that this approach will be generalized.

4.108   Two evaluations have been conducted. Although the results of these evaluations do not allow strict comparisons with the traditional schools, they do indicate positive results in: comprehension; oral and written expression; French; and mathematics. Rates of promotion into secondary school also seem to have improved. In general, it appears that the pupils learning under the new pedagogy have a clear advantage over those in more traditional schools. Difficulties include: choosing the language of instruction; ensuring that teachers are adequately trained to teach in the chosen language; and adequately producing and distributing teaching materials.

4.109   <u>Niger</u> introduced in 1972 an experimental program using national languages along with active and participatory pedagogical methods The need for such a program was identified based upon observation of the poor quality and poor results of the traditional, French-language schools. This program remained in its experimental phase until 1998, when a law authorized its extension. During the experimental phase, national languages were used as the language of instruction and French was taught as a subject until grade 4. As of grade 5, French became the medium of instruction. Presently only 5,000 pupils (or about 1% of all primary school pupils) are enrolled in the 42 schools using this method.

4.110   Four evaluations have clearly demonstrated the effectiveness of this approach. Results show that:
•   rates of success on the French part of the primary school leaving exam are about three times higher for the experimental schools than for the traditional, all-French language schools;
•   repetition and drop-out rates are much lower (by a factor of 9!) in the experimental schools;
•   class size in the experimental schools is much smaller, with 20-25 pupils per teacher as compared to 50-90 in the traditional classes;
•   when comparing the 18 experimental schools with traditional schools, test scores in all subjects are better for pupils in the experimental schools; the positive effect of the experimental school is more pronounced in grade 3 than in grade 6.
In spite of these results, the bilingual curricula have yet to be applied throughout the system.

Cost-effective provision of curricular and instructional materials

4.111   <u>Uganda</u> has taken several steps to redress the acute shortage of books and instructional materials. A study conducted in 1995 (covering only 24 schools) estimated a ratio ranging from 40 to 55 learners per textbook for the major subjects. In response to this situation, a national book policy was formulated that liberalized supply and procurement, as well as systematized the vetting of books and instructional materials. The liberalization process helped to break the monopoly of textbook supplies which was hitherto enjoyed by the National Curriculum Development Center (NCDC). In addition to breaking that monopoly, the liberalization ensured a wider range of books and therefore a broader choice for schools, teachers and learners. Subsequent competition amongst textbook suppliers also improved quality and efficiency. A major step toward quality assurance was the setting up of a transparent process of vetting textbooks and other instructional materials. A vetting committee that includes all major stakeholders was set up to select books and to ascertain their suitability. Suppliers are invited to submit their books for vetting; they pay a fee for this service. The policy allows for the discrete budgeting of curriculum and instructional materials, and for the allocation of funds to districts and schools proportionate to enrolments. The District Inspector of Schools takes responsibility for the allocation of funds at the district level. In 1993, following formulation of the policy, an Instruction Materials Unit (IMU) was set up in the Ministry of Education and Sports to improve the efficiency of the procurement, distribution and delivery of curriculum and instructional materials. By 1999 the IMU had purchased over four million textbooks and delivered them to 8,500 state-aided schools, as well as to 800,000 supplementary readers. As a result, there are now 6 learners per textbook.

4.112   Zimbabwe's Secondary Science Project (Zim-Sci) is an indigenous, original and innovative response to shortages of qualified science teachers, teaching space, equipment, and curriculum and instructional materials. Key elements of the project include specialized equipment, as well as project-specific curriculum and instructional materials. The equipment comprises low-cost, simple and less conventional science apparatus kits which can be used in the absence of laboratories, electricity, gas supplies and running water. To the extent possible, the equipment is adapted from locally available materials such as coke tins instead of beakers, lamps instead of Bunsen burners, etc. Having eliminated the need for sophisticated laboratories and equipment, this approach is 40 times cheaper than the conventional mode of science teaching.

4.113   The project developed tailor-made curriculum, syllabi and instructional manuals to accompany the equipment. The curriculum attained higher contextual relevance by integrating concerns for health, nutrition, industry and environment into its content. A combination of elaborate manuals and less intimidating equipment has made it easier for less qualified teachers to teach science. In addition, classroom support systems have been built into the syllabus to improve teaching quality and to sharpen the learning outcomes. Other elements of the ZIM-Sci include its adaptability to the large class sizes and wide ability ranges induced by expanded access and use of learner-centered approaches.

4.114   Since the introduction of the Zim-Sci, over 1,000 (or about 78% of all) secondary schools have received the equipment and instructional manuals. Evaluations of the project have reported comparable student performance with that of conventional science teaching. Over time, the negative dispositions toward this initiative have faded away One of the strengths of Zim-Sci was the built-in mechanism for response to challenges that emerged in the process of project implementation. They were:

- The shortage of qualified science teachers. Most of the teachers who initially taught Zim-Sci were primary school teachers or untrained teachers who were given short-term in-service training to teach science. A 1984 evaluation of the program revealed that 84% of the teachers using the Zim-Sci method were not qualified to teach at that level. To this effect, the Quality Education in Science Teaching (QUEST) project was instituted as an extension of the Zim-Sci. This is mainly an in-service teacher training program which uses skill transfer as the main mode of delivery, and is based on the cascade model. The cascading offers a faster multiplier effect than the regular in-service training.
- The second challenge was the stigma associated with the Zim-Sci. This stigma was reinforced by the fact that Zim-Sci was intended to allow previously disadvantaged groups access to science. Private schools therefore tended not to use the Zim-Sci curriculum for fear of watering down their standards. This problem was resolved by the integration of the two curricula into a unitary national science curriculum. The integration of the two curricula was accompanied by strong advocacy, mainly by the Ministry of Education, for support and acceptance of the program.
- The third challenge was related to the ownership of the project. Being an offshoot of a university research project, Zim-Sci was run by the university science education center for almost four years. The teachers were recruited and paid by a grant from the university which afforded them lower salaries than those of regular teachers. Later in the processes, the salary scale of these pioneers created a disincentive. Because of the project's origin, the Ministry did not have a strong sense of ownership

of the project or its teaching staff. The marginal status of the initiative threatened its very existence. In 1984, the Ministry, in consultation with the university, took the project over and took it to scale. Implementation procedures were thence on normalized.

4.115   Evaluations have documented evidence of the impact of Zim-Sci. Several evaluations have commended it for its low cost, hands-on approach to science teaching. Most notably, more and more of the Zim-Sci students successfully complete their "O"Levels, proceed to the highly selective "A" Level, and continue all the way to institutions of higher learning. An excellent test of the effectiveness, quality and adaptability of the Zim-Sci is the adoption of its methodology to other contexts: Botswana adapted this concept to develop its "science by investigation" program; and South Africa's Kwazulu-Natal province also adopted the idea of the Zim-Sci. Discussions are afoot between Zimbabwe and Eritrea to find the most suitable way of adopting the idea to yet another context.

Relevance of Vocational/Technical Training

4.116   Madagascar reports on a policy aimed at improving the cost-effectiveness, the quality and the relevance of vocational/technical training (VTT) that was implemented in collaboration with an external partner. This policy is based on a 1996 national survey of over 700 employers that showed the skills and the adaptability to new technologies of their employees' to be the most significant constraints to further investment and growth for their firms. This finding led to the development of partnerships between the government VTT organization, an external financing partner, and regional associations of employers. These partnerships worked to create VTT programs designed to respond directly to the needs of the labor market. Needs for three forms of training were articulated: (i) highly focused on-the-job training designed to enable employees' adaptation to new technologies; (ii) skill training for job seekers; and (iii) training designed to allow employees and job seekers to change their skills profiles in order to suit the new demands of the labor market.

4.117   The system was put into place in 1997 and is only beginning to provide results. Financing comes from a fund whose sustainability is the responsibility of the organizations (firms, NGOs, or local governments) that benefit from the program. It is based on three principles:
*   privatization, with the creation of a development fund which is managed by associations entitled to collect and oversee the contributions of firms;
*   regionalization, which initially encouraged firms to establish regional training associations; and
*   a gradual approach, beginning with technical and financial assistance given to these regional training associations by government's VTT organization.
The training program, itself, is a contractual relationship that engages external financing partners, employers, training institutions (private and public), and employees.

4.118   Although it is too soon talk of success, as quantitative results are presently limited to 170 graduates, several lessons have been drawn:
*   employers are aware of the importance of VTT;
*   employers need to be part of the training process in order to maximize results; and

- a partnership and participation approach is essential.

4.119   Zimbabwe's Informal Sector Training and Resources Network (ISTARN) project was initiated in a rural province with 8% urban population, an unemployment rate of 30%, and about half of the population below the age of 15. Many of the area's unemployed are youths who have completed some form of schooling. The Project was initiated in 1994 as a joint venture with an external partner. Its objective was to provide the training necessary for youths to set up their own businesses. The project provides skills training through partnerships between vocational institutes and elements of the informal sector, i.e. traditional apprenticeship, business advice service and credit, and marketing support. The project also mobilizes informal sector firms to form associations to promote that sector's interests, such as access to credit, business stands, etc. Before the project began, a baseline survey was conducted to establish a basis for evaluating its effectiveness.

4.120   Seven public training institutions have participated in the program by offering training in skills that were identified by the survey to be in demand in the area. Course duration ranges between 3-10 weeks and is followed by a longer period of attachment as a traditional apprentice to an enterprise. The enterprise owner is provided with an appraisal form outlining the skills that the apprentice is expected to have mastered by the end of the attachment period.

4.121   In addition, a Small Business Advisors (SBA) Service was established to work both with apprentices who have graduated and aim to set up their own businesses and with other entrepreneurs who request the service. A key element of this component is a credit of Z$300 (currently about US$10) which is extended to such graduates. This credit comes in the form of an equipment loan, payable over a period of 3 months at 15% interest. Depending on the performance of the business, recommendations can be made to an established Trust, which supports small enterprises for bigger loans.

4.122   The design of ISTARN requires the mobilization of informal sector entrepreneurs in order to make it effective. It has therefore become necessary to form associations within the informal sector to promote the project's interests. To this end, ISTARN assisted in the formation of 7 informal sector associations whose functions are to select trainees and to procure raw materials in bulk. The materials are then sold to their members (including project graduates) at lower prices. Seed money for the venture was provided by the project and from membership fees.

4.123   One of the biggest constraints to the development of the informal sector enterprises is marketing. In order to make this project successful, the issue of marketing had to be addressed. The concept of market intermediaries was developed. Market intermediaries are individual entrepreneurs who look for job opportunities offered by bigger companies and then sub-contract them to small businesses for a "commission". From this concept, the Market Intermediary Support Program was born. The program attempts to achieve increased market opportunities for informal sector businesses by linking them to big businesses in the formal sector.

4.124   About 317 apprentices have gone through the program so far. A tracer study survey conducted on the first and the second cohorts of graduates totaling 74 revealed that 56% were self employed, 32% were employed by others and only 12% were

unemployed. An important factor is that 52 % of the graduates are using skills and knowledge acquired during training.   Other factors that make the program successful are the design of the project, the flexibility in funding, and its ongoing monitoring and evaluation process, which allows necessary modifications to be made.

CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT

Developing capacity for curriculum development

4.125   Namibia managed to develop national capacity for effective and efficient curriculum development and implementation virtually within a decade. The impetus for this was the attainment of independence and the need to redress prior inequalities and to afford all Namibians equitable access to relevant education. The National Institute of Educational Development (NIED) was thus given the in-house capacity to follow through the full curriculum development cycle and produce curriculum for the entire education system. NIED now has adequate professional staff, necessary machinery and equipment, and established infrastructure, and most of all, comprehensive and institutionalized processes and procedures that deliver high quality curricula effectively and efficiently.

4.126   Evidence of the effective delivery of this capacity includes the existence of: a unified standardized national curriculum for primary to senior secondary school levels; complete subject curricula for core and elective subjects for primary to senior secondary school levels; adequate curricula and complementary curricula materials such as teachers' guides and students' supplementary materials; and an instructional system that is based on progressive approaches such as learner centeredness, differentiated teaching and learning, multi-grade teaching and cross-curricula /thematic teaching. The curriculum is more relevant to the Namibian contexts than was previously the case. It also has relevance to issues such as gender, environment, HIV/ AIDS, etc.

4.127   Factors that explained this success are:
* Conviction at the highest level of the political spectrum of the need to redress inequalities;
* Strong professional leadership provided by professional educationists who were appointed to political positions of Minister, Deputy Minister, and Permanent Secretary;
* Articulation between the national education policy — however tacit — and the curriculum orientation;
* Articulation of curricula policies and consistency in their implementation. The national language policy is a clear example;
* The use of action research to inform the curriculum;
* The establishment of the National Institute of Educational Development (NIED) that took charge of curriculum development;
* Clear articulation of the roles of NIED;
* The establishment, under the general leadership of NIED, of a network of structures with complementary roles for curriculum development and implementation. These structures include the Ministry directorates, regional directorates, in particular, the directorate of National Examinations and Assessment, the Examination Board,

Curriculum Coordinating Committee, Curriculum Panels, Subject Working Groups and Committees;
- The technical and financial support of external partners, including national and international NGOs;
- The mobilization and utilization of expertise from outside NIED, for example from teacher training colleges, from the university, from colleges of education and from the private sector;
- Articulation of clear curriculum development procedures and processes, a key feature of which was inclusiveness of all stakeholders;
- Ability to match resource availability with tasks. Operationally this took the form of phasing curriculum reform. Moving one step at a time and consolidating at each level was the key strategy for developing capacity;
- A comprehensive approach to capacity development by which attention was given to the development of complementary capacities to curriculum development capacities such as teaching systems, examinations and student assessment systems, teacher training systems, etc; and
- Preparedness to invest in curriculum reform through direct training of personnel, provision of adequate infrastructure by the NIED, and provision of materials and equipment necessary to get the job done and done well.

4.128   As a result of this experience, a number of lessons are drawn from the Namibian experience:
- It is a slow, expensive, and labor intensive process which requires experienced expertise in a wide variety of areas;
- Attitudinal change is important in order to attain agreement and understanding;
- Financial resources and equipment should be thoroughly planned and utilized.
- Full commitment of staff supervisors is needed.
- Appointment of critical staff should be prioritized.
- Advanced technological resources (e.g., desktop publishing) are needed.
- Technical staff to execute design and layout is of great importance.
- Processes, procedures and mechanisms should be carefully designed to include all legitimate stakeholders, should be consistent, and should be kept in line with official regulations and programmes.
- Curriculum development instruments and guidelines to control and guarantee quality should be designed and applied.
- Communication on all levels should be maintained.
- Pro-active planning and continuous, innovative problem solving should be applied.
- Teachers from grass roots level should be involved and their participation should be acknowledged.
- Follow-up, monitoring and open debate are necessary.
- Pedagogical and methodological policies should be documented and presented to stakeholders for inputs.
- Development work addressing radical changes should always consider the practical situation and should be implemented gradually.
- It is necessary to create a climate for acceptance; a firm understanding of the development process should be secured throughout.

Education Management Information Systems

4.129   Côte d'Ivoire developed a management information system for secondary school students designed to: (i) have a clear view of student flows, including information needed to prevent multiple and/or illicit enrollments; (ii) improve the planning for teachers, equipment and budgetary requirements; and (iii) rationalize the organization of examinations. This involved gathering information about 600,000 students (each of whom was given an identification number) into one database. Data inputting can now be regionalized. The system can also be used to monitor the educational careers of students and provide detailed statistical analyses. Developed with an external partner, this project started with three-year (1995 - 1998) pilot programs in two districts.

4.130   Implementation began with a communication strategy that included posters, information leaflets, meetings held throughout the country between representatives from all concerned parties, and an information campaign conducted through print media, radio and television. Training local technicians in computer and organizational techniques was also a central part of the implementation strategy. A department was created in the Ministry for this very purpose.

4.131   A number of results are reported for this intervention.
*   Administration of student enrollments has been simplified; students no longer have to provide birth certificates or other information already included in the database. Students furnish only their identification number. This system is time-saving for both students and school administrators.
*   The changes have proven helpful in managing national examinations (Baccalauréat and lower secondary school exam), as the necessary information is stored in the database and in each student's computer file. The time it takes educational authorities to input forms has been cut by two-thirds; students' and parents' time is also saved.
*   Students' careers and grades are easily inputted into the system, thereby facilitating the monitoring of school results, the execution of student tracer studies, and the provision of timely feedback to the schools.
*   Statistical studies, facilitated by the student and school databases, are now possible. Results are fed back to the schools in a timely manner.

4.132   This was not an easy undertaking. Here are some of the difficulties that appeared. Their solutions in particular required modifications and adjustments to the initial strategy:
*   After the first pilot year, the need to complete the database before the end of the school year became clear. This necessitated the provision of computer hardware and software to the schools, as well as the introduction of an awareness campaign that arranged meetings with school directors.
*   About 5% of the students lacked birth certificates, the basis for each student's file.
*   Updating student records proved difficult during the first two years — so much so that only 60% of the work was accomplished. Updating methods were modified in the third year.
*   Maintenance of both hardware and software required special attention.
*   The skills and the stability of personnel involved are essential. Therefore, clear strategy and adequate working conditions for the technical staff are necessary components.

4.133   The different functions (relating to examinations, guidance, and statistics) of this database demonstrate its utility. The database brings to light a number of the organizational problems facing schools without computer systems and in which management is not empirically based. It also provides a means for effective decentralization, which requires detailed information at the local level.

4.134   <u>Namibia</u> had 11 nearly autonomous education authorities prior to independence; ten of these were linked to administrations representing ethnical groups. After Independence these authorities were integrated under one Ministry with decentralized regional offices. The need for information supporting policy formulation and decision-making in education became clear. The Namibian Education Management Information System (EMIS) and the Geographic Information System (GIS) for school mapping, a component of the EMIS, were started in 1991.

4.135   The development of the EMIS was systematic and adhered to a process that made the information collected relevant and user-friendly. The EMIS development process took into account the following factors: an inventory of users of education information; policy issues and operations within the education sector and related information needs; alternate means of presenting data to suit user needs; and sources from which data can be obtained. Thorough attention was given to the development of a database, to the acquisition of data collection instruments, to data processing, and to the reporting and presentation of information. The utilization of available information was promoted.

4.136   The process for the development of the EMIS was fueled by the need — as identified by senior policy makers in the Ministry, advisors and external partners — for comprehensive education information to guide them in their decision making. A small group of Namibian staff with the necessary expertise and dedication took on the task. With the help of external partners, funding was adequate and technical advice was procured.

4.137   The identification of major users of education information was carried out by the EMIS Division. The key users identified were management and staff of the Education Ministry, academic institutions, the private sector, international agencies, researchers and the general public. The forms of data presentation — for example, tables, graphs, and maps — were based on user needs. While the database structures remained fairly constant, the EMIS used different systems, and finally settled on a high-end relational database for reasons of processing speed, protection against file corruption, and data integrity. Extensive consistency checking was introduced in the data entry systems.

4.138   Consistent collection of data is essential for the success of an EMIS. Important elements of the system include completeness of data collection, correctness of data, comparability of data collected in successive years, and timeliness. The design of the questionnaires catered for numerous consistency checks. Between 1992 and 1998 all schools returned the questionnaires. This success is due to the collection method used. Questionnaires and procedures are, whenever possible, designed to reduce the tasks of the individuals involved in the data collection. Existing channels of communication and hierarchy within the Ministry are utilized. The questionnaires are sent and returned through Regional Offices. High-level management support enables

persistent demand for all questionnaires to be returned. Submitting data has become a routine task of heads of schools.

4.139 The GIS links the geographic co-ordinates of all schools with EMIS data, population census data, and relevant geographical features. The GIS allows geographical presentation of data . The system is presently used mainly for school mapping, while other applications are underutilized due to a shortage of staff. Developing the GIS required a high investment of working time.

4.140 Adequate staff and relevant expertise of that staff are vital to the maintenance of the EMIS. The EMIS Division has five professional staff members, an insufficient number to address the needs and continued development of both the EMIS and GIS. Staffing levels have varied in the past and have included long-term advisors and volunteers, who are drawn from external partners and serve for several years. Two clerks and three typists handle the entry of all data into the computer.

4.141 The development of the EMIS in Namibia has generated the following advantages:
• The existence of data which provides a significant amount of the information needs for policy development, decision-making, Ministry operations, and the general public;
• A means for consistent collection of educational statistics with very high return rates;
• The existence of a well-maintained database of educational data;
• Two Annual Reports on education;
• The capacity for quick response to requests for statistical information;
• The ability of GIS to link all schools to the EMIS database and provide information for school mapping; and
• The capacity to undertake research

4.142 Major lessons that have been learned from this experience are:
• An environment conducive to the development of an EMIS is essential, senior managers must experience a need for information and they must give their full support;
• The key steps of development are essential: determining the users; identifying the policy issues and activities to be supported with information; analyzing these issues and activities to establish information needs; designing ways of presenting information; identifying sources of data; and developing the database, questionnaire and data processing system. Data collection, data processing, presentation and utilization of information follow;
• Crucial elements of the development of EMIS include: determining the data set that is used, designing the database, implementing procedures and ensuring data integrity;
• Appropriate equipment and computer software is required and a high-end relational database system is recommended;
• Persistence and management-support are essential for 100% return rates of questionnaires;
• The content and layout of reports require much attention. Different levels and forms of presentation are often required for different purposes. Geographical presentation should be considered; and
• The major challenges posed are (i) the need to develop capacity to maintain the system, (ii) the collection of financial and adult education information, (iii) routine inclusion of quality and external efficiency information in the EMIS, and (iv) expansion of the accessibility of available information.

Examination and assessment systems

4.143 Namibia has established a National Examinations and Assessment System that was necessitated by reforms made to the curriculum. The key components of this system are:
- the development of a new philosophy to guide assessment policies and practices,
- the establishment of efficient structures for the governance and administration of examinations,
- the development of new examinations and other forms of assessment for the new education system,
- the development of administrative and professional procedures for efficient and secure conduct of national examinations, and
- the development of a computerized information system that can process examinations.

4.144 A major factor in the development of this system is the fact that assessment was viewed as formative, diagnostic and responsive, providing feedback to improve the quality of the education system. Manifestations of this broad view include:
- broadening the scope of assessment to include alternative modes and providing learners with a wider variety of opportunities and contexts for demonstration of their knowledge and skills;
- creating opportunities for authentic assessment, positive achievement, learner-centered education and best performance;
- strengthening a host of assessment tools and improving the fit between a tool and its purpose;
- emphasizing formative assessment in order to provide constructive feedback to virtually every aspect of the system;
- substantively linking assessment with curriculum, teaching and learning by making assessment cover the full scope of the curriculum. This, in turn, impels curriculum developers to produce balanced curricula so as to achieve an interactive relationship between examinations and other processes;
- placing less emphasis on examinations at lower levels and instead focusing on non-threatening confidence boosting procedures.; and,
- ensuring that examinations are valid, efficient, appropriately demanding, and of high integrity. This is particularly important given the high stakes of the outcomes.

4.145 The structure of the new examination system comprises:
- The administrative structures that oversee the new examination system. The National Examination Assessment and Certification Board was created in 1991 to oversee the new examinations. The Directorate of National Examinations and Assessment Authority and the regional examinations offices are the executive organs that administer the examinations. Each has institutional procedures within which they operate. The offices have enjoyed both prompt attention to their staffing needs and flexible, autonomous schemes of service to retain expertise.
- New examinations and alternative modes of examining students. Since 1991/92 the junior secondary examinations have been conducted in line with the new philosophy. Continuous assessment of the examination, which constitutes one-third to half the student's grade, has been initiated. The examination has been adapted to the deaf

and to the blind and has been made available to both full and part-time students. Specimen questions have been made available to teachers and learners to help familiarize them with the new examinations and examinations results have been published promptly.

- Teacher assessment in the intermediate grades. Two strategies are being used to improve the validity and quality of these examinations. Firstly, teaching syllabuses clearly stating the objectives and competencies for achievement have been developed. This clarity allows for use of on-going criterion reference testing, as well as total coverage at the end of the year. Secondly, the semi-external exams have been established for diagnostic assessment purposes and are aimed at validating the quality of the examinations.

- Professional and administrative procedures for conducting examinations. Quality control measures are in place for test item development. Moderation procedures ensure that examinations are balanced in terms of learning content, assessment domains, and difficulty level of their questions. Reliable marking and recording procedures are also in place. Efficient administrative procedures ensure security, communication and a highly effective computerized data processing system.

4.146 New practices brought about by the new assessment and examination system are:
- elimination of external examinations in the lower grades, limitation of repetition to once per cycle, and elimination of subject groupings in the upper grades;
- inclusion of continuous assessment;
- improvement of professional and administrative procedures which leads to better quality of examinations.
- improvement of security procedures which leads to a higher level of integrity for the examination and those who administer it.

There has been steady improvement in promotion, dropout and repetition rates; this could be attributable to the new assessment system.

4.147 The new philosophy was eclectically gleaned from the successful practices of other countries, especially as provided by the technical assistants of diverse development agency partnerships for intellectual inputs. The political will by Namibia to depart from the past, the appropriately timed response to dissatisfaction with the old examination, and the demand for reform of the curriculum and of the examination systems provided the impetus for development of a new system. Due to lack of funds and pressure to reform, short- term consultancies were used in lieu of long term research. Intelligent leadership coupled with clear interest led to the vision of an examination system aimed at promoting quality, equity, access and democracy in education.

4.148 A number of lessons have been learned from this experience:
- Credibility, efficiency, professionalism, integrity, and ritualistic adherence to times and dates are key elements in the development of an examination system, as it does not take much for confidence in the system to be lost.
- The examinations should be an integral part of the education system. They should closely assess the curriculum and should act in harmony with all components of the education system. They will otherwise induce great discord.
- It is important to have a clear philosophy for examinations and assessment and clear procedures to guide all operations.
- Quality examination syllabi can improve the quality, validity and balance of exams.

- Teachers clearly need assistance in order to develop tools and mechanisms for continuous assessment.
- Examining a broad range of subjects should be weighed against cost implications.
- There is a need for decisions to be made based on reliable information and a need for efficient communication.
- Above all, the development of an examination and assessment system must be considered as a continuous undertaking which should be monitored continuously and amended as necessary.

Developing capacities for Non-Formal Education

4.149   The <u>Working Group on Non-Formal Education</u> (WGNFE) reports on how it has used capacity development and advocacy strategies to improve understanding of non-formal education (NFE) provision. This was achieved through the formation of Country Working Groups (CWGs) which have proven a viable platform for networking, information flow and skill development amongst NFE providers. The WGNFE highlights the following three achievements:

- the identification of all NFE players in the countries where CWGs have been established;
- the national coordination of these players in terms of their agendas and their strategies;
- the dissemination of "good practices" and expertise across regions; and
- the initiation of debate concerning the interface between NFE and formal education.

4.150   In spite of the failure of governments to expand access to formal education to all segments of their populations, NFE potential for providing an alternative (instead of a complementary) role has rarely been explored. The educational crisis of the 1990s, which was brought about by shrinking education budgets, drew governments' and funding agencies' attention to the potential of NFE as an affordable and efficient means for providing basic education.

4.151   The main strategy used by the WGNFE is to mobilize NFE stakeholders (NGOs, religious groups, and private organizations) into a coherent and supportive entity that bridges national and regional levels. The objective is to present NFE as an integral part of education system reforms.

4.152   Since its creation in 1997, the WGNFE has established six CWGs and is in the process of setting up three more. The role of these CWGs is to address the fragmentation of the NFE field. They are inviting all NFE practitioners in every country to participate in seminars and workshops geared to redefining the field as a coherent whole. This strategy has led to a better understanding of the field on the part of practitioners, government and officials of the external partners. For instance, the incorrect perception that NFE and literacy are the one and the same has been dismantled; literacy is now seen as, "but a link in the chain" of NFE for development.

4.153   The CWGs are also instruments for spreading "good practices". They represent a venue where ideas and experiences of other countries can be exchanged. Such exchange among NFE groups is facilitated through study visits and workshops.

4.154   The next step in the strategy put in place by the WGNFE is to explore the possibility of creating an interface between NFE and the formal educational system. Experiences in a few countries (Mali, Malawi, and Burkina Faso) have provided sufficient evidence for the viability of such an interface. A landmark seminar organized in Botswana brought together a group of NFE actors, policy-makers, researchers and funding agencies for the purpose of reviewing the strengths and weaknesses of a wide range of education provision strategies

Building capacities for sustainable book development policies

4.155   The Working Group on Books and Learning Materials (WGBLM) is concerned with the provision of information on all aspects of book development to education ministries, development agencies, and to other actors in the field, especially African publishers. In this respect, the Working Group works closely with the African Publishers Network (APNET). The work of the WGBLM is founded on several observations:

(a)   Textbook provision is the single most cost-effective means of improving educational quality at all levels of education;

(b)   In the long run, textbook provision cannot be sustained under conditions of over-dependency on external agents. The business of book publishing requires linkages to functioning local industries that will guarantee a continuous interface between pedagogical needs and textbook publishing;

(c)   Textbook production is only part of the challenge. Distribution and trade within and between African countries are also problematic and need to be addressed.

(d)   The field of educational publishing encompasses a whole range of inter-related issues, including political, economic and educational contexts, that affect textbook provision.

4.156   In order to provide a basis for sustainable policy development, this Working Group has undertaken a number of research studies aimed at all aspects of the book chain.[13] All of the studies are based on surveys of the data available in the countries. These studies provide a rich and detailed view of the situation concerning the entire

---

[13]Published studies:

• *Cost Effectiveness of Publishing Educational Materials in African Languages*, 1997, Edited by M. Woodhall.

• *The Economics of Publishing Educational Materials in Africa*, 1997, by W. Bagoya et al.

• *A Bibliography of Publishing and the Book Chain in Sub-Saharan Africa*, 1997 & 1998, by H. Zell.

• *Les habitudes de lecture en Afrique sub-Saharienne et les apprentissages traditionnels: Bibliographie analytiques*, 1997, by S. Gazza.

• *An Introduction to Publishing Management,* by I. Montagnes*.*
Unpublished studies:

• *Getting Books to Schools*, 1998, edited by D. Rosenberg.

• *ADEA Study on Distribution and Dissemination Systems for Educational Materials in West Africa*, 1999, by A. Higo.

• *Fiscal and Legal Constraints to the Intra-African Book Trade*, 1999, by R. Makotsi et al.

textbook chain and publishing in Africa. Most importantly, these studies yielded a number of policy recommendations, as follows. Points (a) to (h) concern the role of governments; points (i) to (k) concern publishers; and points (l) to (m) concern international funding agencies.

(a) They underline the need to collect better data in order to plan and implement book policies. Systematic surveys are needed to collect accurate estimates of direct and hidden costs and subsidies of publishing educational materials. Cost estimates are particularly important for planning under liberalized systems. Also, procurement and transportation must be planned on the basis of enrollment information and the existing availability of textbooks in schools. Without proper information and plans, education ministries will loose control of the situation, to the benefit of private business interests.

(b) Mechanisms are needed to measure the performance of textbooks in the classroom. Such feedback is necessary for curriculum development and in order to assess the relative cost-effectiveness of different kinds of materials, production technologies, and ways of training and encouraging teachers to use materials. Indeed, curriculum development units should consider their major responsibility to be the evaluation of manuscripts. In this role, they should encourage and assist publishers to make pre-testing a regular step in the publishing of textbooks.

(c) Financing policies are crucial for both the magnitude of costs and for how costs are shared between government, non-governmental agencies, schools and consumers of books. Evidence from the research suggests that Governments should engage in longer-range financial planning for textbook provision. This should take into account: the cost of supporting pedagogic policies (such as curriculum reforms and teacher training); the savings that could result from different policy options; reductions in textbook prices that could be achieved by removing taxes and duties on imported raw materials for publishing; the effects of inflation; the costs of delivering books to schools; and the savings that could result through capacity building and civil service reforms.

(d) The logistics of textbook policies requires attention. Training is needed for personnel at all levels involved in logistics, warehousing, transportation of books to schools, book care and selection, and gender issues in material content.

(e) If publishing is to be fully commercialized, authorship will have to be vested in individuals and teams as identified by publishers. Curriculum development institutions will also need to fulfill an advisory and regulatory role to ensure that manuscripts meet standards. MoE need to consider what aspects of textbook quality control and pricing can be implemented by them, and what can be left to the responsibility of publishers.

(f) Teacher training methodologies should assist teachers in the use of new textbooks. A redirection of attitudes towards using textbooks and other learning materials is needed.

(g) Research is needed regarding how cost-effective library services can be more closely integrated into national education systems.

(h) Government interventions in favor of the publishing industry are needed. The most pressing issue for publishers is increased access to working capital and creation of conducive economic conditions. A reform of the bidding procedures for participation in textbook provision would be one of the key determinants in unlocking the potential of publishers in Africa.

(i) Management training for publishers is a fundamental requirement for successfully running publishing houses. Publisher's Associations, backed by Governments, should create opportunities for training staff in all aspects of publishing.

(j)   On the production side, publishers should consider the possibility of sharing desktop publishing equipment.

(k)   Publishers need to do more to improve the quality of books and devise strategies to promote and market books to local booksellers and to the relevant international markets. The lack of marketing culture and the situation of retail networks in countries suggest that studies are required to better understand local situations and the relative importance of poor purchasing power and centralized distribution systems.

(l)   There is no uniform process for developing an operational textbook plan. Any advice has to take into account the circumstances of each country, including the general industrial climate and policies, and the present stage of the publishing business, as well as textbook requirements and needs. Agencies should not advocate liberalization policies as a panacea to the problems of textbook provision if it is clear that the countries are unable to realize textbook targets given the skill levels of their available manpower.

(m)   Agencies need to ensure that all levels of assistance to the education sector are coordinated with the needs of textbook provision.

Strengthening teacher management and support systems

4.157   The <u>Working Group on the Teaching Profession</u> (WGTP) addresses teacher management and support issues through two sections. The WGTP/F is concerned with Francophone countries, and the WGTP/A addresses these issues in the Anglophone countries. Lusophone countries have the option of joining either of the two sections.

4.158   Since 1993, the <u>Anglophone section</u> of the Working Group (the WGTP/A) has focused its attention on a program targeting teacher management and support (TMS) issues such as conditions of service that affect teacher performance. Working through 15 Country Working Groups (CWG), the activities of the TMS program have demonstrated that:

• there are alternative, cost-effective and professional development approaches available to Ministries of Education;

• Ministries of Education can build the professional capacity of teachers, head-teachers, school inspectors and other education officers using local and regional resources;

• there is emerging evidence that African countries can use their local experts to support staff development within the region. This fosters the sharing of professional experiences and also gives recognition to local experts;

• the TMS process has shown that the training activities carried out at regional or pan-African levels can be replicated at the country level; and

• relatively small investments can produce big gains if they are backed up by a well thought-out plan of action. The plan does not need to be particularly complex in terms of its conceptualization and its implementation procedures.

4.159   To a large extent, the success of the Working Group is attributable to the work of its CWGs which have provided a framework for professional exchange on TMS — they act as lobbies and delivery vehicles for the TMS process. In order to function, the CWGs must meet several requirements: membership should be broad-based and

include officers from all relevant departments; establishment of CWGs should follow TMS guidelines endorsed by ministries; membership should be gender balanced; members must be formally appointed by the Minister or the Permanent Secretary; and leadership should be at a senior level.

4.160 Using this highly participatory and networked approach, the WGTP/A has had a clear and positive impact on building the capacity of education ministries in TMS areas. Central to the WG's strategy has been the development of resource materials that have been used throughout the WGs' member countries. This includes:
- the development of reference publications addressing specific TMS needs;
- rapid development of key training materials by teams of African authors;
- adoption of locally produced resource materials by Ministries of Education; and
- local adaptation and translation of core resource materials.

In connection with this, the WGTP/A has undertaken extensive training activities for resource materials developers, school inspectors, head teachers, school inspector master trainers, and regional trainers. In addition to building national capacities, this approach has further strengthened regional capacity and networks. Trainers from a large number of African countries have been readily accepted because they are already well known within the TMS network.

4.161 The <u>Francophone section</u> reports on how it has gone about capacity development for TMS issues. It has worked through country Working Groups and through a network of African expertise developed by the WGTP. Four achievements are highlighted:
- the definition and implementation of new management procedures aimed at promoting the quality of teaching; these include recruitment, pre-service training and in-service training;
- the promotion of dialogue between representatives of education, finance and civil service ministries, teachers, parents, local authorities and external partners. The aim is to promote more participatory management;
- the establishment of a network of national experts for intra-African exchanges; and
- improvements in the quality of teacher personnel management, including recruitment procedures, career structures, computerized management, and decentralization.

4.162 As many Francophone countries (some of which have the lowest GERs in Africa) are making concentrated efforts towards primary education for all, these countries are inventing new and adapted ways to recruit, train, motivate and manage teachers. It is within this context that the WGTP/F has created synergies between the concerned countries and promoted the establishment of a network of experts with practical experience. In particular, the WGTP/F has concentrated on sharing experiences in the areas of:
- teacher training by rotation,
- decentralized teacher recruitment processes,
- obtaining broad (cross-national) agreement on appropriate personnel management computer programs that are compatible with those used in civil service and finance ministries, and
- exploring alternative strategies to solve the problems of lack of teacher.

4.163 The network created by this Working Group includes representatives from Ministries of Education, civil service ("fonction publique") and finance, as well as representatives from teacher unions. National and international seminars focus on specific issues

related to teacher management issues — issues which take on new meanings as countries experiment with and adopt new, innovated teacher recruitment policies (see pages 16-20). This situation has led to a need for increased flexibility and administrative responsiveness in all aspects of teacher management, much of which is controlled by civil service ministries in the Francophone countries. The problem is illustrated by the fact that civil service ministries are referred to as "sovereign" ministries given that they manage all civil servants according to formalized rules and procedures which are not specific to the needs and particularities of "implementing" ministries such as education. The Working Group played the role of catalyst, by promoting reforms that neither ministry could accomplish individually.

4.164 Major contributions of the WGTP/F have involved:
- A clear diagnosis of the problems and issues facing the countries with which it works,

- the identification of cases in which these issues have been successfully tackled and the people associated with the process, and, finally,
- the promotion of intra-African exchanges between countries. Countries that have had successful experiences dealing with these issues can advise their colleagues in countries faced with similar problems.

One example of this process relates to teacher redeployment (see para 4.29). Experts from Guinea, Côte d'Ivoire and Senegal provided technical assistance to Togo, Tchad, Niger and Djibouti. Annual regional seminars are also used towards this end.

Staff development

4.165 Botswana reports on its policy of accelerated (achieved in the shortest possible time) formation of local manpower trained to service the country's economy. The success recorded here is indicated by the fact that the country has reached near self-sufficiency for most of the critical cadres required by the Ministry of Education. Like UPE in Uganda, this policy was the product of clearly articulating political will at a time when many considered the goal unattainable. At the time, Botswana was one of the poorest countries of the world with a per capita income of about US$80. It had no full-fledged Ministry of Education; there were only nine secondary schools, about 251 primary schools, and less than 10 Batswana with an undergraduate degree. Virtually all professional senior positions were held by expatriates. As of 1999, Batswana occupy 99.7% of all primary school and 82% of all secondary school teaching posts, and account for 74% of lecturers in Colleges of Education (all six of which are headed by nationals); the number of special education teachers has risen from four to 82; and the proportion of trained primary school teachers has increased from 62% in 1976 to 92% in 1999.

4.166 Several factors explain this progress:
- A clear sense of urgency that derived from a real and felt need;
- A strong leadership committed to addressing this need;
- A highly consultative policy-making processes informed by national priorities;
- A combination of highly focused and consistent policies and planning, as well as consistent reviews of performance against plans with focused adjustments and follow-through. Since the Transitional Plan was put into effect, National Development Plans have consistently prioritized human resources development across all sectors.

The types of human resources and the skill mix that are prioritized within specific Development Plan periods have shifted over time. In essence, however, the focus on human development has been both stable and relentless;

- Articulation of a strategy with regenerative potential for enhanced human resources development. Going against much international opinion, Botswana chose to focus human resource development efforts on secondary and tertiary education and work backwards to lower levels. This strategy was selected because graduates of these higher levels could then be relied upon to promote human development at the lower levels. Though not totally neglecting the lower levels, the development of the education system was primarily sequenced from the top down;
- Preparedness to invest heavily in human resources development even in times of economic austerity. A key factor throughout Botswana's history has been its preparedness to invest — even borrowed and aid money — in its human resources. They therefore adopted high standards of tertiary education, as exemplified overseas;
- Investment of resources from external partners in nationally identified priorities. The key point has been to retain steadfast focus on national priorities and to insist that external partners also focus on those priorities. The strong leadership and confidence of government technocrats has, therefore, managed to focus the support of external partners where it matters most — according to the Batswana perspective.
- Growth of the education sector and the subsequent call for more human resources to manage it. A key factor in this growth was the expansion of access to ten-year basic education and the development of post-basic education opportunities.
- Organizational development of the delivery system from the headquarters of the Ministry of Education to the schools. This has contributed to the expansion of the sector and introduced increased demand for resources.
- Another critical factor has been the institution of incentive systems which have managed to keep pace with the cost of living, at least for the professional cadres. This has helped retain educated and trained human resources in the Ministry's employment. Botswana has managed to progressively expand professional cadres of the civil service while improving their conditions of service. Examples of these incentives include: competitive salaries; opportunities for further education and training; medical aid policies; car and housing loan schemes; provision of equipment, facilities and materials that make the work environment attractive and rewarding; and efforts to appropriately deploy personnel based on the results of Organizational and Methods studies, etc.

4.167 Central to these achievements is the manner by which the Government approaches its planning process. The planning process identifies national priorities at all levels and matches these with financial and human resource commitments. Feasibility studies, promoting consultation and consensus-building at all levels, ensure ownership and sustainability of programmes. Planning process also involves the structured development of partnerships, the development of conducive environment for all stakeholders and the development of monitoring instruments, such as annual and mid-term reviews of programmes. Restructuring that has resulted from Organization and Methods studies has ensured improved deployment of staff.

4.168 The following lessons are drawn from the Botswana case study:
- Joint agenda setting is needed when dealing with external partners. This ensures that national priorities are maintained.
- The general environment needs to be conducive to the participation of all parties.

- Targets should be feasible, realistic, and in accordance with national capacity.
- Monitoring of the program during its implementation is necessary.
- Sustainability should be built into externally funded programs through a phased decrease in external support and a phased increase in local funding.
- Incentives to retain officers and to train new officers to absorb attrition is required. This is necessary since (i) training improves performance and (ii) trained personnel are more mobile.
- Not all good teachers are good managers. It is, therefore, necessary to train education managers.

Higher education reform

4.169   The ADEA Higher Education Working Group reports on three successful efforts in higher education reform. The first focuses on institutional reforms within a single university in Mozambique. The second analyses system-wide higher education reform as introduced by the Government of Cameroon during the 1990s. The third describes an innovation in regional cooperation for graduate training and research.

4.170   The institutional reforms concern the strategic planning experiences of the Eduardo Mondlane University in Mozambique. Two intensive planning cycles are reported. The first one began in 1990 when it became clear that the University needed to adapt to the changing economic and political scenario associated with movements away from Marxism and affiliated support from the former Eastern Bloc. The need to solicit funds and support from external partners was evident. The second cycle began in 1996-97 when Mozambique and its major public university were adapting to the impacts of democracy, market competition and globalization. Whereas the first effort was that of a small number of senior notables, the second one was generated using a participatory methodology deemed to be more effective in involving the University in the process of change.

4.171   This case study is basically an assessment of the participatory process of the second planning cycle based as compared to the first. It comes to the following conclusions:
- Participatory planning processes, especially in a context where democracy is a relatively recent innovation (as in Mozambique), tend to be long and painstaking.
- Participatory planning must involve the commitment of as many members of the university as possible. It is important to listen to everyone, and to be seen as listening. An efficient information system is helpful. Indeed, one of senior management 's roles should be to provide basic information and play a lead role in stimulating the debate.
- Different groups will need to participate in different ways. This must be taken into account when planning the process.
- Planning cannot be evaluated on documentary evidence alone. One of its most important outcomes is its fostering of debate on major issues.
- Divergence and conflict are a normal component of strategic planning. It is not a simple technocratic exercise; one of its goals is to catalyze debate. Universities are built upon the premise of free discussion and debate of ideas. It is therefore incumbent for the planners to take this into account when preparing the planning process.

• Participatory planning has a positive impact.

4.172 Another contribution from the Higher Education Working Group concerns the reform of higher education in <u>Cameroon</u>. This reform was initiated in 1993 as a response to severe over-crowding at the University of Yaoundé where enrollments increased from 9,000 in 1977 to 45,000 in 1991. Alongside this was the relative stagnation of the infrastructure and a teacher-student ratio of 1/54 (1991). The State treasury was likewise depleted, which led to late and irregular payment of student bursaries and staff salaries (in 1991, they consumed 89% of the university budget) and to a low execution rate for the university budget. Student welfare appeared to have surpassed teaching and research as the university's priority. Success rates were low (about 30%) and graduate unemployment was on the rise. As a result, the University community lost motivation and became demoralized.

4.173 The goals of the 1993 reforms were the decongestion of the University of Yaoundé and the professionalization of university studies. The first aim was addressed by the establishment of six full-fledged universities throughout Cameroon. Apart from solving the space problems in Yaoundé, the expanded geographical distribution made higher education more accessible to students in under-served regions of the country. Professionalization was pursued through quality improvement measures and greater university autonomy. A two-semester course credit system was introduced. Universities were required to link their programs to local labor market needs. The bursary system was eliminated, thereby increasing the budget for research, infrastructure and teaching, and student registration fees increased significantly. The reforms had results. Data for the 1995/6 academic year show improvements in success rates (up to 70% for one of the universities) and reduced teacher/student rates (1/54).

4.174 The reforms, however, have also seen setbacks, such as resistance to financial participation on the part of parents and students and reduced funding by the State. Despite new revenue generated by the registration fees and the elimination of bursaries, universities still rely on declining Government support for around 70% of their budget. The creation of new universities has also required additional personnel; this has led to a decrease in overall staff quality. Strategic planning and quality control are still almost non-existent. The conclusion drawn from the higher education reforms in Cameroon is that the success of such reforms depends on full political and societal support, the financial sustainability of universities and a body of experienced and devoted managers.

4.175 The ADEA Higher Education Working Group also reports on a research capacity building network for Southern and East Africa aimed at achieving human resource development through sustainable capacity building in science, engineering and the humanities. Staff development fellowships for research and for advanced degrees at the participating universities are the principle strategies used. The program is known as the University Science, Humanities and Engineering Partnerships in Africa (USHEPiA). It is a multi-partnership experience, involving: the University of Cape Town (South Africa) which provided much of the management and content for this experience; the Association of African Universities (AAU) which provided the vision and the framework for cooperation, and introduced UCT to its counterparts in Africa — participating universities in Uganda, Kenya, Tanzania, Zambia, Zimbabwe and

Botswana — and external financing partners. The approach used is a "sandwich model" in which the fellowship holders alternate between the partner universities (their home university and, in almost all cases, UCT where they pursue their studies). Fellowships allow for travel and subsistence for up to 20 months and make provision for supervisor travel, research expenses and relevant equipment.

4.176   Achievements are:
- Thirty-six full-degree fellowships have been awarded, ten of which have gone to women; two PhDs and two masters degrees have been completed.
- Over 40 supervisors have visited partner universities. These visits are associated with lectures, external examinations and research cooperation. This experience demonstrates the effectiveness of a network based on a common needs assessment, the enthusiasm of all participants, and an adequate management capacity.
- This has helped promote research collaboration amongst African researchers and has broken down some of the historical barriers between South Africa and the rest of the continent.
- The sharing of regional resources yielding economies of scale has taken place.
- A network of African researchers capable of addressing the developmental requirements of sub-Saharan Africa has been established.

4.177   The following key success factors are identified in the case study:
- The importance of consultation, the result of which being that all involved parties bought into the program. The development of personal relationships at an early stage played a role.
- These consultations led to general agreements of the objectives of the program, which in turn, led to shared expectations; each partner expressed specific needs and expectations. UCT, for example, stressed its untapped capacity to receive additional post-graduate students, its desire to develop research relationships within the continent, and it belief in the importance of having students from other parts of Africa to serve as role models within the changing South African context. Other partner universities stressed their staff development and capacity-buildings needs, as well as their desire to develop continental research relationships.
- Effective management of the process included early institutional buy-in at the highest level from all partners and flexibility (including budgetary) so that each fellowship could be tailor-made to the individuals concerned.
- Enthusiasm was important.
- There was a conscious effort made to develop a network beyond the individual fellowship holders. Linkages were established between universities, departments and supervisors. These have led to spin-offs, particularly involving supervisors, such as the appointment of external examiners and invitations to lecture or deliver seminars. Successful networking occurred simultaneously at three levels: the university senior management level; the departmental level; and the level of individual Fellows.
- The focus on local research projects, the provision of suitable equipment, the emphasis on longer-term research co-operation and the ability to raise funds independently for future research were all factors.

4.178   Problems included:
- Communication was difficult (whether by post, fax, e-mail or telephone) and this

---

affected communications between the USHEPiA office in Cape Town and the partner universities, as well as between the Fellows and supervisors.   One outcome of this was that program administration was much more resource intensive than anticipated.

- There were difficulties related to the lack of clearly defined and delineated roles within the joint supervisor system. The duties of the supervisors and the nature of their relationships were never adequately addressed within the project.
- Imbalances generated by the project were somewhat problematic. For some, living in Cape Town on their home university's salary was quite difficult. The equipment received by the Fellows also created some conflict between them and their more senior colleagues.

Strengthening partnerships between Ministries of Education and their external funding partners

4.179   The ADEA <u>Working Group on Education Sector Analysis</u> reports on a study of the perceptions of sector-wide approaches (also known as sector investment programs) held by policy makers in education ministries and in the external partner agencies with which they work. The study focuses on Burkina Faso, Ghana, and Mozambique. Given the resulting expectations, mutual understanding of such perceptions is crucial to the development of sustainable partnerships.

4.180   The study finds that there is high degree of commonality among the three countries in their understandings of the sector-wide approach and how it differs from traditional project assistance. At the same time, the analysis reveals that this commonality is not uniform in the three countries and that there is a gap — sometimes huge — between the general understanding of the approach and how it is translated into practice. The sector-wide approach was understood as being based on partnership between national governments and international funding and technical assistance agencies, including non-governmental organisations and other stakeholders in the education sector, often referred to as "development partners". This partnership was understood as mutual, existing between equal partners and aimed at ensuring national ownership of the development process. Strong leadership from the national government and an expected adherence to government priorities and government-developed policy frameworks by the development partners was, therefore, expected. All development partners, and in particular all financial and technical assistance agencies, were assumed to be co-ordinated by the government.

4.181   There were inconsistencies in the views on how and when the concept of sector-wide approach was introduced in the specific national contexts and of the concept's origin. This inconsistency often reflected a dividing line between ministry officials, on the one hand, and agency officials on the other. In the case of Ministries of Education officials in all three countries, there was strong emphasis on government-identified need for a holistic approach to educational development, whether as a sub-sector or wider-sector programme. Other respondents from all countries, particularly within the agency community, but also including some ministry officials, emphasized the key role of the World Bank in having introduced the concept of development sector investment programmes prior to the development of the education sector programmes. Other agencies then became associated with the idea.

4.182 It is too early to identify any of the three cases as "success stories" that involve partnerships between Ministries of Education and international funding and technical assistance agencies, and that concern the development and/or implementation of a sector-wide approach to educational development. The current understanding of the sector-wide approach has evolved out of previous modes of international assistance and has not yet been put into operation in any of the countries. Nevertheless, a comparative analysis of the strategies, processes and structures which were adopted and developed to facilitate education sector development in these three countries helps to identify factors which have been influential in either constraining or promoting movement towards the goal. This comparative analysis yields the following conclusions concerning the success of sector-wide approaches:

(a) Government leadership is central. This includes continuity and stability in leadership, as well as sufficient management capacity. It also includes leadership at the middle level of the ministry. In Mozambique, for example, the core factor in the apparent success seems to be the efforts made to provide management training across middle-level management positions.

(b) The configuration of a country's external partners plays a role. Despite their attempt to develop common understandings of sector-wide approaches to education development, development partners remain inherently different due to their underlying national and institutional policies, their ideologies and the conditions that their task managers face on a daily basis.

(c) Institution and capacity development are critical. Appropriate institutional structures and capacities are necessary preconditions for the formulation and implementation of any successful education reform or for the introduction of new approaches to educational development.

(d) Equal partnerships based on mutual understanding depend on open dialogue, continuous communication and equal access to necessary information. Formulation and implementation of national development goals as expressed in policy frameworks, strategies and plans depend on common understanding of the goals and strategies.

(e) Values, ethics, and moral codes matter. Two of the preconditions for the development of equal partnerships in development cooperation are common understanding and consensus-building among all involved parties and mutual respect for the preconditions of their participation. Transparency of underlying interests would clarify the contractual arrangements under which the parties interact.

4.183 As a result, the Education Sector Analysis Working Group concludes that the sector-wide approach should not be understood as a new formula to achieve what has not been achieved through project assistance. Rather, it should be understood as a complex, evolving process in which flexible and adaptable thinking and action are most likely to achieve the goal of holistic, coherent development based on common understandings of priorities and on common agreements for implementations. Common understanding depends on mutual respect for the positions of the different parties involved in change process of change, and also on clearly defined roles for those parties. Transparency of those roles and of the underlying interests of the

parties involved is likely to be a key factor.

5. TRENDS and LESSONS

5.1   The previous section classified country cases as dealing with access, quality or capacity development. This classification is more conceptual than operational. It highlights the countries' specific "entry points" into the development of their education systems, rather than denoting exclusive attention to either access, quality, or capacity development. Operationally, the improvement of access and/or quality cannot be attained without the capacities to do so. In real terms, qualitative and quantitative improvements of education systems either assume the existence of capacities or impel their development. Capacity development is, therefore, a means for attaining the education development objectives of improved access and quality. Because of the means-end relationship between access and quality on the one hand, and capacity development on the other, country cases that have focused on access or quality somehow deal with capacity development. By implication, case studies that focused on capacity development deal with access and/or quality as the main reason(s) for improving capacities in the first place.

5.2   Ideally, each of the case studies synthesized in Section 4 presents five critical pieces of information: (i) a description of an intervention that is successfully improving education access, education quality and the delivery capacity of education systems; (ii) concrete evidence of the success of the innovation; (iii) an analysis of processes that led to the success; (iv) factors that facilitate the success; and (v) valuable lessons that are worth sharing. Naturally, facilitative factors and lessons are tethered to the specific country contexts within which the innovations are implemented. This section goes beyond the specificity of country contexts and draws out common trends and generalizable lessons on "what works" in expanding access, improving quality and developing delivery capacities of education systems in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA).

5.3   The decontextualization of factors "that work" is as theoretical and analytic as it is instructive. It is theoretical in the sense that every intervention exists as a complex of elements, key among which is the implementation context. Simplification of this complexity runs the risk of dismembering it. This is instructive in that it makes more apparent the critical elements that may be adapted to different contexts. This makes social learning possible through the exchange of experiences. This is what the *Prospective, Stocktaking* exercise is all about.

5.4   The complementary relationship between access and quality, and the instrumental role of capacities in improving access and quality renders the separation of factors that promote one or the other difficult, if not artificial. Across most of the case studies, the principles, factors, and strategies that improve access, quality and even capacities are fundamentally the same. To this effect, this Section does not deal separately with each of the three challenges addressed in this *Review*. It more generally focuses on identifying and highlighting generalizable trends about what seems to facilitate the development of education in the region.[14]

---

[14]"Trend' is here used to connote any pattern that is illustrated by more two case

Developing education in Sub-Saharan Africa: What works?

Democratization and the norm of equality

5.5   Democratization and the consequent endorsement of the "norm of equality" catalyzes the development of education. A pervasive trend among cases which made significant success in expanding access, improving quality and/or developing systemic capacities is the transition to democracy and concern for equality. In four of the case studies, the countries had recently emerged out from under repressive regimes. For South Africa, Zimbabwe and Namibia, there was a need to dismantle previously institutionalized inequalities in education access. Uganda, on the other hand, needed to re-build an education system that was almost totally destroyed by repressive government and subsequent civil strife. Independent South Africa set out to open opportunities for the non-white majority who were denied access to higher education by the apartheid regime. Namibia's main motivation to build capacity for curriculum development, student assessment, and education information management was to rid itself of the inequalities of Bantu education imposed by the same apartheid. The Zimbabwe Science Project derived mostly from the need to make science education accessible to blacks, a predominantly rural and poor student subset which had been denied science education under the discriminatory Rhodesian government. Likewise, Botswana's determination to develop its human resource base was intended to redress the deliberate underdevelopment of national human resources by the colonial government.

5.6   *Lesson: The development of education in SSA cannot be effectively pursued without paying attention to macro-political contexts. Political contexts that are most conducive to the improvement of the quality of education for all are those that endorse the "norm of equality". The importance of this norm is highlighted because even within the so-called democratic countries, certain groups — women and girls, disabled persons, ethnic and linguistic minorities — are denied education opportunities on account of assumed inequalities.*

Political vision, conviction and commitment

5.7   A clear vision, complemented by unwavering conviction and the commitment of highly-placed leaders, facilitates the success of educational development efforts. In some of the cases, such as Botswana, Guinea, Namibia, Uganda and South Africa, the successful interventions were supported and/or commissioned by the office of the State President and enjoyed the utmost support of the Ministers of Education. Across these cases, political will and committed leadership have been identified as critical factors in the facilitation of observed achievements. The importance of political will and of the conviction of highly-placed leaders to make a difference seems to prevail against all odds. This is clearly illustrated by the cases presented by Botswana,

---

[14](...continued)
studies.

Liberia, Namibia, and Uganda. Driven mainly by conviction and commitment to make a difference, these countries recorded (or are likely to record) measurable impact even within contexts of dire resource and capacity limitations.

5.8   *Lesson: Success in education development requires just as much passion as it does substance. Innovations need highly placed champions who can garner the support and commitment of change agents. The successful development of education requires the "buy in" of the highest political leadership. Innovations that are placed high on the national political agenda are most likely to register success.*

Readiness to develop as you go

5.9   A trend that permeates most of the cases that are expanding access and improving quality is the readiness to "develop as you go". This sense of readiness derives from a clear sense of urgency to effect change. Such readiness is well illustrated in the case studies of Botswana's human capacity development, Zimbabwe's science project, Namibia's institutional capacity development, Uganda's Universal Primary Education, and the innovative teacher policies in Senegal, Tchad, and Guinea among others. Virtually all case studies display the shrewdness of their champions *to not allow planning to arrest implementation.* Although the champions and followers of these innovations were well aware of their resource limitations, and of the groundwork that remained to be done, a sense of urgency, coupled with the readiness "to develop as they go" enabled them to launch and successfully implement their efforts. This represents, in a way, the primacy of management over planning.

5.10   *Lesson: The success of innovations depends on an astute balancing of planning and implementation. A key feature of this balance is the ability not to allow planning to arrest implementation. As aptly put by one of the presenters of the Zimbabwe science report, "not everything has to be in place before you can start".*

Consultative and inclusive policy development and programming

5.11   Another trend that emerges is the importance of inclusive consultation and consensus building are basic to effective education policy development and management. Innovators are becoming increasingly aware of the need to garner broad-based support for interventions intended to develop education. Consultation and consensus building foster a sense of ownership of, and support for, education policies and programs among stakeholders (other than political leaders and Ministry technocrats). Notice that *policy* is used here in its inclusive form to cover all forms of institutionalized practice.

5.12   In the most formal manner, this consultation takes the form of Presidential or National Commissions of Education. Examples include consultation processes that preceded the articulation of Uganda's Universal Primary Education policy and South Africa's Higher Education policy. Less formalized consultations are clearly a pervasive and integral part of strategies for expanding access to education. These exploit an array of media, including meetings, radio, information leaflets, newspapers, and others.

5.13   Extensive consultations with stakeholders have been cited as critical to the success of the teacher redeployment project in Guinea, UPE in Uganda, the Madagascar dina

schools, teacher recruitment and the volunteer teacher program in Senegal, community mobilization for improved access in Mali, Burkina Faso, and Gambia, the acceptance of Nigeria's nomadic communities to enroll their children and adults, the acceptance of a circular curriculum into Zanzibar's Koranic schools, and the launching and implementation of Côte d'Ivoire's EMIS.

5.14   In some contexts, consultations are enabling traditionally opposed parties to complete one another's efforts to improve and sustain access to education. In Liberia for instance, the Teachers' Union assisted the Ministry of Education in convincing teachers not to abandon learners and immigrate out of the country. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) are collaborating more often with governments in an effort to provide education services and to mobilize communities.

5.15   *Lesson: Much can be attained through sharpening means of communicating with stakeholders who support education development. The recent ADEA/World Bank initiative on "communicating education" seems right on target. As the initiative unfolds, it will have to target the wide range of stakeholders who seem to make the most difference in supporting the development of education. Communication technologies should be effectively used to carry messages to people on the ground whose support makes things happen in education.*

Perceived relevance and sensitivity to real and felt needs

5.16   Interventions manage to garner support only to the degree that they are considered relevant to the real and felt needs of the people. The expansion of education meets the popular demand for education. The willingness of communities to make substantial contributions to the expansion of access, and to resource inputs that improve quality attests to the perceived relevance of education to their lives and to the lives of their children. This is demonstrated by the case studies that focus on community partnerships (see page 10). Communities demand education for its promise to alleviate their capability and resource poverty.

5.17   Other examples of interventions that thrive because of their perceived relevance are the institutional capacity development initiatives presented by Côte d'Ivoire, and Namibia. In both countries, efforts to develop EMIS made progress because they addressed the information needs of policy makers. Côte d'Ivoire needed to manage student flows, to curb illicit enrolments, and to improve human resources (teachers) planning and education finance management. Namibia's EMIS also addressed the need to plan and to equitably allocate education resource inputs and to make informed decisions.

5.18   *Lesson: No matter how brilliant and progressive proposed policies and innovations may be, their chances of success are limited if the beneficiaries do not understand and appreciate their value. Policy makers, therefore, need to invest time and energy in making apparent the value of proposed policies to potential beneficiaries. It does not suffice that the benefactors know that "its good for beneficiaries".*

Effective partnerships for the provision of education

5.19   A trend that pervades all cases that focus on access is the readiness of governments

to create space for alternative providers of education service. Thus far, communities are the main partners actively involved in the provision of education. These communities take diverse forms ranging from regular communities, to religious communities (Catholic churches in Liberia, and Lesotho, Moslem community in Zanzibar), and to civil society components, such as local NGOs. A substantial proportion of promising efforts at expanding access to education succeed because of community support.

5.20   *Lesson. Allowed and encouraged to exist, collective entrepreneurship for education can be a vibrant source of ideas and resources.*

Community involvement

5.21   The role of communities as providers of education is becoming more complex and more substantive. Over and above the traditional financial contributions, in-kind contributions of labor and the provision of instructional materials, uniforms and other resources, communities are becoming more involved in matters previously regarded as within the domain of professionals and ministries. Communities are currently involved themselves in: the recruitment of teachers; the negotiation of teacher salaries; teacher management (Guinea, Cameroon, Senegal and Tchad); school management (Côte d'Ivoire, Zanzibar, and Tchad); the selection of school curricula (Zanzibar); school mapping (Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia); financial management (Madagascar, Tanzania); and the establishment and management of pre-schools (Zanzibar). There appears to be a partial shift of the locus of action and control from the central ministries to the communities.

5.22   The re-kindling of community participation in the provision of education is an interesting development, especially when situated within the histories of education of SSA. Community participation in the provision of education is often presented as though it is a recent or new phenomenon. It is cloaked in new labels such as "cost-sharing" and "diversification of providers". For most African countries, however, this is a "back to basics" movement. In much of Africa (the former British colonies, in particular), communities and religious groups were the main providers of education during the colonial period and during the immediate post-independence era. After independence, most governments took over and ran community and missionary schools; these eventually became government schools. This procedure was often justified as necessary for nation building, political integration, and harmonization of standards.

5.23   There may well have been strong reasons for an increased government role in the early post-independence years. In the longer-run, however, governments' appropriation of schools eroded the spirit of self-reliance that African communities had developed — not only for the provision education, but for other social services as well. Along with this spirit, capabilities that communities had acquired also eroded. Over time, the take-over of schools served to repress the potential expansion of education provisions by reducing the potential range of providers.

5.24   The recent return of school jurisdiction to communities is therefore as ironic as it is instructive. It demonstrates the fact that education development policies in Africa have been regressive and have failed to build on prior positive African experiences. It

shows how reforms have often "thrown out the baby with the bath water". Careful analysis should have illuminated a means for promoting nation building, harmonization of standards, and political integration without destroying the foundation for community participation in education development.

5.25 Another irony is that the return of schools to communities coincides with the weakening of the resource base of those communities and the growing tendency to segregate communities by levels of wealth, or lack thereof. The poorest communities — in both urban and rural settings — are those least serviced by central government in terms of education provisions. Consequently, poor communities are generally the ones required to contribute for their education provisions (see the cases from Tanzania and Côte d'Ivoire). At the macro level, community participation is most prevalent in countries that have low levels of primary school enrollment; these tend to be the poorest countries.

5.26 *Lessons*:
(a) *Communities put their resources where their needs are. To this effect, sustainable and effective development of education will rely on the means of livelihood available to individuals and their communities. Whereas prior assistance to education went directly to governments, there may be need to explore strategies that will more directly target poor communities and individuals. Such methods should endeavor to enable communities to provide for themselves rather than to be provided for by national governments. Otherwise the sustainability of community support for education may be threatened.*
(b) *The history of community participation in education development points to a need for education development policies to be tethered to positive experiences from the ground. This is congruent with the intentions of this "Prospective, Stocktaking Review". Concerted and sustained efforts must be made to identify factors that facilitate the development of education in SSA and to strengthen those factors.*

Decentralization of management and control of education

5.27 An important by-product of heightened consultation, together with the emergence of community involvement, is the slow (but sure) progress toward decentralization of the provision and decision making powers and of the control of education services. Although this decentralization process is not without problems, one key strength is its growth from the bottom-up — based on internally perceived and accepted needs, rather than some pre-tested model of decentralization. This process is built onto already established practices or institutions. The contract-program in Madagascar is built onto the 'dina' which is a traditional, non-written binding contract. The early childhood education curriculum in Zanzibar builds onto the well-established Koranic schools by introducing subject-matter content in a religious curriculum. In virtually all the case studies, community participation is based on consultation and consensus building practices which are fundamental to communities, especially in rural areas.

5.28 *Lesson: Efforts to decentralize the provision, management and control of education systems in SSA need to build on processes that are familiar, well known and, therefore, acceptable. Most likely, success will better come from decentralization processes that are allowed to evolve out of needs and out of contexts rather than out of experiences far removed from those contexts.*

Information and analysis-based policy and programming

5.29   A clear information and analytic base seems to improve the chances that efforts to improve access and quality, particularly relevance, will be successful. A number of the successes were preceded by, or benefitted from, some form of sector analysis and/or action research. Fewer, however, were accompanied by consistent monitoring and evaluation. In addition to developing commitment and consensus, the work of Presidential Commissions was often informed by data, research findings and analysis. The Uganda UPE and South Africa's higher education policy are examples of this.

5.30   Examples of the use of research are found throughout the case studies. Action research is used in support of innovative programs, especially in areas related to non-formal delivery modes (Benin and Nigeria) and curriculum development (Namibia and Zimbabwe). The expansion of education access to the nomadic communities of Nigeria, for example, was informed and supported by an action research program based in four university-affiliated centers for nomadic education. The Madagascar vocational and technical education and training program was preceded by a survey that established employers' and employees' needs. The survey helped to establish relevance and adaptability of the existing skill base to the labor market. The vocational and technical education curriculum was based on the findings of the survey. The Zimbabwe Informal Sector Training project was also preceded by a skill analysis survey that established the effectiveness of the informal sector skill base relative to labor market demands. The project also established a baseline of skills and later used the evidence to assess the projects' impact. Similarly, the development of the Namibia EMIS was preceded by a survey of information needs of potential users. The relevance of the EMIS was derived from its ability to address the identified needs. The quality improvement initiative reported by Niger had an experimental research design; several evaluations were conducted to compare the performance of the experimental group with the control group. Another project that closely monitored for impact was Mali's convergent pedagogy.

5.31   A spirit of experimentation is closely related to the trend to use research and analysis to inform innovations. Some of the innovations reported as successful (Mali, Niger, and Zimbabwe) started on a small experimental basis or are still in an experimental phase.

5.32   *Lesson: In a context where one finds much comment on the lack of research or applicable data and analysis, we find that a good number of the case studies present interventions that have clearly used some form of research in their design and/or implementation. These, of course, are interventions that are deemed to have succeeded. Although speculative, it is tempting to suggest that the success of these interventions is, at least partially, attributable to their analytical foundations. If this is the case, additional efforts need to go towards the promotion of new research and more intensive use of existing research.[15]*

---

[15]See R. Maclure (ed), *Overlooked and Undervalued: A synthesis of ERNWACA*

A holistic approach seems to improve chances of success

5.33   Another trend that comes through the case studies is holistic or multi-faceted approach to addressing challenges. In Uganda for instance, the implementation of the UPE policy entailed curriculum reform, the training of teachers to effectively implement new curriculum, improved supply and distribution of textbooks to support the new curriculum, enhanced teacher management and professional support, improved student assessment, establishment of monitoring and evaluation mechanisms and the abolition of school fees.   In Tchad, the promotion of girls' access to education entailed the elimination of school fees for girls, the institution of food rations, the lifting of entry age restriction for girls, the easing of the demands on girls for labor by providing grain mills, child care facilities, etc., the institution of a quota system for female teachers, sensitization campaigns, the provision of textbooks and the training of teachers and teacher facilitators. In order to improve the enrolment of nomads, Nigeria had to adapt curriculum and instructional materials, re-tool teachers to handle nomadic students as well as the adapted curriculum, enlist young nomads — 12 to 18 years of age — to serve as mobile teachers, institute monitoring and evaluation mechanisms, adopt flexible scheduling, and adopt alternative classrooms such as collapsible walls, canvas, and use of motorized boat schools. Zimbabwe Science has elements of curriculum reform, the adaptation of equipment for the new curriculum, teacher training and teacher support systems. The Zimbabwe Informal Sector Training combines skill training, apprenticeship, business advisory services, credit services and marketing support services.

5.34   Although not as elaborate, the cases from Mali, Niger and Côte d'Ivoire also have several components. In Côte d'Ivoire, effort to improve girls' education opportunities entailed the provision of textbooks for girls and the institution of specific programs for poor girls with high academic potential. Mali's convergent pedagogy combined a participatory approach to teaching and learning and the use of mother tongue as a medium of instruction. The Niger case study uses mother tongue as a medium of instruction as well as reduced class sizes.

5.35   *Lesson: Developing education systems is a complex matter. No one measure can deliver the desired impact. Successful interventions are those that adopt a multi-pronged strategy.*

Cost-effective resource utilization

5.36   The use of double shifts (Gambia and Côte d'Ivoire) the recruitment of less costly, non-civil service teachers (Senegal, Cameroon, Tchad) and the increasing of class size (Cameroon) are examples of effective resource utilization that seems to significantly improve access to education without concomitant increases in costs to the government budget. These innovative teacher policies have political consequences, and their implementation has often required clear expression of

---

[15](...continued)
reviews on the state of education research in West and Central Africa.
ERNWACA/SARA/USAID, 1997.

political will. These policies, which provide teachers where there were none, are made possible by the existence of substantial numbers of unemployed graduates from secondary schools and the university. This is something of a universal trend as the average diploma level of teachers has tended to increase as teachers salaries, relative to changes in national average wages, have tended to decline.[16] The Senegal and Tchad cases indicate, however, that policies are needed to provide incentives and sustained motivations for these non-civil service teachers.

What about the costs?

5.37   Although most of the cases studies may claim "cost-effectiveness", a blind spot in the evidence to date is the financial implication of these promising innovations. With the exception of Zimbabwe Science and the Senegal voluntary teacher scheme, the case studies provided little information on the cost of their successes. Neither did they provide analyses of the cost of the interventions relative to the usual alternatives. Concrete evidence concerning the cost-effectiveness of these innovations is therefore not available.

5.38   *Lesson: It is clear across the case studies that financial analysis is still very weak and is not sufficiently integrated into the culture of education ministries. Along with the culture of critical reflection, there has to be a balanced reflection on costs as well as on educational substance. It is quite difficult to recommend or to even adopt innovations if one does not know what they cost. What seems to emerge from the case studies is that capacity development efforts in the region need to pay attention to financial analysis and management.*

Networking and the development of pan-African professional communities

5.39   The power of networking is a major lesson that comes out of the case studies from the ADEA Working Groups. In addition to the two sections of the Teaching Profession Working Group, the work of the Statistics Working Group demonstrates the benefits of developing communities of professionals who work on similar issues. Both these Working Groups have demonstrated how such professional communities can be the basis for the provision of cost-effective technical assistance.

5.40   A striking example of this is provided by the EFA-2000 Assessment exercise where all countries in the world are expected to provide country reports on their progress since the Jomtien meeting in 1990. From Africa, over 90% of the countries have completed their reports. The figures for the other continents are much lower, often well below 50%. The reason for this difference is attributable to the well-functioning network established and maintained by the ADEA Working Group on Statistics (also know as the UNESCO "NESIS" program). Because of this network, education planning and statistics officers from all Sub-Saharan countries meet regularly to work on topics of common concern, as defined by an agenda to which all have contributed. They know one another and, by now, have form a sustainable professional community.

---

[16]International Labour Organization, *Impact of structural adjustment on the employment and training of teachers.* 1996.

5.41   The development and maintenance of these professional networks are not simple tasks. First of all, a clear understanding of objectives is necessary in order to identity the target community and the issues around which it revolves. Secondly, careful selection of its members is necessary in order to achieve the appropriate mix of policy makers, technical people (both from within and from outside the ministries) and other concerned parties. Thirdly, frequent contact is necessary. This means that meetings must be structured around well-prepared agenda of common interest and must also be informed and irrigated by quality professional work. The ADEA Working Groups have demonstrated that this is, not only possible, but highly productive.

5.42   *Lesson: Investments in the development of networks and communities of professionals working on similar issues can have high returns. These include cost-effective sharing of knowledge and technical know-how across the continent.*

International partnerships

5.43   The case studies demonstrate the extent to which the substantial technical and financial support of international development agencies has been crucial to the achievements reported in the case studies.[17] Sixteen of the countries that provided case studies make explicit reference to the role of their external financing and technical partners in the realization of their respective interventions. Clearly, this is a significant finding and demonstrates the importance of international cooperation in the elaboration, development and implementation of interventions that the countries designate as successful.[18] It also raises the question of the "locus of innovation" and why countries, when they report innovations and/or successful interventions, often refer to the presence (mostly financial) of their external partners. This could be interpreted as a demonstration of the importance and the need of international exchange in order to promote innovations which, almost by definition, happen on the margins of established systems.

5.44   International partnerships for education development in Africa are, however, moving away from specific project assistance and towards sector-wide approaches. Some of the implications of this are discussed in the case study by the Working Group on Education Sector Analysis (see page 57) which presents a more textured analysis based on the three countries' studies which focus on the factors promoting

---

[17] Throughout Section 4, the generic term "external partner(s)" is used to indicate the presence and contribution of external financing and technical partners and agencies in the realization of the interventions reported in the case studies. Although the case studies clearly identify the partners involved, we have chosen to use the generic term in this synthesis.

[18]Is it necessary to discount this finding by the fact that the countries knew that their case studies were for an international audience? The ADEA technical team for this exercise thinks not. All indicators (qualitative and informal) suggest that the interventions chosen are those sincerely deemed the most significant.

international partnerships for education. In this context, full partnership[19] and transparency take on an even greater importance. The language of partnership — especially present in the context of sector-wide approaches — promotes previously unknown expectations which, in turn, further reinforce the imperative to deliver on these expectations.

A note on evidence for education quality

5.45   Although quality in education is difficult to operationalize and measure, there is some consensus that quality indications should include inputs, processes and outcomes. Most of the cases that reported progress in improving education quality have focused on inputs. These inputs cover three categories: infrastructures (Lesotho), improved quality of teachers and supervisors (Lesotho, Uganda, Botswana, Senegal, Cameroon, Zimbabwe Science), and curriculum and instructional materials (Zimbabwe Science, Uganda, Namibia's curriculum).

5.46   It is noteworthy that most of the case studies that substantially improved their infrastructure and human resources inputs — teachers mainly — classified themselves as
focusing on access. As previously noted, this classification demonstrates the main concern of those countries: to enroll more children in school. This classification is also indicative of the analytic focus and the evidence provided in the studies. Even though the improved resource inputs have a potential impact on education quality, hardly any of the cases factored this potential impact into their reports. Furthermore, the evidence they provided was the improvement in enrolment figures. This may be an artefact of how we define "evidence": enrollments are easily quantifiable and the numbers generally exist. The same is true for student-teacher ratios. This is generally not the case for more complex indicators of quality, especially when defined in terms of outcomes.

5.47   *Lesson: What we learn from the tendency to focus on any given aspect of educational development is that even as the analytical capacities of Ministries of Education are improving, there is still room for further improvement. Education systems are complex and multifaceted. Analyses that focus on one aspect and neglect the others increase the risk for uneven development of the system. The fact that country teams that focused on access hardly noticed the potential quality implications of their interventions is worrisome.*

5.48   Few cases have presented evidence of the improvement of *processes* as an indication of improving quality. The few processes that are mentioned include: the delivery of teacher management and professional support services (Lesotho and Uganda); the use of mother-tongue as a medium of instruction (Mali, Niger, and the Seychelles); the use of progressive and learner-centered pedagogy (Cameroon, Mali and Niger); the use of research and analytical information as a basis for education policy development and programming (Nigeria, Uganda, South Africa, Zimbabwe Science, Namibia); and procedures for sustained monitoring of the innovations (Niger,

---

[19]For an in-depth discussion, with examples, of this, see: ADEA (1999), *Partnerships for Capacity Building and Quality Improvements in Education*. (Papers from the ADEA Biennial Meeting, Dakar, Senegal, October 1997).

Mali and Nigeria). Even though these processes are mentioned as improving, not much evidence is provided regarding what exactly is improving and how the improvements can be empirically identified.

5.49   With the exception of Mali (convergent pedagogy and use of mother tongue), Niger (participatory pedagogy, use of mother tongue and reduced class size), and Zimbabwe Science, few case studies have provided evidence of improvement of education outcomes. This may be because the case studies do not always identify outcomes that were targeted to improve as a result of resource inputs and processes. What remains unknown therefore is the impact of inputs on processes and outcomes on the one hand, and the impact of processes on outcomes on the other. For instance, if more books are reaching schools, are they being effectively used? If more teachers have been upgraded through in-service training, is teaching necessarily improving? What is the evidence of that improvement?   If books are effectively used and teaching management and professional support is improving, are students learning more? What is the evidence of improvement in student learning? The impression left by the case studies is that the improvement of inputs or processes is an end in itself.

5.50   With a few exceptions, the second limitation is the lack of baseline evidence against which the performance of the intervention could be assessed. Again, with a few exceptions, the third weakness is the lack of consistent monitoring and documentation of performance. Some of the interventions had gone on for extended periods of time without any systematic evaluation of their impact.   In this respect, perhaps a key contribution of the *Prospective, Stocktaking Review* is that it encouraged people to look back on innovations they have been implementing, some for as long as decades, document their results, and reflect critically on how they came about. A key challenge for most of the country teams was the provision (construction) of evidence that was never documented.

5.51   *Lesson: Inadequate attention is given to the systematic linking of education inputs to processes and to the linking of inputs and processes to outcomes. Because of this weakness, it is not always possible to understand what impacts the innovations have made. More importantly, we are not gaining the cumulative wisdom of what resources and processes are best at leveraging education developments.*

A note on capacity development

5.52   Strictly speaking, case studies that are classified as successes in capacity development are those that deal with the whole sector. Otherwise, as stated, all of the case studies entail some form of capacity development. The cases whose efforts covered the whole sector are so few, and their areas of focus so different, that it is remains difficult to draw out generalizable trends on what facilitates system-wide capacity development. The case studies that did cover the entire sector are: Botswana's human resources development, the three Namibia cases on students' assessment and examinations, curriculum development, and EMIS and Cote d'Ivoire's EMIS (although still a pilot).

5.53   These cases show three factors that appear to facilitate capacity development. The first one is the availability of required expertise. This cuts across the three Namibia

cases on curriculum development, student assessment and examinations and across EMIS. The second factor is the readiness to provide funding. Across the three cases, a factor that facilitated the reported advancements has been the readiness to provide adequate funding and to put the funds where they matter most. Botswana's recent success in developing its human resources derived from willingness to make heavy investments. The last point is the responsiveness to real and felt needs. This is demonstrated across all the case studies.

6. REFLECTIONS on the PROCESS

6.1   How far have we come? The *Prospective, Stocktaking Review of Education in Sub-Saharan Africa* was conceived as a process, not as an event. This process is intended to be a collective, critical and introspective reflection on successful efforts addressing key challenges to the development of education in the Region. Another critical feature of this process is that it is prospective in the sense that it reflects on the past in order to improve the future development of education in SSA. The long-term aim of this *Review* is to institutionalize, within Ministries of Education, critical reflection as a systematic way of learning from past experiences for present action. Collective reflection is emphasized as a mechanism for learning from each other's positive experiences. Capacity development is therefore an integral part of this exercise.

6.2   The most significant achievement of this *Review* would be its contribution to an enduring process of collective and critical reflection on strategies for the development of national education systems. So far, the collective nature of the reflection has gone through three iterations. The first was internal to the Ministry, the second was internal to participating countries, the third was sub-regional — East and Southern Africa, and then West and Central Africa — the fourth phase will be regional, with the ADEA Biennial as a forum. Future iterations will be determined at the Biennial meeting.

6.3   The reflection is introspective because it adopts a self-study approach in which the critical reflection is spearheaded by the implementers of programs being studied. From the very conception of this Review, a strategic choice was made that the process should be led by Ministries of Education. Ministerial leadership was preferred for two reasons: first, because Ministries of Education posses the institutional memory that is vital to the exposition of processes and factors that facilitate successes; second, because the Ministries' leadership improves the chances that the reflective process will be sustained.

6.4   Relative to previous reviews of education, a unique feature of this exercise is its emphasis on process as a means, and as a key result. Process is emphasized because its understanding produces critical lessons on why we "go right" or why we "go wrong". One concern addressed by this exercise is that, while an understanding of process is instructive, process is hardly ever systematically documented. Because of this, valuable lessons are lost to those without first-hand experience of the interventions. Institutional memory is continuously eroded as people who have it move around. Over time, this erosion amounts to missed opportunities for building on experiences and moving forward developmentally. Time and resources are consequently, and continuously, lost to reinventing the wheel.

What did it take to come this far?

6.5   The process that we have followed to reach this stage can be summarized in ten steps. **First**, each of the 25 countries that elected to participate in the *Review* identified an intervention or interventions which they deemed successful or promising of success. The identification of promising or successful interventions was led by

Ministry experts and done in consultation with the larger national education community. The degree of consultation varied across the countries. In some countries — albeit few — the identification of successful interventions was limited to Ministry technocrats. Educationists outside the Ministry of Education were not involved in the actual review of the intervention until much later.

6.6 The degree of collective participation among Ministry officials and other experts within a country depended on the degree of support and involvement among the Ministries' top echelons. In countries where this exercise met the personal interest and support of high officials, the degree of collective reflection was much higher. Time is another factor that may have limited collective participation. In most of the participating countries, it took a long time for the process to get off the ground, which meant that those country teams were rushed to get their case studies prepared.

6.7 Within contexts like those of Ministries of Education where there are innumerable challenges and successes, identifying what collective opinion deems "a major" breakthrough is by no means easy. Country teams acknowledged that the selection process was quite difficult. Their success in identifying successes depended heavily on the collective participation of those associated with the challenges and achievements being reported. The collective participation, especially of Ministry officials was fundamental to the collective, critical and introspective reflection that this exercise was intended to stimulate.

6.8 The analyses presented above and the lessons drawn are specific to the to interventions presented in the *Review.* The successes presented above are not generalizable to the countries' education systems, which may not be faring as well as specific interventions.

6.9 **Second**, the whole process of this Review required the participating countries to focus on success within contexts where the norm has been to dwell upon failures and crises. Again, the country teams found this a complex but welcome challenge. The process was admittedly complicated by the reality that any success had to overcome several challenges along the way. Keeping the focus on success did not require the denial of these challenges but, rather, the highlighting of strategies that were used to overcome them. In the end, all parties agreed that the valuable lessons from each country's experiences derive from these strategies. In a way, therefore, the key lessons are drawn from how potential failures were aborted rather than how success was recorded!

6.10 **Third**, having identified successful interventions, the next critical step was the provision of concrete evidence of that success. The evidence served a dual purpose. It served to convince oneself that, indeed, the intervention was successful enough to warrant sharing, and also to convince others that it was worth noting. Some countries fell out of the process because they could not convince themselves that there was a success worthy of sharing. While these countries may seem like lost participants, they are not; they gained in the sense that, the exercise caused them to reflect on, and recant, what they had initially assumed a success. As far as the key aim of this exercise is concerned, critical introspective reflection did occur. It is pleasing to note that these countries indicated their intention to go back and conduct an in-depth analysis of those interventions.

6.11   Even for countries that participated in the exercise, the provision of concrete and consistent evidence has been, by far, the most problematic aspect of the exercise. Evidence on improvement of quality and capacities was more difficult to provide than evidence for access. In some cases, there was clear divergence between the views of country teams and the views of the *Review*'s technical team on what constitutes evidence. Hopefully, part of the success of this process was increased agreement as to what constitutes evidence. The difficulties experienced in trying to document evidence points to the weakness in monitoring and evaluating the impact of interventions, most of which are fairly substantial in terms of costs, time, and expertise.

6.12   Owing to inadequate monitoring and evaluation, what was presented as evidence was sometimes just a "gut feeling" that interventions were successes. For most of the participating countries, the *Review* provided an opportunity to reflect on these impressions and to verify whether they could be substantiated by real evidence. It provided an opportunity to go back in time and evaluate the impact of the interventions, some of which have straddled decades. Unfortunately, much of the effort made by the country teams went to the reconstruction of evidence, leaving precious little time for analysis of the mechanisms that led to success.

6.13   **Fourth**, beyond providing of evidence, country teams were asked to analyze factors and processes that facilitated the stated achievements. This aspect of the exercise required a disciplined and skillful focus on explaining things of a very specific and narrow nature through use of a broad scope of explanatory factors, including the the country's macro-economic situation, shifts in political leadership, social views towards education, etc.

6.14   The process also required a disciplined focus on explaining an achievement and resisting the temptation to resort to the usual explanations for that achievement — something which could easily derail the focus of the papers. Emphasis was therefore placed on the need to identify the relationship between context and the achievement being reported.

6.15   By demanding a focus on processes and factors that led to success, the *Review* raised awareness of the degree to which successful processes are taken for granted, and how costly this has been. Several country teams admitted that they had never really sat back and reflected on how they managed to effect what they accomplished. For the first time, they noted, they were forced to explain both to themselves and to someone else what exactly produced their successes. The reactions to this process a mix of appreciation and lamentation. Appreciation resulted because the process helped country teams to recognize the sources of their strengths, their weakness and their potential for improvement. We would dare say that this has been a process of "getting to know oneself" — i.e., introspection. Lamentation resulted because country teams wished they had better recorded the details of interventions processes as they unfolded.   This led to the two remarks/questions that were raised in the regional seminars: "How often are we going to be doing this?" and "If we could know how often we would be doing this, could we be better prepared and could we more effectively share our experiences?"

6.16 These two remarks two are as encouraging as they are disturbing. The first is encouraging because it suggests the emergence of a realization that critical reflection and systematic sharing of experiences can not be a one-shot affair. The second is disturbing because it can be interpreted as suggesting that if "we" are not mobilized to record and share our experiences again, we might slip back into the habit of not recording what we do best and how we do it. The critical question is how do we keep this process going and how do we mainstream it?

6.17 **Fifth**, the combined demand for evidence and explanatory factors evoked the need for a rich institutional memory which remains largely undocumented. The reconstruction of this memory has had to rely, literally, on the memories of actors who have been closely associated with the intervention under review. The success with which the country teams could outline process and provide evidence depended on the piecing together of individual memories into a coherent history of the intervention. Country teams were therefore required to adopt a historical perspective within a context of poorly recorded experience. In some countries this required some form of fieldwork, for which the teams lacked time. By necessity, therefore, the *Review* has been a collective process.

6.18 **Sixth**, isolating and analyzing contextual factors that had a bearing on an achievement were critical in situating reported success. Country teams were explicitly requested to make apparent the contextual factors that facilitated their successes. They were requested not only to make the context apparent, but to let it seep through the reported experiences. Country reports had to be contextually grounded. This was critical in order to understand what factors need to be in place for the intervention to succeed.

6.19 The process consciously avoided creating the impression that there are generic solutions to problems facing education systems in the region. This avoidance was critical, even though this *Review* is based on the idea that educational progress in one country will be facilitated by knowledge and understanding of what has worked in other countries.

6.20 **Seventh**, in presenting their evidence, country teams were required to adopt a practical orientation and a focus on real experiences, not intentions. They were requested not to discuss policies yet to be implemented or grand plans, rather to discuss policies that are being implemented or have been implemented and are having real impact.

6.21 **Eighth,** these practical experiences had to be presented against the backdrop of three concepts whose meanings and understandings are far from consensual: *access*, *quality* and *capacity development*. Although use of these concepts helped focus the exercise, it also provided a bit of confusion. For instance, in one context, the building of classrooms aimed at expanding the capacity of the education system to accommodate more learners — this was seen as a strategy to expand access. In another, it may have aimed to facilitate the adoption of certain instructional and learning approaches which are particularly difficult to institute when learners are taught in open air; this is more a matter quality. The reality is even more complex in that whatever the intentions, in any given situation, classroom construction is linked to

the expansion of access, the improvement of quality and the enhancement of organizational and institutional capacities.

6.22   The analytical process that country teams had to engage in, therefore, was fairly sophisticated and demanding. The analysis required the ability of country teams to recognize and highlight context-specific means/ends relationships. For instance, Botswana reported as its success the development of human resources for the education sector. In this context, the development of human resources is an end. For Botswana, therefore, the number of people trained is seen as sufficient evidence. For Lesotho, the development of human resources was a means to improving education quality. Unless Lesotho defines education quality strictly in terms of resource inputs, the number of teachers trained is not adequate evidence. Further evidence on the impact of those teachers on student learning or quality of instruction may be necessary.

6.23   **Ninth**, the review process required the country teams to play the role of pedagogues. The whole point of this exercise is to learn from one another. The *Review* is essentially about developing capacities using resources from within the region. Each country team had to lay bare its path to success. It had to demonstrate how doable an achievement is.

6.24   **Tenth**, the pedagogical role of the *Review* required country teams to derive theory form practice, so to speak. Having followed a contextually grounded and practical approach all along, the teams were required to step out of their contexts and isolate what is generalizable. They had to draw applicable lessons from their experiences and extract those elements that are transferable to other contexts.

Why this process?

6.25   To reiterate the purposes articulated at the beginning of this report, there are several reasons for this process: to contribute to the institutionalization of critical reflection and to the systematic learning from prior experiences; to bring to the fore and make known Africa's promising and successful responses to challenges facing education in the region; to facilitate intra-Africa exchange of positive experiences and constructive learning from those experiences; to place the responsibility for the analysis of Africa's education systems in the hands of those who manage those systems; and to orient partnerships like the ADEA and others, to look toward Africa for promising solutions to problems facing education systems in the region. This process is about strengthening partnerships.

What next?

6.26   The Biennial is asked to reflect on the future of this process. The *Prospective Stocktaking Review of Education in Sub-Saharan Africa* has been a collective process and has dictated a consultative approach. Thus far, several forums have provided opportunity for iteration: meetings of the ADEA Steering Committee; intra-ministry meetings; national seminars; and sub-regional seminars. The 1999 Biennial meeting provides a critical forum for Regional exchange and consultation and a means to provide critical inputs into both the process and product of this exercise.

6.27   Several questions come to mind. Has the aim to contribute to the mainstreaming of critical, collective and introspective reflection been accomplished? Is interest and technical know-how sufficiently stimulated for the process to become self-sustaining? If not, what next? What do we do about the problems and capacity gaps that have been identified? What do we do with promising interventions that have identified? How may we use the lessons we have learned? We should also bear in mind that, once taken to scale, innovations become conventions. How then do we keep disseminating cutting-edge interventions and innovations? What may be the role of the ADEA partnership?

i j i j i j i j i j i j i j i j

INDEX of countries and ADEA Working Groups

ANNEX 1: Overview of the case studies in three tables

- Table 1: Themes & topics by Participating Country and Sub-sector
- Table 2: Themes & topics by Participating Working Group
- Table 3: Themes & topics by Participating Countries and Working Groups

Table 1: Themes & topics by Participating Country and Sub-sector

COUNTRY	THEMES, TOPICS
1 BENIN	**Access & Quality**. (1) Promoting access for girls by (i) administrative measures and community partnerships, (ii) affirmative action programs in zones with very low female enrollments. (2) Integrated schools to promote schooling for handicapped children. (3) Fundamental quality school program and development of new curricula.
2 BOTSWANA	**Capacity building:** The study takes stock of national effort to respond to the shortage of trained teachers for basic education. Both successful and problematic experiences are analyzed in order to draw lessons for future planning.
3 BURKINA FASO	**Access & Quality**. (1) 8 strategies or innovations being used to improve both access and quality. (2) Pedagogical innovations for teacher training, curriculum development, active teaching methods and textbooks. (3) Non-formal education for adult literacy and improved access to basic education.
4 BURUNDI	**Access. Communal Secondary Schools.** The study examines the impact on access of a new type of secondary school in Burundi that significantly differs from the state-run schools in its admission requirements, financing and management.
5 CAMEROON	**Access & Quality.** (1) A program for teaching methods for large groups that includes teacher training and deployment policies. (2) Training and deployment of non civil service teachers.
6 COTE D'IVOIRE	**Access, Quality & Capacity building.** (1) Monitoring of Access for Quality Improvement: a project set up by the MoE in 1994 to restore quality and equity in the public schools through a computer-based management information system of recruitment and monitoring of students will be described and analyzed; (2) Community-based, experimental, schools implementing new curricula. (3) Textbook lending program in primary and secondary schools.
7 EQUATORIAL GUINEA	**Access & Quality.** The study focuses on the implementation of an early childhood development policy.
8 GAMBIA	**Access.** Strategies used to improve access through : (i) community mobilization in school mapping, (ii) community participation in the management of schools and (iii) double shift teaching in urban and suburban areas.
9 GUINEA	**Access & quality**. Four Innovative Experiences in Rural Areas: This study focuses on (i) multi-grade classes, (ii) training and employment of teachers' trainers, (iii) "Nafa" centres or second-chance schools, (iv) programme for small school grants.
10 LESOTHO	**Access & Quality**. Two experiences are reported on: **A Case Study of the Education Facilities Unit**: The study looks at the achievements of a project initiated in 1974 by the government of Lesotho to address the lack of basic school infrastructure and facilities in the country (such as classroom, furniture, laboratory equipment, etc) that undermined the quality of education. It describes the strategies used to achieve the goals and objectives that were set out and present the constraints encountered. **A Case Study of Primary In-Service Education Program (PIEP)**: the study examines the impact on the quality of education of the PIEP which was designed to provided support to untrained and under-qualified teachers.

COUNTRY	THEMES, TOPICS
11 LIBERIA	**Ensuring Access to Primary and Secondary Education under National Conflict Situation**: the Liberian case documents how, despite the constraints of a civil war, the state was able to sustain a certain level of access to and quality of education.
12 MADAGASCAR	**Access, Quality & Institutional Capacity Development**. The study by the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education focuses on an innovation called "local program-contract" which brings all the stakeholders around the school to sign a contract with the state that binds them to fully participate in the improvement of access and quality. **Vocational and Technical Education**: The study by the Ministry of Technical Education and Vocational Training documents an experiment on partnership building between technical institutes and private companies.
13 MALI	**Access & Quality**. (1) The experience of community schools to improve access in grade one; (2) To improve quality, the "convergent pedagogy" for teaching national languages and French.
14 NAMIBIA	**Access, Equity, Quality, Democracy & Institutional Capacity Development: Educational Reform in Namibia**. The study documents experience in transforming an Apartheid-structured educational system into a democratic, non-racial and efficient system. It looks at three aspects of the reform: curriculum, examination, and collection and publication of statistical data.
15 NIGER	**Access & Quality**. The study documents a bilingual (national language & French) pilot program conceived to redress the poor results of the traditional French-language curriculum.
16 NIGERIA	**Access.** The study focuses on the outcomes of strategies devised to increase access to basic education for nomadic communities.
17 SENEGAL	**Access:** (1) Recruitment of volunteer teachers; (2) Improved access and retention of girls; (3) Community schools. **Quality:** (1) Development of a new curriculum; (2) Improving school effectiveness and assessment of school effectiveness; (3) Development of a textbook policy **Capacity building**: (1) Devolution to, and responsibilization of, concerned actors involved in literacy programs, community schools and early childhood education; (2) Teacher training programs.
18 SEYCHELLES	**Access & Quality:** The study documents the policies and strategies used to achieve universal basic education for all, including early childhood education which is part of the education system.
19 SOUTH AFRICA	**Access to Higher Education**: The study highlights the policies and strategies used to bring about a transformation in higher education in terms of access, quality and capacity building. It does so by looking at specific initiatives/policies enacted by the universities and the state.
20 TANZANIA	**Access:** The study documents: (i) innovations and policies geared at increasing access to secondary education through community participation and implementation of non-formal programs; (ii) privatizing education and training; and (iii) providing incentives for increased participation of girls in secondary education.
21 TCHAD	**Access & Quality:** This case study presents innovations and strategies being carried out to address the issues of access, quality and relevance. The study focuses on: (i) school meals in areas that are drought-stricken or experience chronic food shortages; (ii) girls enrollments; (iii) mobilization of non-civil service teachers; and (iv) community participation.
22 TOGO	**Access:** Improved access for girls. **Quality:** (1) Books procurement strategies for secondary schools.; (2) Technical/vocational training program. **Capacity Building:** (1) Professional and career management of the newly-recruited "auxiliary" teachers; (2) Training parents for improved school management.

COUNTRY	THEMES, TOPICS
23 UGANDA	**Access & Quality: Prospects and Challenges of UPE**: The study examines policies and experiences aimed at (i) expanding access through community participation in school management; (ii) improving quality through curriculum reform and teacher training and; (iii) building institutional capacity. In so doing, it will describe and analyze the constraints and challenges that achieving UPE entails.
24 ZANZIBAR	**Access to Early Childhood & Basic Education:** The study focuses on the policies and strategies used to expand access to Early Childhood & Basic Education. It highlights the important roles that communities and NGOs, including Islamic organizations, can play in supporting Government policies.
25 ZIMBABWE	**Access & Quality:** The study focuses on: (i) innovative experiences to improve the relevance of, and access to, quality vocational education & training for disadvantaged groups (women, school leavers, ex-independence war combatants, etc) in suburban areas and rural communities; and (ii) a program to promote cost-effective science teaching in secondary schools.

Table 2: Themes & topics by Participating Working Group

WORKING GROUP	THEME(S), TOPIC(S)
1 BOOKS & LEARNING MATERIALS	**Cost-effective strategies for textbook provision**. The study reviews the extensive research done by this WG that cover all aspects of the book chain related to education. Attention is paid to the development of local book industries.
2 FEMALE PARTICIPATION (FAWE)	**Strategies and Interventions that have Improved the Status of Girls' Education.** The study examines successful experiences in terms of access, quality, and capacity building in 8 African countries (Burkina Faso, Ethiopia, Ghana, Kenya, Mali, Sierra Leone, Tanzania and Uganda).
3 HIGHER EDUCATION	**1) Institutional Strategic Planning and Reform Experiences at Eduardo Mondlane University in Mozambique during the 1990's** : The study analyzes the aspirations and accomplishments of a single African university, Universidade Eduardo Mondlane in Mozambique, in its efforts during the 1990s to carry out strategic institutional reforms intended to expand access to higher education, to improve the quality of university teaching and research, and to strengthen its capacities for institutional planning, program implementation, performance monitoring, and output evaluation. **2) University Science, Humanities and Engineering Partnerships in Africa (USHEPiA): A Case Study of Regional Cooperation in Graduate Training**: The study (i) examines why the USHEPiA initiative was undertaken and what it is expected to achieve; (ii) describe accomplishments to date in meeting USHEPiA'a goals and expectations; and (iii) draws lessons learned and identifies examples of good practice from the USHEPiA experience that appear to offer useful guidance to other African higher education institutions wishing to undertake similar regional cooperation initiatives. **3**) **Analysis of the Goals, Process and Impact of Higher Education Reforms in Cameroon**. The study examines the policies introduced by the government of Cameroon to address the crisis in tertiary education.
4 NON-FORMAL EDUCATION	
5 SECTOR ANALYSIS	**Partnerships Between Ministries of Education and International Funding And Technical Assistance Agencies in Education Sector Development Programs** : The study documents three cases of these partnerships from Burkina Faso, Ghana, and Mozambique and draw lessons.
6 TEACHING PROFESSION (Anglophone)	**A Case Study of Performance and Emerging Issues**: The study describes and analyses achievements/dividends accruing to the TMS activities of the WGTP and participating countries. The study focuses on identifying a range of TMS activities which have performed well, and analyzing how and why certain activities have worked well.
7 TEACHING PROFESSION (Francophone)	**The impact of the WGTP (Francophone) on the implementation of Teacher Management Policies in Francophone African countries**: The study focuses on (i) the implementation of alternative recruitment policies and (ii) the development of capacities for improving both access and quality.

Table 3: Themes & topics by Participating Countries and Working Groups*

TOPIC	COUNTRY	WORKING GROUP
ACCESS		
' Community/school partnerships	Benin, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Madagascar, Mali, Nigeria, Senegal, Tanzania, Tchad, Uganda, Zanzibar, Zimbabwe	
' Double-shift & multi-grade classes	Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Guinea	
' Early childhood education	Equatorial Guinea, Seychelles, Zanzibar	
' Education for disadvantaged groups (nomads, handicapped)	Côte d'Ivoire, Mali, Nigeria	
' Education under or after conflict situations	Liberia	
' Female participation	Benin, Côte d'Ivoire, Tanzania, Tchad, Zambia, Zanzibar	Female Participation/FAWE)
' Higher education	South Africa	
' Non-formal education	Nigeria, Tanzania	
' School infrastructure and facilities	Lesotho	
' School meals	Tchad	
QUALITY, RELEVANCE and CURRICULUM & INSTRUCTION		
' Curriculum reform & assessment	Benin, Namibia, Uganda	
' Improving teacher quality	Lesotho, Seychelles	
' Innovative teaching techniques	Cameroon, Niger, Uganda	
' Instructional materials	Zimbabwe	
' Mother tongue education	Mali, Niger	
' New modes of delivery	South Africa	
' Upgrading substitute & untrained teach-ers	Cameroon, Lesotho, Tchad	
' Vocational/technical education	Madagascar, Zimbabwe	
CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT and MANAGEMENT		
' Education planning, management, information systems & school mapping	Côte d'Ivoire, Namibia, South Africa	Higher Education (Mozambique), Teaching Profession
' Higher Education reform		Higher Education (Cameroon)
' Human resource development	Botswana, Guinea	Teaching Profession (Anglophone & Francophone)
' Institutional capacity building	Botswana, Namibia, South Africa, Uganda	
' Partnerships between ministries & agencies for sustained, ministry-led coordination		Sector Analysis (in Burkina Faso, Ghana, Mozambique)
' Regional partnerships	South Africa	Higher Education (East & Southern Africa)

* **NOTE:** The table indicates all the topics and sub-themes explored by the case studies. Not all are reported in the text, nor are they all categorized in the text as in this table.

ANNEX 2: Bibliography of the case studies

Country case studies

Country	Author(s) / Coordinator(s)	Title
Benin	P.Gbenou, A.Gnimadi, G.Odjo, G. Orou Bagou, T. Tchitchi	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: Cas du Bénin
Botswana	F.M. Leburu-Sianga & E. Molobe	Capacity Building: a focus on Human resource Development in the Education Sector
Burkina Faso	A. G. Coulibaly, A. Badini, L. Kabore, K. Korsaga, K. Kinaba, E. Tiemtore, S. Ilboudou, & B. Zongo	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: Cas du Burkina Faso
Burundi	A. Barutwano, O. Bazikamwe, Nathan Kana	L'expérience des collèges Communaux au Burundi
Cameroon	Y.Yaya, E. Kenne, JP.Elogou, D.Mbouda, SP. Fouda	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: Cas du Cameroun
Côte d'Ivoire	A. Nebout, A. Yao, E.Etty, T. Toure	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: Cas de la Côte d'Ivoire
Equatorial Guinea	S.B. Mangue, E.N. Ovono, J. N. Owono	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: expérience Préscolaire "Non Formelle"
Gambia	M. Jallow, B, Bouy	Prospective, Stocktaking Review of Education in Africa: Gambia Case Study
Guinea	A. Conde, M. A. Sow	Le Redéploiement des enseignants en Guinée
	I. Bah-Lalya	Quatre expériences innovatrices en zones rurales
Lesotho	A. Mothibeki, M. Nyathi, M. Nchee	Programme Success and Management of Primary In-Service Education Programme (PIEP) and provision of Education Physical Facilities
Liberia	S. M. Getaweh, S. Naame, S. Jubwe, E. Liberty, E. Lumei, B. Sumo, W. S. Salifu, F. Gbegbe, P. Ben, G. Saydee, D.E.S. Kandakai, I. Roland, J. I. Nwankwo	Liberia Country Case Study
Madagascar	M. Tilahimena, S. Andrianalizandry, V. Rakotonirainy, M. Randriamahazomanana, J. Ranarison, G. Gniarck, A. Radimbison, j. Rapela, Rabetahina, P. Rabetahina, Rabeantoandro, L. Rakotosolofoarisoa, F. Razafindradama, B. Tanjaka, T. Razafindramary	Le contrat-programme Etat/ École-communauté locale, une innovation réussie-cas de Madagascar
	B. Zoana	La formation professionnelle qualifiante à Madagascar

Country	Author(s) / Coordinator(s)	Title
Mali	P. Tamboura, M.M. Konaté	• Le défi de l'accès à l'éducation : l'expérience des écoles communautaires • Le défi de la qualité de l'éducation : l'expérience de la pédagogie convergente de l'enseignement des langues nationales et du français
Namibia	I.F.J. VD Merwe	Establishment of a National Examination and Assessment System for School Examinations in Namibia
	J. Alberts	ADEA Review: Curriculum Development in Namibia
	F.G.G. Voigts	Development of an Education Management Information System (EMIS) in Namibia
Niger	A. Hamidou, K. Bondabou, S. Bagnou, M. Amadou, C. May, B. Seybou, A. Mijinguini, M. Moussa, I. Yahouza, D. Ali, M.S. Gambo	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: Cas du Niger
Nigeria	T. Guidado, S.A.B. Atolagbe, U. Aji, A. Adamu, D. Onugha, U.Y. Ismaila, E.C.C. Uzodinma, P. Elumeze	Access to Basic Education: A focus on Nomadic Populations of Nigeria
Sénégal	A.. Diagne, M. Faye,Y. Diatta, M. Mbenge, B. Diao, E. Ngom, P.M.Fall, F. Diop, M. B. Samb	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: Treize Études de Cas au Sénégal
Seychelles	J. Belmont, J. Valentin	ADEA Stocktaking Review: The Major Development of Education in Seychelles
South Africa	Hanlie Griesel	Access and the Higher Education Sector: A South African Case Study on Policy and Programme Achievement
Tanzania	Nesta V. Sekwao (coordinator)	Prospective, Stocktaking Review of Education in Africa: Tanzania Mainland Report
Tchad	A. Ahmat, B. Wefou, M. Doromon, G.S. Malato, I. Ngarmarde, T. Lairez, N. Alndingalaouel, T. Le-Ndotar, Y. Adam	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: Cas des expériences et actions réussies dans le système éducatif du Tchad
Togo	A. Ayassor, L. Nambath, J. Agounke	Étude Prospective/Bilan de l'Education en Afrique: contribution du Togo
Uganda	F. Malinga, J. Carasco, Byamigisah	The Ugandan Experience of Universal Primary Education (UPE)
Zanzibar	A. Y. Mzee, M.O. Ali, B. Theneyan, H.O. Faki, M. Mbarouk, A. Mwalimu	Prospective, Stocktaking Review of Education in Africa: the Zanzibar Case Study
Zimbabwe	P.P. Pfukani and E.M. Chitare	The Zimbabwe Secondary School Science Project

Country	Author(s) / Coordinator(s)	Title
	M. Mambo	The Informal Sector Training and Resource Network (ISTARN) Project

Working Group case studies

Working Group	Author(s)	Title
Books & Learning Materials		Book Sector Development in Africa 1996-1999: The ADEA Books & Learning Materials Working Group Contribution
Female Participation (FAWE)	M. J. Possi	A Consultancy Report on: Kenya Bursary Scheme; Tuseme Project — Tanzania; Pre-entry science program for girls in Tanzania; ACFODE, Uganda; Ethiopia Strategic Resource Planning
	E. Annan-Yao	Report of the FAWE consultancy for ADEA's Prospective Stocktaking Review of Education in Africa: Burkina Faso, Ghana, Guinea, Sierra Leone
Higher Education	P. Fry & R. Utui	Promoting Access, Quality and Capacity-Building in African Higher Education: The strategic planning experience at the Eduardo Mondlane University
	D.L. Njeuma, H.N. Endeley, F.F. Mbuntum, N. Lyonga, D.L. Nkweteyim, S. Musenja, & E. Ekanje	Reforming a National System of Higher Education: The case of Cameroon
	M. West & L. Shackleton	USHEPiA: Building a Research Capacity Network in Africa
Non-formal Education		
Sector Analysis	L. Buchert	Partnerships between Ministries of Education and International Funding and Technical Assistance Agencies in Education Sector Development Programmes: Lessons from Burkina Faso, Ghana and Mozambique
Teaching Profession (Anglophone)	H. Kaluba	Working Group on the Teaching Profession, Teacher Management & Support: Analysis of major achievements
Teaching Profession (Francophone)	P. Dogoh-Bibi, A. Condé, J. K. Agounke, H..M.. Zebango	Impact du GTPE/SF sur la mise en oeuvre des politiques de gestion du personnel enseignant dans les pays francophones